North Carolina Torts
North Carolina Torts

SECOND EDITION

David A. Logan
Roger Williams University
Ralph R. Papitto
School of Law

Wayne A. Logan
William Mitchell
College of Law

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
To our students, who keep us learning.
Contents

Preface xix
Acknowledgments xxi

PART I THE BASIC NEGLIGENCE CAUSE OF ACTION 1

Chapter 1 Duty 3
1.10 Duty 5
1.20 Misfeasance and Nonfeasance 8
[1] Special Applications of the Misfeasance Rule 15
[a] Negligent Entrustment of Chattel 15
[b] “Negligent Entrustment” and Alcohol 19
[c] Spoliation of Evidence 22

Chapter 2 Duty Despite Nonfeasance: The Special Relationship Exceptions 25
2.10 Duty Despite Nonfeasance 27
2.20 Duty Because of a Special Relationship between the Plaintiff and the Defendant 27
2.30 Duty to Control Another for the Benefit of the Plaintiff 33

Chapter 3 No Duty Despite Misfeasance: Negligent Infliction of Emotional Distress and Negligent Infliction of Pure Economic Harm 39
3.10 No Duty Despite Misfeasance 41
3.20 Negligent Infliction of Emotional Distress 41
[1] The Early Cases 41
[3] Pre-Impact Fear of Dying 57
[4] Fear of Contracting Medical Condition 58
3.30 Negligent Infliction of Pure Economic Harm 59

Chapter 4 No Duty Because of the Defendant’s Status: Immunities 63
4.10 Recovery for Torts Committed by the Government 65
[a] The Discretionary Function Exception 70
[b] Intentional Tort Exception 72
[c] The Feres Doctrine 73
42 U.S.C. § 1983: Suing State and Local Governments and Their Agents for Civil Rights Violations 74
   [a] The §1983 Action in General 75
   [b] Suing Local Governments under §1983 80
   [c] Qualified Immunity for State Actors 82
   [d] Particular Subject Areas of § 1983 Litigation 85
      [i] Free Speech Rights 85
      [ii] Violations by Law Enforcement 87
      [iii] Prisoner Cases 90
      [iv] Failure to Protect 91
      [v] Failure to Train 94
      [vi] Other Constitutional Tort Claims 94
   [e] Absolute Immunity 95

The North Carolina Tort Claims Act: Suing the State Government and Its Agents 96
   [a] Suits against Government Officials and Employees 100
      [i] Officials 102
      [ii] Employees 103
   [b] Special Protections Afforded State Actors 103
      [i] State Provision of Defense to Employees 103
      [ii] State Provision of Insurance 104

Suing City and County Governments 104
   [a] Waiver of Immunity Because of Insurance or Participation in a “Risk Pool” 111
   [b] Punitive Damages 113

Persons Liable on Their Bond 114

Suing Local Boards of Education 114

Particular Immunities in North Carolina 115
   [a] Statutory Immunities 115
   [b] Common Law Absolute Immunity 115

4.20 Family Relationships 116
   [1] Children and Parents 116
   [2] Spouses 119

4.30 Charitable Institutions 120

Chapter 5 Limited Duty Because of the Defendant’s Status: The Liability of Landowners and Occupiers for Injuries on the Premises 123

5.10 Premises Liability 125
5.20 Persons on Land with Permission 126
5.30 Trespassers 140

Chapter 6 Breach of the Duty Owed 147

6.10 The Standard of Care 149
   [1] Lowering the Standard of Care 154
   [2] Raising the Standard of Care 157
6.20 Higher Levels of Culpability 158
6.30 Proof of Breach 161
   [1] The Judge/Jury Relationship 161
CONTENTS

