MENTAL HEALTH ASPECTS
OF CUSTODY LAW
Mental Health Aspects of Custody Law

National Interdisciplinary Colloquium on Child Custody Law

Andre P. Derdeyn, M.D.
Melvin J. Guyer, J.D., Ph.D.
Honorable George L. Jurow, Ph.D.
Alan M. Levy, M.D.
Alan Ravitz, M.D.
Gary N. Skoloff, Esq.
Alex Weintrob, M.D.
Robert J. Levy, J.D., General Editor

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
Copyright © 2005
Robert J. Levy
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Mental health aspects of custody law / edited by Robert J. Levy.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 1-59460-056-2 (alk. paper)

KF547.M46 2004
346.7301'73--dc22

2005007554

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America
To all those judges, lawyers and mental health professionals who strive endlessly to ease the pain of divorcing parents and enhance the healing of their children.
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Foreword</th>
<th>xvii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1 The Unique Qualities of Child Custody Litigation</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 The Litigants—Heat</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 The Anger-Hatred Spectrum</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Custody Decision Making: Bicycles and Ponies</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The Decision-Making Context</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Examining the Issues</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2 Doctrinal Standards Governing Custody Adjudication</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 In General</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Doctrinal Diversity</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The “Primary Caretaker” Doctrine</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 The &quot;Approximate The Time&quot; Doctrine</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 The “Friendly Parent” Doctrine</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Public Policy Choices</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 Doctrinal Standards Governing Custody Adjudication—Continued</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The Maternal Presumption</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 The Parental Presumption</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 The Unfitness Disqualification</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

3.5 Religion 41
3.6 Race 43
3.7 Mental Health 43
3.8 Prohibition Against Splitting Siblings 46
3.9 Gay and Lesbian Parents 47
3.10 Conclusion 48

Chapter 4 Principles of Joint Legal and Physical Custody 49
4.1 Gender Politics 49
4.2 The Emergence and Present Status of Joint Custody 50
4.3 Some Dynamics of Marital Failure 52
4.4 “Deconstructing” Joint Custody 54
4.5 The Literature on Joint Custody 56
4.6 Policy Choices 58
References 59

Chapter 5 Child Development Theory and Continuity 61
5.1 Introduction 61
5.2 The Continuing Evolution of Knowledge and Theory 62
5.3 The Principle of Continuity and Stability 65
Exploring and Applying the Principle 66
5.4 Attachment Theory in Court 67
5.5 Sensible Judicial Decision Making 71
5.6 Conclusion 71

Chapter 6 The Child’s Preference as to a Custodian 73
6.1 Introduction 73
6.2 The Legal Doctrine 74
6.3 The Policy Issue 76
6.4 Understanding the Meaning of a Child’s Preference 79
a. Loyalty Conflicts 80
b. Parental “Coaching” and Other Ways
   of Influencing Children’s Expressions of Preference 84
  c. Discovering the Child’s Preference 85
  6.4 Conclusion 87

Chapter 7  Domestic Violence 89
  7.1 Introduction 89
  7.2 Legal Doctrine 92
  7.3 Problems of Proof; Determining Credibility 94
  7.4 Judicial Management of the Issues 97
  7.5 Fashioning Judicial Remedies for Victims of Domestic Violence 98
  7.6 Addressing Dissent 101

Chapter 8  Sexual Abuse Allegations in Child Custody Cases 103
  8.1 Executive Summary 103
  8.2 The Issues 105
     a. Evidentiary 105
     b. Cultural/Personal Biases 106
     c. The Applicable Law 106
     d. Mental Health Perspectives 108
  8.3 Investigative and Evaluative Techniques 109
     a. Sexually Explicit Dolls 109
     b. “Syndromes” Related to Sexual Abuse 109
     c. Professional Society Guidelines/Practice Parameters 110
  8.4 Visitation and the Continuity of Relationships 110
  8.5 Some Consensus Proposals (For a Controversial Subject) 112
     a. Questions to Ask Mental Health Professionals 113
  8.6 Conclusion 114
  8.7 Additional Selected References 115

