

RES JUDICATA

RES JUDICATA

A HANDBOOK ON ITS THEORY, DOCTRINE, AND PRACTICE

Robert C. Casad

John H. and John M. Kane Professor of Law Emeritus
University of Kansas

Kevin M. Clermont

Flanagan Professor of Law
Cornell University

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2001
Robert C. Casad and Kevin M. Clermont
All rights reserved.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Casad, Robert C.

Res judicata : a handbook on its theory, doctrine, and practice /
Robert C. Casad, Kevin M. Clermont.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-89089-705-0

1. Res judicata-United States. I. Clermont, Kevin M. II. Title.

KF8992.C28 2001

347.73'77--dc2l

00-069771

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
E-mail: cap@cap-press.com
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America.

SUMMARY OF CONTENT

PART I: THEORY

CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION TO RES JUDICATA	3
A.	Significance	3
B.	Sources	5
C.	Contexts	7
D.	Basics	8
E.	Terminology	9
CHAPTER 2	RELATED DOCTRINES	13
A.	Stare Decisis	13
B.	Law of the Case	16
C.	Former Adjudication as Evidence	17
D.	Former Recovery	18
E.	Equitable Estoppel	18
F.	Judicial Estoppel	18
G.	Election of Remedies	19
H.	Other Action Pending	21
I.	Double Jeopardy	22
CHAPTER 3	POLICIES UNDERLYING RULES AND EXCEPTIONS	29
A.	Res Judicata Rules	31
B.	Res Judicata Exceptions	36
C.	Summary	36
CHAPTER 4	JURISPRUDENCE OF RULES AND EXCEPTIONS	39
A.	Res Judicata Rules and Exceptions	40
B.	Claim and Issue Preclusion Doctrine	43

PART II: DOCTRINE

CHAPTER 5	PREREQUISITES FOR RES JUDICATA	49
A.	Validity	49
B.	Finality	50
CHAPTER 6	CLAIM PRECLUSION	61
A.	Requirements of Rule	61
B.	Exceptions to Rule	85
C.	Special Applications: Counterclaims	106
CHAPTER 7	ISSUE PRECLUSION	113
A.	Requirements of Rule	113
B.	Exceptions to Rule	129
C.	Special Applications: Multiple Determinations	143
CHAPTER 8	EFFECTS ON NONPARTIES	149
A.	Privies	149
B.	Strangers	165
CHAPTER 9	NONORDINARY JUDGMENTS	189
A.	Noncoercive Judgments	189
B.	Nonpersonal Judgments	192
C.	Noncivil Judgments	204
D.	Nonjudicial Proceedings	208
CHAPTER 10	NONDOMESTIC JUDGMENTS	211
A.	General Considerations	211
B.	Judgments of American Courts	213
C.	Judgments of Foreign Nations	226

PART III: PRACTICE

CHAPTER 11	INVOKING RES JUDICATA	237
A.	Raising	237
B.	Proving	242
CHAPTER 12	DEFEATING RES JUDICATA	247
A.	Methods of Attack	248
B.	Grounds for Attack	249
C.	Approaches to Attack's Methods and Grounds	256
CHAPTER 13	JURISDICTION TO DETERMINE JURISDICTION	263
A.	Status of This Subdoctrine	265

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

vii

B. Content of This Subdoctrine	266
C. Jurisdiction to Determine <i>No</i> Jurisdiction	271
D. A Final View of Validity and Finality	271
TABLE OF CASES	273
INDEX	277

CONTENTS

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS	v
PART I: THEORY	
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION TO RES JUDICATA	3
A. Significance	3
B. Sources	5
C. Contexts	7
D. Basics	8
E. Terminology	9
1. Claim Preclusion	11
2. Issue Preclusion	11
CHAPTER 2 RELATED DOCTRINES	13
A. Stare Decisis	13
B. Law of the Case	16
C. Former Adjudication as Evidence	17
D. Former Recovery	18
E. Equitable Estoppel	18
F. Judicial Estoppel	18
G. Election of Remedies	19
H. Other Action Pending	21
I. Double Jeopardy	22
1. Collateral Estoppel from Criminal Judgment to Subsequent Criminal Prosecution of Same Defendant	24
a. Collateral Estoppel Asserted by Acquitted Defendant	24
b. Collateral Estoppel Asserted Against Convicted Defendant	25

2. Collateral Estoppel from Criminal Judgment to Subsequent Criminal Prosecution of Different Defendant	26
3. Collateral Estoppel from Civil Judgment to Subsequent Criminal Prosecution	27
CHAPTER 3 POLICIES UNDERLYING RULES AND EXCEPTIONS	29
A. Res Judicata Rules	31
1. Procedural Factors Favoring Preclusion	31
2. Procedural Factors Favoring Nonpreclusion	33
3. Combining All Factors	35
B. Res Judicata Exceptions	36
C. Summary	36
CHAPTER 4 JURISPRUDENCE OF RULES AND EXCEPTIONS	39
A. Res Judicata Rules and Exceptions	40
B. Claim and Issue Preclusion Doctrine	43
PART II: DOCTRINE	
CHAPTER 5 PREREQUISITES FOR RES JUDICATA	49
A. Validity	49
B. Finality	50
1. Meanings of Finality	51
a. Claim Preclusion	51
b. Issue Preclusion	52
2. Complications of Finality	55
a. Effects of Reversal	55
b. Inconsistent Judgments	55
CHAPTER 6 CLAIM PRECLUSION	61
A. Requirements of Rule	61
1. Dimensions of Claim	62
a. Evolution of Transactional View	62
b. Application of Transactional View	69
2. Extinguishing Claim by Judgment	82
a. Merger	83
b. Bar	85
B. Exceptions to Rule	85
1. Adjudication Not on the Merits	85
a. Dismissal for Lack of Jurisdiction	87
b. Dismissal for Insufficiency of Complaint	87