[3] Violations of Legislative and Executive Enactments — Negligence Per Se 164

Chapter 7  Causation
7.10 Causation-Generally 177
7.20 Cause-in-Fact 179
   [1] Unidentifiable Cause 183
   [2] Unidentifiable Defendant 183
   [3] Evidentiary Challenges to Expert Testimony on Cause-in-Fact 185
7.30 Legal Cause 187
   [1] Unforeseeable Results 188
   [2] Intervening Acts 192
   [3] The "Rescue" Doctrine 197
   [5] "Subsequent Medical Malpractice" 198
   [6] "Eggshell Plaintiffs" 199
   [7] Plaintiff’s Unusual Reaction 201
   [8] Statutory Violations 201

Chapter 8  Damages
8.10 Introduction 205
8.20 Compensatory Damages 205
   [1] General and Special Damages 206
   [2] Pecuniary and Nonpecuniary Damages 207
      [a] Medical Expenses 207
      [b] Lost Wages and Loss of Capacity to Earn 208
      [c] Harm to Property 210
      [d] Pain and Suffering 211
      [e] Consortium 212
      [f] Hedonic Damages 213
      [g] Scars and Disfigurement 215
      [h] Permanent Injury 215
      [a] Stipulation 218
      [b] Witnesses 218
   [4] Special Pleading Requirements 218
   [5] Mitigation of Damages 218
   [7] Contribution and Indemnity 221
8.30 Nominal Damages 223
8.40 Punitive Damages 223
   [1] North Carolina Law 224
8.50 Statutory Penalties 236
8.60 Improper Damage Awards — Remittitur and Additur 237
8.70 Attorneys' Fees 240
Chapter 9  Defenses

9.10  Defenses
9.20  Contributory Negligence
   [1]  Last Clear Chance
   [2]  Imputed Contributory Negligence
9.30  Assumption of the Risk
9.40  Waiver and Release
9.50  Claim and Issue Preclusion
9.60  Time Bars: Statutes of Limitation and Repose

Chapter 10  Special Problems Associated with Suing Multiple Defendants

10.10  Joint Liability and Concert of Action
10.20  Joint Enterprises
10.30  Vicarious Liability
   [1]  Respondeat Superior
   [2]  Independent Contractors
   [4]  Damages

Part II  Negligence Law in Particular Contexts

Chapter 11  The Tort Liability of Professionals

11.10  Malpractice

Chapter 12  Medical Malpractice

12.10  When a Duty Attaches
   [1]  Federal Legislation Imposing a Duty to Treat
   [3]  Raising the Standard of Care
      [a]  Contractual Agreements
      [b]  Holding Oneself Out as a Specialist
   [4]  Lowering the Standard of Care
      [a]  Good Samaritan Statutes
      [b]  Contractual Agreements to Limit the Scope of Duty
   [5]  Specific Aspects of the Duty of Care
      [a]  The Duty Not To Abandon
      [b]  The Duty to Obtain Informed Consent
      [c]  Fiduciary Duties
      [d]  The Duty to Refrain from Sexual Misconduct
      [e]  Emotional Distress Claims
         [i]  “Wrongful Pregnancy” or “Wrongful Conception”
         [ii] “Wrongful Birth”
         [iii] “Wrongful Life”
      [f]  Economic Harm
   [6]  Beneficiaries of the Duty
   [7]  Hospital Liability
   [8]  Vicarious Liability
      [a]  Physician’s Liability for the Acts of Non-Employee Agents
      [b]  Hospital’s Liability for the Acts of Physician-Agents
Chapter 16  Products Liability 415

16.10 Introduction 417
16.20 The North Carolina Products Liability Act 418
16.30 Substantive Theories of Liability 421
   [1] The Uniform Commercial Code 421
      [a] Express Warranty 421
      [b] Implied Warranty of Merchantability 423
      [c] Implied Warranty of Fitness for a Particular Purpose 428
      [d] The “Lemon Law” 428
   [2] Tort Theories 428
      [a] Strict Liability 428
      [b] Negligence 428
      [c] “Alternative Design” 435
   [4] Specific Duties 440
      [a] Duty to Warn 440
      [b] Patent/Latent Defects 445
      [c] Crashworthiness 446
      [d] Used Goods 446
16.40 Cause-in-Fact 447
16.50 Legal Cause 451
16.60 Damages 455
16.70 Defenses 456
   [1] Defenses Based Upon the Plaintiff’s Use of the Product 456
   [2] Time Bars 460
   [3] Privity Requirements 463
   [4] Special Commercial Law Defenses 465
   [5] Preemption 466