Chapter 9  Substance Abuse 117
  9.1 Introduction 117
9.2 Definitions 118
9.3 Substance Use 119
9.4 Substance Dependence 120
9.5 Substance Abuse 121
9.6 Differing Professional and Community Tolerance 121
9.7 The Disease Concept of Substance Dependence and Abuse 122
9.8 The Notion of Addictive Personality 122
9.9 Diagnosing Substance Abuse 122
9.10 Risks for Children 123
9.11 Treatment and Treatment Prospects 124
9.12 The Concept of Denial 124
9.13 Custody Claims by Substance Abusing Parents 125
9.14 Visitation for Substance Abusing and Dependent Parents 125
   a. The general course of the abuse and attempts at treatment 127
   b. The parent's acknowledgment of the problem 127
   c. The parent's awareness of the impact of substance abuse upon the child 127
   d. Effect of the parent's symptoms upon parenting abilities 127
   e. The role of the custodial parent 127
   f. Is the child likely to be exposed to physical danger? 128
   g. The age and developmental level of the child 128
   h. The abusing parent's direct impact on the child 128
   i. Has the child been "parentified"? 128
   j. The child's resilience 128
9.15 Conclusion 129

Chapter 10 General Principles of Visitation 131
10.1 What is Known 132
10.2 The Policy Controversies 133
10.3 The Legal Issues 137
   a. Scope and Timing 137
   b. Limitations and Exclusions 142
10.4 Conclusion 148
Appendix: Proposal for Talk by Judge to Litigants and Their Counsel During Settlement or Pretrial Conference of Visitation Litigation 148

Chapter 11 Visitation with Infants 151
Bibliography 163

Chapter 12 Visitation with Mentally Ill Parents 165
12.1 Introduction 165
12.2 Some General Principles Relevant to Custody as well as Visitation 166
12.3 Diagnosis of Mental Illness/Disorder 166
12.4 Use/Misuse of a Mental Disorder Diagnosis 168
12.5 Visitation 169
12.6 Appointment of a Mental Health Professional as an Evaluator 170
12.7 Forensic Evaluations—Factors Peculiar to the Parent and the Illness 171
12.8 Factors Related to the Impact of the Parental Disorder Upon the Child 175
12.9 Factors Related to the Role of the Custodial Parent 177
12.10 The Forensic Report 177
12.11 Optional Protections for Visitation 178
12.12 Case Examples—A Parent with Obsessive-Compulsive Disorder 178
12.13 A Parent with a Bipolar Disorder (Manic-Depressive Illness) 179
12.14 A Parent with Schizophrenia 180
12.15 A Parent with an Alleged Borderline Personality Disorder 181
12.16 Conclusion 182

Chapter 13 Grandparent and Third Party Visitation 183
13.1 Grandparents 183
a. A Very Summary Historical Review 183
xii  

**CONTENTS**

b. Legal Issues 185  
c. Mental Health Issues 186

13.2 Stepparents and Third Parties 189

**Chapter 14  Supervised Visitation** 193  
14.1 Introduction 193  
14.2 Establishing the Reason for Supervised Visitation 197  
14.3 Selecting a Supervisor 198  
14.4 Selecting Locations for Supervised Visitation 200  
14.5 Conclusion 201

**Chapter 15  Visitation with Dying Parents** 203  
15.1 Overview 203  
15.2 Legal Issues and Relevant Cases 203  
15.3 The Psychological Issues 205  
15.4 Recommendations 207  
Bibliography 208

**Chapter 16  Visitation with Incarcerated Parents** 211  
16.1 Introduction 211  
16.2 Legal Issues 211  
16.3 Psychological Considerations 214  
16.4 Termination of Inmates’ Parental Rights 217  
16.5 Conclusion 218  
Bibliography 218

**Chapter 17  Enforcing Visitation** 221  
17.1 Introduction 221  
17.2 Types of Violations 222  
17.3 Remedies 223  
a. Preventive Measures 223
Chapter 18 General Principles of Modification

