TABLE OF CONTENTS

I V
V
XI
1
19
65
89
109
145
163
193
217
239
259
269
275
283
293
305
325
339

TEACHING TORTS • FOURTH EDITION

343
347
361
387
405
415
421

Preface

PREFACE TO THE FOURTH EDITION

Teaching Torts (4th ed. 2009) is the teacher's manual for Studies in American Tort Law (4th ed., 2009) (SATL), both of which are published by Carolina Academic Press. As a "guide" for torts professors, this book has decidedly modest objectives. It is intended to provide neither an exhaustive discussion of prominent theories of tort liability, nor an encyclopedic compilation of references. Rather, Teaching Torts seeks to assist torts teachers by assembling a useful mix of information relevant to tasks of recurring importance, including:

- allocation of course time;
- stimulation of classroom discussion;
- clarification of the existing rules of tort law and of the role that public policy plays in the formation, application, and reevaluation of those rules; and
- effective drafting of, and preparation of students for, examinations.

In my view, these tasks are an indispensable part of being a good law teacher. To be sure, wisdom and proficiency in teaching torts comes not from any teacher's manual, but from plain hard work: re-reading

TEACHING TORTS • FOURTH EDITION

cases before class; consulting treatises and articles; keeping abreast of judicial and legislative developments; thinking about how to teach well; and endeavoring to execute a sound plan each class period. I hope that this book helps to make some of that hard work easier for law professors.

The main part of *Teaching Torts* (Chapters 1 to 23) corresponds to the organization of SATL. For each chapter there is a set of introductory notes, followed by questions and comments relating to each of the principal cases. The notes suggest, in rough terms, how many class sessions may be needed to cover the material in SATL, and which portions of the text may be omitted if time is short. Some thoughts are also offered about which topics deserve the greatest attention (or at least should not be overlooked), and about strategies for efficiently teaching certain groups of cases. Occasionally, an excerpt from a particularly interesting case or article is quoted. Miscellaneous teaching tips, as well as selected references to collateral reading, are also provided. Some of the notes offer an economic analysis of legal questions.

The information relating to the principal cases is arranged by chapter, in the same order in which the cases appear in SATL. Typically, there is a brief statement about the point of the case, or why it was included in the book, followed by questions about the decision or related materials in SATL. Some of the proffered questions are obvious and elementary, others are more complex. Some inquire into the holding of the case or the opinion's relation to other decisions; others explore issues of public policy; and still others vary the facts of the case or present related hypothetical queries. While many of these questions might be used verbatim in class, they are probably more valuable simply as a list that a professor can look over in advance of class to begin thinking about issues that might be explored in dialogue with students. In some instances, "answers" are offered. In many cases, answers have been omitted, not because the questions are difficult, but because the lists of questions will be used by experienced law teachers to whom the answers (or the ways to arrive at answers) will be readily apparent.

Appendix A contains a syllabus suggesting how assignments might be allocated in a five-credit torts course meeting 70 times during the year and proceeding through the materials from front to back. An effort has been made to divide the coverage into relatively equal assignments, taking into account the need to identify logical stopping points and to make allowance for especially easy or difficult materials.

Appendix B contains several essay questions that I have used in past torts classes. The general scope of each essay question (e.g.,

Preface

"negligence and simple intentional torts" or "defamation and privacy") has been noted. Professors are invited to use these questions in any way and for any purpose that seems desirable. One possibility is to distribute the questions to students, or place them on reserve, for use as practice problems. If you are considering using one of these questions on a final exam, be sure to vary the facts substantially because these questions are in the public domain.

I have a long-standing interest in classroom technology and have argued that many students are more comfortable with abstruse discussions of legal theory if they know that periodically the basic path will be made clear. I use Power Point and a document projector in virtually every class, and would be happy to provide you with my Power Point file, which contains approximately 230 slides (vjohnson@stmarytx.edu).

Alan Gunn was my excellent co-author on the first three editions of *Studies in American Tort Law* (1994, 1998, and 2005) and *Teaching Torts* (1995, 1999, and 2005). Following the completion of the third editions of those books, Alan assumed emeritus status at the University of Notre Dame and did not participate in the preparation of the fourth editions. Alan's contributions to the text are still very much a part of this book, particularly the law and economics comments.

Students may benefit from using *Mastering Torts: A Student's Guide to the Law of Torts* (4th ed. 2009, by Vincent R. Johnson, Carolina Academic Press). The study guide explains, in narrative format, how the principal cases in SATL illustrate the main features of the American tort system.

In the production of this book, research assistance and proofreading were provided by several law students at St. Mary's University, including Jane R. Dure, Christopher L. Gordon, Eminence Northcutt, Kayla Wells, Stratos L. Apostolou, Christopher R. Konneker, Mark S. Poling, and Jahannah C. Lemay. The tireless efforts of Allen K. Lowe II and Laura Long (daughter of Armistead M. Long, who worked on the third edition) greatly assisted the work.