Part III  Intentional Torts 471

Chapter 17  Intentional Torts 473

17.10 Introduction 475
17.20 Act and Intent 475
17.30 Extended Liability for Intentional Tortfeasors 478
17.40 Vicarious Liability 478
17.50 Consent and the Burden of Proof 479

Chapter 18  Assault and Battery 481

18.10 Introduction 483
18.20 Assault 483
   [1] Apprehension by the Victim 483
18.30 Battery 485
   [1] Harmful or Offensive Contact 486
   [2] Contact with the Plaintiff’s “Person” 488
18.40 Statute of Limitations 489
18.50 Assault and Battery Compared 489
Chapter 19  False Imprisonment and the Wrongful Use of Legal Proceedings 491

19.10 Introduction 493

19.20 False Imprisonment 493
   [1] Plaintiff Detained or Restrained against Her Will 494
   [2] Unprivileged or Unjustified Detention or Restraint 496
      [a] Non-governmental Actors 496
      [b] Peace Officers 497
      [c] Other Executive Agents 498
      [d] Judicial and Quasi-Judicial Officers 498
   [3] Damages 499
   [4] Statute of Limitations 499

19.30 Malicious Prosecution 499
   [1] Defendant Instituted an Earlier Proceeding 500
      [a] Criminal Proceedings 501
      [b] Civil Proceedings 501
   [2] The Underlying Proceeding Was Terminated in This Plaintiff’s Favor 502
   [3] The Underlying Proceeding Was Brought without Probable Cause 503
   [5] Damages 506
   [6] Vicarious Liability 507
   [7] Statute of Limitations 508
   [8] Immunity 508

19.40 Abuse of Process 508
   [1] Ulterior Purpose 509
   [2] Process That Was Not Proper in the Regular Prosecution of the Proceeding 509
   [3] Extended Liability 511
   [4] Damages 511
   [5] Statute of Limitations 511

19.50 Abuse of Process, Malicious Prosecution, and False Arrest Compared 512

Chapter 20  Marital Torts: Criminal Conversation and Alienation of Affections 515

20.10 Introduction 517

20.20 Criminal Conversation 518
   [1] Summary 518
   [2] Lawful Marriage 518
   [3] The Defendant Had Sexual Intercourse with the Plaintiff’s Spouse 519
   [4] Proof Requirements 520
   [5] Damages 520

20.30 Alienation of Affections 522
   [1] Summary 522
   [3] Defendant, without Privilege, Diminished or Destroyed the Affections of the Spouse 523
CONTENTS

[6] Defenses 575
  [a] Truth 575
  [b] Statute of Limitations 576
  [c] Privileges 576
    [i] Absolute Privileges 577
    [ii] Qualified or Conditional Privileges 579
    [iii] Special Privileges 582
[7] Failure to Plead with Particularity 585
[8] Joint Liability 585

23.30 The Constitutional Dimension 586
  [1] Introduction 586
  [6] Constitutional Damages Requirements 596

Chapter 24 The Right to Privacy and Related Issues 599
  24.10 Introduction 601
  24.20 False Light Invasion of Privacy 601
  24.30 Invasion of Privacy by Publicizing Embarrassing Private Facts 604
  24.40 Invasion of Privacy by Intrusion into Seclusion 607
  24.50 Invasion of Privacy by Appropriation of Another’s Name or Likeness 610
  24.60 Special Note on the Infliction of Emotional Distress, the Right of Privacy, and the First Amendment 611