c.	Dismissal for Prematurity in Bringing Action	91
d.	Dismissal for Statute of Frauds	92
e.	Dismissal for Statute of Limitations	93
f.	Summary Judgment	96
g.	Voluntary Dismissal	96
h.	Involuntary Dismissal	97
i.	Dismissal for Insufficiency of Evidence	98
j.	Summary	98
2.	Jurisdictional or Procedural Limitation	99
3.	Judicial Permission	100
4.	Party Agreement	102
5.	Generalized Exception	103
a.	Conflict with Substantive Policy	103
b.	Misrepresentation by Defendant	104
c.	Other Extraordinary Situations	105
C.	Special Applications: Counterclaims	106
1.	Interposition of Counterclaim	106
2.	Failure to Interpose Counterclaim	108
a.	Compulsory Counterclaim Statute or Rule	109
b.	Common-Law Compulsory Counterclaim	111
CHAPTER 7	ISSUE PRECLUSION	113
A.	Requirements of Rule	113
1.	Same Issue	114
a.	Dimensions of Issue	114
b.	Applications	121
2.	Actually Litigated and Determined	123
a.	Applications	125
b.	A Contrary View	126
3.	Essential to the Judgment	127
B.	Exceptions to Rule	129
1.	Certain Issues of Law	130
a.	Pure Questions of Law	130
b.	Inequitable Administration of Law	132
2.	Inferior Rendering Court	134
a.	Procedural Informality	134
b.	Jurisdictional Specialization	135
3.	Different Burden of Persuasion	138
4.	Inability to Appeal	138
5.	Unforeseeability	139
6.	Generalized Exception	141
a.	Lack of Full and Fair Opportunity	141

b.	Conflicting Substantive Policy	142
C.	Special Applications: Multiple Determinations	143
1.	Cumulative Determinations	143
2.	Ambiguous Determinations	143
3.	Alternative Determinations	145
CHAPTER 8	EFFECTS ON NONPARTIES	149
A.	Privies	149
1.	Substantive Privity	153
a.	Successive Interests	153
b.	Other Substantive Relationships of Decreasing Closeness	155
2.	Procedural Privity	159
a.	Actual Representation	159
b.	Other Procedural Relationships Based on Nonparty's Conduct	163
B.	Strangers	165
1.	Parties Treated as Strangers: No Binding Effect	165
a.	Nominal Parties	165
b.	Parties Under Incapacity	166
c.	Parties Litigating in Different Capacities	167
d.	Nonadverse Parties	167
2.	Strangers Treated as Parties: A Benefiting Effect	169
a.	Mutuality of Estoppel	169
b.	Nonmutual Estoppel	174
c.	Nonmutual Claim Preclusion	184
d.	Criticism of Modern Approach	184
CHAPTER 9	NONORDINARY JUDGMENTS	189
A.	Noncoercive Judgments	189
B.	Nonpersonal Judgments	192
1.	In Rem	193
a.	Pure In Rem	193
b.	Jurisdiction over Status	194
2.	Quasi In Rem	196
a.	Subtype One	196
b.	Subtype Two	198
C.	Noncivil Judgments	204
1.	Plea of Guilty	207
2.	Conviction as Evidence	207
3.	Plea of Nolo Contendere	208
D.	Nonjudicial Proceedings	208

1. Administrative Adjudications	208
2. Arbitration Awards	210
CHAPTER 10 NONDOMESTIC JUDGMENTS	211
A. General Considerations	211
1. Recognition	212
2. Enforcement	212
B. Judgments of American Courts	213
1. State Judgments	213
a. State—State	213
b. State—Federal	221
2. Federal Judgments	223
a. Federal—State	223
b. Federal—Federal	226
C. Judgments of Foreign Nations	226
1. Rules for Recognition and Enforcement	226
a. General Practices	226
b. Preclusion Specifics	228
c. Governing Law	229
2. Special Exceptions to Recognition and Enforcement	230
a. Reciprocity	230
b. Public Policy	231
3. Hague Treaty	232
PART III: PRACTICE	
CHAPTER 11 INVOKING RES JUDICATA	237
A. Raising	237
1. Timing	238
2. Method	238
a. Claim Preclusion	238
b. Issue Preclusion	240
B. Proving	242
1. Burden	242
2. Evidence	243
3. Decision	244
4. Review	245
CHAPTER 12 DEFEATING RES JUDICATA	247
A. Methods of Attack	248
1. Motion for Relief	248
2. Independent Suit	248

3. Defensive Attack	249
B. Grounds for Attack	249
1. Jurisdiction and Notice	250
a. Jurisdiction	250
b. Notice	251
c. Summary	252
2. Equitable Grounds	253
a. General	253
b. Fraud	254
C. Approaches to Attack's Methods and Grounds	256
1. Traditional, Rigid Approach	257
2. Ultramodern, Fluid Approach	258
3. Resolution	259
CHAPTER 13 JURISDICTION TO DETERMINE JURISDICTION	263
A. Status of This Subdoctrine	265
B. Content of This Subdoctrine	266
1. Territorial Jurisdiction and Adequate Notice	266
2. Subject-Matter Jurisdiction	268
C. Jurisdiction to Determine <i>No</i> Jurisdiction	271
D. A Final View of Validity and Finality	271
TABLE OF CASES	273
INDEX	277

RES JUDICATA