I am deeply grateful to Dean Charles E. Cantu and St. Mary's University School of Law for supporting this project. My faculty colleague, Chenglin Liu, contributed valuable ideas that have enriched this text.

iv TEACHING TORTS • FOURTH EDITION

suggestions for future editions of *Teaching Torts*.

Vincent R. Johnson San Antonio, Texas July 2, 2009

TABLE OF CASES

Adams v. Gillig, 373 Albritton v. Neighborhood Ctrs. Ass'n for Child Dev., 342 Altamuro v. Milner Hotel, Inc., American Motorcycle Ass'n v. Superior Court, 331 Anderson v. Minneapolis, St. P. & S.S. M. Ry. Co., 169 Anderson v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 90 Andrushchenko v. Silchuk, 244 Anjou v. Boston Elevated Ry. Ćo., 150 Bailey v. Lewis Farm, Inc., 210 Banker v. McLaughlin, 243 Baptist Mem. Hosp. Sys. v. Sampson, 287 Barker v. Kallash, 86 Barker v. Lull Engineering Co.,

299 Biomet Inc. v. Finnegan Henderson, LLP, 125 Bird v. Jones, 46 Bonney v. Canadian Nat'l Ry. Co., 240 Boyce v. Brown, 127 Boyd v. Racine Currency Exch., Inc., 255 Boyles v. Kerr, 266 Breunig v. American Family Ins. Co., 124 Brochner v. Western Ins. Co., 334 Bruckman v. Pena, 329 Brudney v. Ematrudo, 30 Burr v. Board of County Comm'rs of Stark City, 281 Campbell v. Weathers, 246 Chicago, B & Q. R. R. Co. v. Krayenbuhl, 118

Coffee v. McDonnell-Douglas Corp., 228 Cohen v. Herbal Concepts, Inc., 412 Cohen v. Petty, 9 Coleman v. Ramada Hotel Operating Co., 310 CompuServe Inc. v. CyberProductions, Inc., 55 Credit Alliance Corp. v. Arthur Andersen & Co., 383 Crisci v. Security Ins. Co. of New Haven, 14 Davies v. Butler, 66 De May v. Roberts, 71 De Vera v. Long Beach Public Transp. Co., 219 Derdiarian v. Felix Contracting Corp., 205 Dillard Department Stores, Inc. v. Silva, 82 Di Ponzio v. Riordan, 202 Doe v. Archdiocese of Cincinnati, 281 Doe v. Roe, 6 Drabek v. Sabley, 75 Economopoulos v. A.G. Pollard Co., 394 Elbaor v. Smith, 337 Enright v. Groves, 50 Escola v. Coca Cola Bottling Co. of Fresno, 294 Eskin v. Bartee, 263 Farley v. Sartin, 278 Feltmeier v. Feltmeier, 42 F.G. v. MacDonnell, 265 Garratt v. Dailey, 3 Gavcus v. Potts, 347 Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc., 398 Gipson v. Kasey, 135 Goar v. Village of Stephen, 209 Goddard v. Boston & M.R. Co., Goins v. The Clorox Co., 300 Gonzalez v. New York City

Hous. Auth., 98

Goss v. Allen, 122 Grant v. Reader's Digest Ass'n., Greenman v. Yuba Power Prods. Corp., 296 Gross v. Sweet, 312 Guccione v. Hustler Magazine, Inc., 389 Gulf Refining Co. v. Williams, Halberstam v. Welch, 188 Hamilton v. Beretta U.S.A. Corp., 232 Harkey v. Abate, 410 Harris v. Jones, 37 Helfend v. Southern California Rapid Transit Dist., 96 Helling v. Carey, 131 Herman v. Wesgate, 185 Hilen v. Hays, 309 Holytz v. City of Milwaukee, 340 Hossenlopp v. Cannon, 10 Hoyal v. Pioneer Sand Cp., Inc., Hughes v. Emerald Mines Corp., 352 Humphrey v. Twin State Gas & Elec. Co., 242 Hymowitz v. Eli Lilly and Co., 183 Inkel v. Livingston, 249 In re Marriage of Tigges, 409 Jaillet v. Cashman, 382 John Doe No. 1 v. Archdiocese of Milwaukee, 363 John R. v. Oakland Unified Sch. Dist., 286 Johnson v. Barnes & Noble Booksellers, Inc., 52 Johnson v. Minnesota, 218 Johnson v. New York, 261 Kaneko v. Hilo Coast Processing, 322 Katko v. Briney, 77 Keel v. Hainline, 26