PART V Tortious Injury to Economic Interests 615

Chapter 25 Common Law Business Torts 617
  25.10 Fraud 619
    [1] Elements 619
      [a] A False Representation or Concealment of a Material Fact 619
      [i] Whether a Representation Is Factual 620
      [ii] Whether a Factual Misrepresentation Is Material 622
      [b] Knowledge of Falsity 622
      [c] Intent to Deceive 623
      [d]Actual and Reasonable Reliance 624
      [i] Actual Reliance 624
      [ii] Reasonable Reliance 625
      [e] Damage to the Plaintiff 628
    [2] Liability for Nondisclosure 629
    [3] Special Pleading Requirements 630
  25.20 Constructive Fraud 631
  25.30 Negligent Misrepresentation 635
  25.40 Tortious Interference with Another’s Contract 640
    [1] Valid Contract 641
Chapter 28  “Strict Liability”: Injuries Caused by Nuisance, Trespass, Abnormally Dangerous Activities, and Animals

28.10 Nuisance
   [1] Introduction
   [2] Public vs. Private Nuisance
   [3] Nuisance Per Se vs. Per Accidens
   [4] Remedies
      [a] Statutory Bases of Recovery
      [b] Damages
      [c] Injunctive Relief
   [5] Defenses
   [6] Nuisances Created by Government

28.20 Trespass to Land
   [1] Introduction
   [2] Ownership or Possession
   [3] Intent
   [4] Causation
   [5] Remedies
   [6] Defenses
   [7] Statutory Bases for Trespass Actions

28.30 Trespass and Nuisance Compared

28.40 Abnormally Dangerous or Ultrahazardous Activities

28.50 Injuries Caused by Animals
   [1] Liability for Trespassing Domesticated Animals
   [2] Liability for Injuries Caused by Wild Animals
   [3] Liability for Personal Injuries Caused by Domesticated Animals

Chapter 29  Conversion and Trespass to Chattels

29.10 Conversion
   [1] Property Covered
   [4] Persons Liable
      [a] Bailees
      [b] Brokers
      [c] Sheriffs
      [d] Bona Fide Purchasers
      [e] Mortgagees
      [f] Landlords
      [g] Joint Tortfeasors
      [h] Successive Transferees
   [5] Demand for Return
   [6] Damages
Preface

This, the second edition of *North Carolina Torts*, maintains the same functional approach adopted in the predecessor volume, with emphasis on personal injury actions as well as those seeking recovery for damage to reputation, property, and business interests. Further, in an effort to illuminate the current contours of North Carolina law, and, perhaps as important, indicate where it might be headed, the discussion liberally draws upon case law from other jurisdictions and secondary sources. This in-depth coverage is especially evident in discussions of professional malpractice, products liability, defamation, and the evolving state and national movements toward tort reform. Moreover, as before, to better serve the needs of bench and bar we survey subjects of a statutory nature that frequently intersect with the traditional common law of torts, such as Section 1983, RICO, and Unfair Trade Practices, complex subjects that are otherwise explored in stand-alone treatises.

This second edition also maintains the organizational approach of its predecessor. Rather than commencing with intentional torts, the negligence cause of action serves as the starting point. This was done for two reasons. First, many of the principles associated with negligence, like causation, breach of duty, damages, and *respondeat superior*, are equally central to more specialized torts, like professional malpractice and products liability. Second, negligence-based claims by far predominate in tort litigation, are more costly to defend, and are more complex in their nature.

Since the publication of the first edition in 1996, tort law has experienced significant change, reflecting the influence of the dynamic range of social, economic, and political factors that have always affected torts. This new edition discusses the important judicial and legislative developments over the past seven years, including major changes in premises and governmental liability, as well as products liability and damages.

We are gratified over the positive reception given *North Carolina Torts* by the bench and bar and hope that this new edition will continue to serve as a valuable resource.

June 2003
David A. Logan
Wayne A. Logan
Acknowledgments

We wish to extend our thanks to a number of people who provided invaluable help in the preparation of this second edition of *North Carolina Torts*. For research assistance, we thank Abby Brown, Shaka Mitchell and Alex Ryan; for clerical and editorial expertise, Brenda Sargent and Meg Daniel; and for financial and logistic support Deans Robert Walsh (Wake Forest) and Harry Haynsworth (William Mitchell).