

# Corporations

*Carolina Academic Press  
Law Casebook Series  
Advisory Board*



Gary J. Simson, Chairman  
*Dean, Case Western Reserve University School of Law*

Raj K. Bhala  
*University of Kansas School of Law*

John C. Coffee, Jr.  
*Columbia University Law School*

Randall Coyne  
*University of Oklahoma College of Law*

John S. Dzienkowski  
*University of Texas School of Law*

Paul Finkelman  
*University of Tulsa College of Law*

Robert M. Jarvis  
*Shepard Broad Law Center  
Nova Southeastern University*

Vincent R. Johnson  
*St. Mary's University School of Law*

Michael A. Olivas  
*University of Houston Law Center*

Kenneth Port  
*William Mitchell College of Law*

Michael P. Scharf  
*Case Western Reserve University School of Law*

Peter M. Shane  
*Michael E. Moritz College of Law  
The Ohio State University*

Emily L. Sherwin  
*Cornell Law School*

John F. Sutton, Jr.  
*Emeritus, University of Texas School of Law*

David B. Wexler  
*John E. Rogers College of Law  
University of Arizona*

# Corporations

---

## Cases and Materials

**Lawrence E. Mitchell**

THEODORE RINEHART PROFESSOR OF BUSINESS LAW  
THE GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL

**Dalia Tsuk Mitchell**

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR OF LAW  
THE GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL

**CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS**

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2006  
Lawrence E. Mitchell and Dalia Tsuk Mitchell  
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 1-59460-253-0  
LCCN 2006929437

**Carolina Academic Press**  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, NC 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

# Contents

---

---

Table of Principal Cases	xiii
<b>PART I THE NATURE AND PURPOSE OF THE CORPORATION</b>	<b>3</b>
Introduction	3
<b>Section I The Nature of the Corporation</b>	<b>5</b>
<i>Trustees of Dartmouth College v. Woodward</i>	5
Delaware General Corporation Law Section 394	15
Notes and Questions	15
Liam Seamus O'Melinn, <i>Neither Contract nor Concession:         The Public Personality of the Corporation</i>	16
<b>Section II The Purpose of the Corporation</b>	<b>19</b>
<i>Dodge v. Ford Motor Co.</i>	19
Notes and Questions	27
Dalia Tsuk, <i>Corporations Without Labor: The Politics of Progressive         Corporate Law</i>	27
<i>A. P. Smith Mfg. Co. v. Barlow</i>	29
The American Law Institute Principles of Corporate Governance: Analysis and Recommendations	34
<b>Section III The Corporation and Other Business Forms</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>Section IV Limited Liability and Its Limits</b>	<b>39</b>
A. Basic Rules	39
<i>Walkovszky v. Carlton</i>	39
Notes and Questions	45
<i>Kinney Shoe Corporation v. Polan</i>	45
Notes and Questions	48
<i>Sea-Land Services, Inc. v. The Pepper Source</i>	49
Notes and Questions	52
Comment on Limited Liability	53
B. Parents and Subsidiaries	54
<i>Japan Petroleum Co. (Nigeria) Ltd. v. Ashland Oil, Inc.</i>	54
Notes and Questions	61
<i>Hideca Petroleum Corporation v. Tampimex Oil International, Ltd.</i>	61
Notes and Questions	64
<b>Section V Who Counts Within the Corporation?</b>	<b>64</b>
<i>Steinway v. Steinway &amp; Sons</i>	64
Notes and Questions	67

<i>Simons v. Cogan</i>	67
Notes and Questions	70
<i>Jedwab v. MGM Grand Hotels, Inc.</i>	70
Notes and Questions	74
Connecticut General Statutes Annotated Section 33-756	
General standards for directors	75
New York Business Corporations Law Section 717	
Duty of directors	75
Notes and Questions	76
<b>Section VI Shareholder Valuism—The New Business “Ethic”</b>	<b>76</b>
<b>Section VII The Role of the Corporation in Public Life</b>	<b>79</b>
<i>Poletown Neighborhood Council v. City of Detroit</i>	80
Notes and Questions	81
<i>Charter Township of Ypsilanti v. General Motors Corporation</i>	82
Notes and Questions	87
<b>Section VIII The Legal Structure of the Corporation</b>	<b>88</b>
<b>Section IX A Global Perspective</b>	<b>91</b>
William W. Bratton and Joseph A. McCahery, <i>Comparative Corporate Governance and the Theory of the Firm: The Case Against Global Cross Reference</i>	92
<b>PART 2 THE DUTIES OF DIRECTORS AND OFFICERS</b>	<b>95</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>95</b>
<b>Section I The Authority of the Board</b>	<b>96</b>
Delaware General Corporation Law Section 141	96
Section 142	99
<i>Hoyt v. Thompson’s Executor</i>	100
Notes and Questions	100
<i>Grimes v. Donald</i>	102
Notes and Questions	104
<b>Section II Derivative Litigation</b>	<b>104</b>
A. The Distinction Between Derivative and Direct Actions	105
<i>Eisenberg v. The Flying Tiger Line, Inc.</i>	105
Notes and Questions	108
<i>Grimes v. Donald</i>	109
Notes and Questions	110
B. Security for Expenses	110
<i>Baker v. MacFadden Publications, Inc.; Baker v. Boord</i>	110
Notes and Questions	112
C. Demand on the Board	113
<i>Grimes v. Donald</i>	113
Notes and Questions	116
D. Demand Refusal	117
<i>Marx v. Akers</i>	117
Notes and Questions	123