TABLE OF CASES vii

Kelly v. Gwinnell, 270 140 Kent v. Gulf States Utilities Co., Moore v. El Paso Chamber of 290 Commerce, 33 Kinsman No. 1, Petition of Morales v. Lee, 49 Kinsman Transit Co., 200 NAACP v. Acusport, Inc., 353 Kinsman No. 2, Petition of National Conversion Corp. v. Kinsman Transit Co., 201 Cedar Building Corp., 376 Kline v. 1500 Massachusetts New York Times Co. v. Ave., Apartment Corp., 220 Sullivan, 396 Kramer Serv., Inc. v. Wilkins, Nichols v. Progressive Northern Insurance Co., 273 Kremen v. Cohen, 62 Noble v. Louisville Transfer La Raia v. Superior Court, 227 Co., 31 Lambertson v. United States, 20 Nussbaum v. Lacopo, 113 Larsen v. General Motors Corp., O'Brien v. Cunard S.S. Co., 67 297 O'Shea v. Riverway Towing Lewis v. Westinghouse Elec. Co., 100 Corp., 260 Oltmer v. Zamora, 369 Low v. Park Price Co., 147 Orthmann v. Apple River Lozoya v. Sanchez, 265 Campground, Înc., 256 Mahowald v. Minnesota Gas Pachunka v. Rogers Co., 155 Construction Inc., 320 Martin v. Herzog, 139 Palsgraf v. Long Island R.R. Co., Matsuyama v. Birnbaum, 173 Peck v. Counseling Serv. of Mattews v. Amberwood Addison County, Inc., 223 Associates Ltd., 252 Peterson v. Sorlien, 53 McCahill v. New York Transp. Picard v. Barry Pontiac-Buick, Co., 197 McGuire v. Almy, 24 Inc., 32 McKenna v. Straughan, 232 Ploof v. Putnam, 85 McKernan v. Aasheim, 276 Prah v. Maretti, 349 McMillen v. Klingensmith, 332 Ranard v. O'Neil, 139 McNamara v. Freedom Ranson v. Kitner, 22 Newspapers, Inc., 407 Remsburg v. Docusearch, Inc., Merhi v. Becker, 198 Meyer ex rel. Coplin v. Fluor Reynolds v. Texas & Pac. Ry. Corp., 95 Co., 166 Michie v. Great Lakes Steel Div. Richard v. A. Waldman and Nat'l Steel Corp., 327 Sons, Inc., 381 Milkovich v. Lorain Journal Riss v. City of New York, 234 Co., 402 Rocha v. Faltys, 228 Miller v. HCA, Inc., 69 Rose v. Daily Mirror, Inc., 392 Rousey v. Rousey, 340 Minnich v. Med-Waste, Inc., 319 Rowland v. Christian, 250 Mobil Chemical Co. v. Bell, 152 Russell-Vaughn Ford, Inc. v. Montgomery v. Royal Motel, Rouse, 60

viii TEACHING TORTS • FOURTH EDITION

Russo v. Griffin, 127 Saelzler v. Advanced Group 400, 168 Sall v. T's, Inc., 230 Schramm v. Lyon, 345 Scott v. Bradford, 128 Seim v. Garavalia, 141 Sheehan v. Roche Brothers Supermarkets, Inc., 150 Sheppard-Mobley v. King, 279 Sidis v. F-R Publishing Corp., 405 Silas v. Bowen, 73 Sindell v. Abbott Labs., 180 Slocum v. Food Fair Stores of Florida, Inc., 40 Smith v. Cote, 277 Smith v. Lannert, 284 Sorichetti v. City of New York, Sovereign Pocohontas v. Bond, 364 Spears v. Coffee, 206 Spur Industries, Inc. v. Del E. Webb Dev. Co., 256 Stachniewicz v. Mar-Cam Corp., 137 State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell, State v. Lead Industries Association, Inc., 354 Summers v. Tice, 177 Surocco v. Geary, 83 The T.J. Hooper, 146 Time, Inc. v. Firestone, 400 Trammell Crow Central Texas, Ltd. v. Gutierrez, 254 Trevio v. Ortega, 160 Turcotte v. Fell, 317 Tyson v. Tyson, 344 United States v. Carroll Towing Co., 116 Vassiliades v. Garfinckel's, Brooks Bros., 408 Vincent v. Lake Erie Transp.

Co., 84 Vosburg v. Putney, 2 Wagon Mound No. 1, Overseas Tankship (U.K.) Ltd. v. Morts Dock & Eng'g Co., Ltd., 195 Wagon Mound No. 2, Overseas Tankship (U.K.) Ltd. v. Miller Steamship Co., 196 Wegner v. Milwaukee Mut. Ins. Co., 83 Weintraub v. Krobatsch, 366 West v. East Tennessee Pioneer Oil Co., 273 West v. Media General Convergence, Inc., 412 Western Union Tel. Co. v. Hill, 35 Western Union Tel. Co. v. Hoffman, 306 Williams v. Bright, 120 Williams v. Rank & Son Buick, Inc., 377 Williams v. Steves Indus., Inc., 164 Winget v. Winn Dixie Stores, Inc., 351 Wolfe v. MBNA America Bank, 223 Wyeth v. Levine, 303 Ybarra v. Spangard, 157 Yommer v. McKenzie, 289 Young v. Clark, 118 Zaslow v. Kroenert, 56 Zeni v. Anderson, 140 Zimmerman v. Ausland, 97