18.1 Introduction 233
18.2 Evidence Issues 235
18.3 A Case Analysis 236
18.4 Legislative Models 238
18.5 Causes of Modification Motions 241
18.6 Modification as a Penalty
   a. Sexual Misconduct 245
   b. Visitation Obstruction 246
   c. False Allegations of Sexual Abuse 249

Chapter 19 Relocation of a Custodial Parent

19.1 Summary 251
19.2 The Issues 252
   a. The Social and Legal Context 252
   b. The Need for a Guiding Value Standard 256
   c. Reading Relocation Clauses 257
   d. Relevant and Impermissible Criteria 259
   e. Elements of The “Best Interests” Test 261
19.3 Doctrinal Trends 262
19.4 What is Known 266
19.5 Colloquium Recommendations 268

Chapter 20 Parenting Plans

20.1 Introduction 273
20.2 Doctrinal Development and Detail 274
20.3 Practice Issues 278
Chapter 21  Judicial Interviews  283

21.1  Introduction  283
21.2  The Legal Issues  284
21.3  Practical Considerations  286
21.4  Psychological Considerations  288
   Ages three to six: key concepts  289
   Ages seven to twelve: key concepts  290
   Ages 12 and up: key concepts  291
21.5  The Mechanics of Judicial Interviews  292
   a. Preparation  292
   b. Preliminary Statements  293
   c. Substantive Questions  295
21.5  Conclusion: Colloquium Proposals  298

Chapter 22  Protecting the Separate Interests of Children in Divorce Proceedings  299

Chapter 23  Psychological Testing  309

23.1  Introduction  309
24.2  Validity and Reliability  310
   a. Reliability  311
   b. Validity  311
   c. Intelligence Testing  313
   d. Objective and Projective Tests  317
24.3  Examining and Crossexamining Psychological Test Witnesses  319

Chapter 24  Court Ordered Custody Evaluations  321

24.1  Introduction  321
24.2  The Varieties of Evaluators  323
   a. The Requisite Skills  324
   b. Education and Training  325
c. Experience 330
d. Evaluating Evaluators for Competence 330

24.3 Appointment Criteria 332
a. “Generic” Custody Disputes 332
b. Visitation Conflicts 333

24.4 Evaluating Evaluations 334
a. In General 334
b. Form 334
c. Factual Accuracy 338
d. Evaluation Methods 339
e. Evaluation Criteria 342
f. Evaluation Criteria—Questions About Objectivity 343
g. Court Appointed “Independent” or Traditional “Adversarial” Testimony? 347

Chapter 25 Conclusion 351

Index 353
FOREWORD

This book is the result of an unusual collaboration and a series of meetings over more than five years, of an independent group of practicing and academic lawyers, mental health professionals, and judges. We designated ourselves a “National Interdisciplinary Colloquium on Custody Law”—in part, of course, because we liked the acronym “NICCL.” More crucially, we began the enterprise as a discussion group of professionals concerned about the quality of professional mental health consultations to practicing lawyers and their divorce clients and anxious to improve mental health advice to and testimony in family courts across the country. We decided to produce a book of commentary, analysis and advice after a couple of years of quarterly meetings (which were financially aided from sources listed below) only when we concluded that our collective judgments on legal issues and professional mental health styles could be useful to judges and those judgments could be brought to the attention of many judges without cost to them. Our periodic meetings over several years uncovered our policy disputes, distilled our perceptions of the issues and appropriate approaches (if not always solutions) to them, and approved the formal delineations of policy disagreements among us which are identified in several of the chapters.

Our task, and travel expenses to our meetings (available only to academic members of the Colloquium), were aided by generous contributions to the University of Minnesota Foundation by the following individuals and Foundations, listed alphabetically: American Psychiatric Foundation, Frederikson & Byron Foundation, Murray L. Galinson, Vance K. Opperman, Space Center Company Foundation, Johnny B. Good Foundation, Trillium, and the West Group. NICCL’s initial publication, designed as a desk book for judges, contained contributions from and the collective (or disputed) judgments of four practicing divorce lawyers, two judges who were exercising or had exercised divorce jurisdiction (one of them with a Ph.D. in Psychology), six child psychiatrists, a social worker, and an academic psychologist (also a member of the bar). One member of the original group died and one withdrew after making an important contribution to the original publication.
Foreword