E. Special Committees	124
<i>Auerbach v. Bennett</i>	124
<i>Zapata Corporation v. Maldonado</i>	130
Notes and Questions	136
<b>Section III The Fiduciary Duties of Directors and Officers</b>	<b>136</b>
A. The Business Judgment Rule	138
<i>Kamin v. American Express Company</i>	138
Notes and Questions	141
<i>Joy v. North</i>	143
Notes and Questions	145
B. The Duty to Act	147
<i>Francis v. United Jersey Bank</i>	147
Notes and Questions	156
<i>Senn v. Northwest Underwriters Inc.</i>	157
Notes and Questions	159
<i>In re Caremark International Inc. Derivative Litigation</i>	159
Notes and Questions	170
C. The Duty of Loyalty	172
i. Self-Dealing Transactions	173
<i>Meinhard v. Salmon</i>	173
Notes and Questions	177
<i>Bayer v. Beran</i>	179
Notes and Questions	184
Delaware General Corporation Law Section 144	185
New York Business Corporation Law Section 713	186
<i>Marciano v. Nakash</i>	187
Notes and Questions	191
<i>Cooke v. Oolie</i>	193
ii. Fairness	199
Fair Price: A Matter of Value—A Primer on Financial Valuation	199
iii. Corporate Opportunity	207
<i>Broz v. Cellular Information Systems, Inc.</i>	207
Notes and Questions	215
<i>Energy Resources Corporation, Inc. v. Porter</i>	216
Notes and Questions	218
<i>In re eBay, Inc. Shareholders Litigation</i>	219
Notes and Questions	221
ALI Principles of Corporate Governance Section 5.05	222
iv. Compensation and Waste	223
<i>Lewis v. Vogelstein</i>	223
Notes and Questions	234
<i>Sanders v. Wang</i>	234
Notes and Questions	244
D. The Dormant Duty of Care	244
<i>Cede &amp; Co. v. Technicolor, Inc.</i>	246
Notes and Questions	254
The Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002	255
Notes and Questions	260

<i>In re The Walt Disney Derivative Litigation</i>	260
Notes and Question	296
E. The Federal Approach	297
<i>Basic Inc. v. Levinson</i>	299
Notes and Questions	312
<i>West v. Prudential Securities, Incorporated</i>	314
Notes and Questions	317
<i>Securities and Exchange Commission v. Texas Gulf Sulphur Co.</i>	318
Notes and Questions	329
<i>Chiarella v. U.S.</i>	330
Notes and Questions	335
<i>Dirks v. Securities and Exchange Commission</i>	335
Notes and Questions	343
<i>U.S. v. O'Hagan</i>	345
Notes and Questions	352
<b>PART 3 SHAREHOLDERS</b>	355
<b>Introduction</b>	355
<b>Section I Shareholders in Publicly Held Corporations</b>	356
A. The Disappearance of the Individual Investor	356
<i>Dalia Tsuk Mitchell, Shareholders as Proxies: The Contours of Shareholder Democracy</i>	356
B. The Shareholders' Power to Elect and Remove Directors	358
<i>Auer v. Dressel</i>	358
Notes and Questions	364
<i>Campbell v. Loew's Incorporated</i>	365
Notes and Questions	371
<i>Schnell v. Chris-Craft Industries, Inc.</i>	372
Notes and Questions	373
<i>Blasius Industries, Inc. v. Atlas Corporation</i>	373
Notes and Questions	382
Andrew C. Houston, <i>Chancellor Allen's Jurisprudence: Blasius and the Democratic Paradigm in Corporate Law</i>	383
C. The Proxy Contest	385
<i>Rosenfeld v. Fairchild Engine and Airplane Corporation</i>	386
Notes and Questions	392
<i>Campbell v. Loew's Incorporated</i>	393
Notes and Questions	396
<i>Levin v. Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer, Inc.</i>	397
Notes and Questions	402
D. Shareholders' Rights to Information	404
<i>Mills v. Electric Auto-Lite Co.</i>	404
Notes and Questions	409
<i>TSC Industries, Inc. v. Northway, Inc.</i>	410
Notes and Questions	417
<i>Virginia Bankshares, Inc. v. Sandberg</i>	417
Notes and Questions	427