The original volume was designed to aid judges in processing and deciding divorce-custody disputes; because the endeavor proved to be of great interest to practicing lawyers and the mental health professionals who advise lawyers, counsel divorcing parents and testify before judges, NICCL decided to prepare and publish this more inclusive volume for a broader audience. Several members of the original group—Elissa P. Benöck, M.D., Ellen J. Effron, Esquire, Raymond M. Lazar, Esquire, Herbert S. Sacks, M.D., and Barbara F. Nordhaus, M.S.W., L.C.S.W.—have not been able to join the deliberations and writing which produced this volume.

This document is the product, then, of a continuing discussion by judges, academic and practicing lawyers, and mental health professionals, about the legal and mental health aspects of custody law and practice. Our initial conclusion required little effort: a great many important and difficult divorce-custody legal and psychological issues have not been objectively and thoroughly explored in the literature—and in courtrooms—indeed, many of them have been the subjects of misleading and sometimes ignorant reports and testimony—and judges and children and their parents have been the losers. It is especially important that the issues be clarified and the ignorance dispelled to the extent possible because mental health expert advice and testimony have become common aspects of contested custody contests.1

The book has been designed to provide a sort of glossary—an objective description and analysis— of the underlying mental health aspects of legal issues, and mental health professionals’ concerns about how those issues are approached and resolved, in divorce-custody cases. We hoped, and we believe, that the book is truly interdisciplinary.

It should come as no surprise that from time to time our professional theories and views were not in agreement; and we have tried throughout the volume to reflect outright disagreements as well as shadings of our consensuses. Despite our effort to reach agreement or to report disagreements about every issue in every chapter, issues of “tone” and final editing judgment were left to the “General Editor.” This is not to say that we refuse to take individual responsibility for the positions we assert; rather, it is simply to advise readers that the book is a collective product, and like most collective products its language may unintentionally hide subtle variations of opinion among the product’s creators.

We know, of course, that we are addressing very disparate professionals among the groups (lawyers, judges, mental health professionals) likely to examine and make use of this book. Some judges are old hands, have decided matrimonial and child custody disputes for years, perhaps decades; some clinicians, new to the field, will pick up this book for the first time as a part of a “get acquainted” tour of the territory; some lawyers will seek the book’s help to address a particular judge or cross-examine a particular mental health professional witness. We believe that reviewing the first chapter, and using the rest of the book as a reference guide when the issues arise, will be of benefit to professionals of diverse experience with divorce issues. We are hoping that the chapters will help judges to review litigants’ briefs with additional knowledge and insight, and will aid lawyers to prepare or cross-examine expert witnesses with greater sophistication and personal comfort, perhaps even aid in isolating legal and mental health issues that their opponents in individual cases have failed to identify. We also hope that our analyses will help mental health professionals to testify with more modesty while predicting future individual and family behavior and with greater comfort as they face cross-examination. In short, we would like this book to be a compendium of careful analysis of divorce-custody related legal and mental health issues and to improve the performance of lawyers, mental health professionals and judges—all to the advantage of divorcing parents and their children. Throughout the book, we tried to emphasize insights about the law and its practice as we have acquired them from judges, practicing lawyers, and mental health professionals.

Significant contribution was made to Chapter 11, and to the authors’ consideration of the issues surrounding noncustodians’ visitation with infants, by Thomas Horner, Ph.D., a clinical psychologist in private practice and former Director of the Infancy and Early Childhood Clinic in the University of Michigan Department of Psychology and Psychiatry. The lengthy quoted section on which makes up a large part of the chapter, beginning at p. 158, is taken from Dr. Horner’s unpublished manuscript, “Infant-Parent Contact and Infant Custody: Developmental and Decision-Making Considerations.” In addition, valuable research was done for this volume by Jonathan Wolfe, Esquire and Karen Rose, Esquire, both members of the New Jersey Bar, and Aaron Marcus, Esquire, a 2004 graduate of the University of Minnesota Law School.

Robert J. Levy, General Editor
William L. Prosser Professor of Law Emeritus
University of Minnesota