E. Shareholder Proposals	427
Dalia Tsuk Mitchell, <i>Shareholders as Proxies: The Contours of Shareholder Democracy</i>	427
17 C.F.R. § 240.14a-8: Shareholder proposals	434
<i>Amalgamated Clothing and Textile Workers Union v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.</i>	438
<i>American Federation of State County and Municipal Employees v. American International Group, Inc.</i>	449
<b>Section II Shareholders in Closely Held Corporations</b>	452
A. Shareholders' Voice and Exit Arrangements	453
<i>Ringling Bros.-Barnum &amp; Bailey Combined Shows, Inc. v. Ringling</i>	455
Notes and Questions	461
<i>Abercrombie v. Davies</i>	461
Notes and Questions	468
<i>Lehrman v. Cohen</i>	468
Notes and Questions	474
<i>Oceanic Exploration Company v. Grynberg</i>	475
Notes and Questions	480
<i>Rosiny v. Schmidt</i>	481
Notes and Questions	492
B. The Allocation of Power between Shareholders and Directors	492
<i>McQuade v. Stoneham</i>	493
Notes and Questions	498
<i>Clark v. Dodge</i>	498
Notes and Questions	501
<i>Galler v. Galler</i>	501
Notes and Questions	507
C. Fiduciary Duties of Shareholders in Closely Held Corporations	507
Lawrence E. Mitchell, <i>The Death of Fiduciary Duty in Close Corporations</i>	507
<i>Donahue v. Rodd Electrotype Company of New England, Inc.</i>	508
Notes and Questions	516
<i>Wilkes v. Springside Nursing Home, Inc.</i>	517
Notes and Questions	522
<i>Sugarman v. Sugarman</i>	522
Notes and Questions	528
<i>Jordan v. Duff and Phelps, Inc.</i>	528
Notes and Questions	540
D. Remedies for Oppression	540
<i>Alaska Plastics, Inc. v. Coppock</i>	540
Notes and Questions	545
<i>In the Matter of the Judicial Dissolution of Kemp &amp; Beatley, Inc.</i>	545
Notes and Questions	550
<i>Ehrlich v. Audubon Quartet, Inc.</i>	550
Notes and Questions	558
<b>Section III Controlling Shareholders</b>	559
A. Controlling Shareholders' Fiduciary Duties	559
<i>Sinclair Oil Corporation v. Levien</i>	559

Notes and Questions	563
<i>Anadarko Petroleum Corporation v. Panhandle Eastern Corporation</i>	563
Notes and Questions	569
<i>Zahn v. Transamerica Corporation</i>	569
Notes and Questions	572
B. Sale of Control	573
<i>Perlman v. Feldmann</i>	573
Notes and Questions	577
<i>Essex Universal Corporation v. Yates</i>	578
Notes and Questions	585
<i>Weinberger v. UOP, Inc.</i>	585
Notes and Questions	595
<b>PART 4 FUNDAMENTAL TRANSACTIONS</b>	597
<b>Section I Sales of Assets</b>	597
<i>Katz v. Bregman</i>	599
Notes and Questions	600
<b>Section II Mergers</b>	601
A. Some Historical Background	601
B. Mergers and Sales of Assets	604
<i>Farris v. Glen Alden Corporation</i>	606
Notes and Questions	610
<i>Hariton v. Arco Electronics, Inc.</i>	611
Notes and Questions	612
<b>Section III Parent-Subsidiary Mergers</b>	612
A. The Remedy	613
<i>Weinberger v. UOP, Inc.</i>	613
<i>Cede &amp; Co. v. Technicolor</i>	614
Notes and Questions	617
B. <i>Weinberger's Reach</i>	617
<i>Rabkin v. Hunt Chemical Corporation</i>	617
Notes and Questions	622
<i>Glassman v. Unocal Exploration Corp.</i>	622
Notes and Questions	624
<i>Coggins v. New England Patriots Football Club, Inc.</i>	625
Notes and Questions	630
<i>Leader v. Hycor, Inc.</i>	630
Notes and Questions	634
<b>Section IV Tender Offers</b>	635
<i>Unocal Corporation v. Mesa Petroleum Co.</i>	636
Notes and Questions	644
<i>Moran v. Household International, Inc.</i>	646
Notes and Questions	651
<i>Revlon, Inc. v. MacAndrews &amp; Forbes Holdings, Inc.</i>	652
Notes and Questions	661
<i>Paramount Communications, Inc. v. Time Incorporated</i>	662
Notes and Questions	674

CONTENTS

xi

<i>Paramount Communications Inc. v. QVC Network Inc.</i>	675
Notes and Questions	689
<i>Unitrin, Inc. v. American General Corp.</i>	695
Notes and Questions	713
<i>Omnicare, Inc. v. NCS Healthcare, Inc.</i>	714
Notes and Questions	733
New York Business Corporation Law Section 912	734
Index	739



# Table of Principal Cases

---

---

- A. P. Smith Mfg. Co. v. Barlow, 13 N.J. 145 (1953), 29
- Abercrombie v. Davies, 130 A.2d 338 (Del. 1957), 461
- Alaska Plastics, Inc. v. Coppock, 621 P.2d 270 (Alaska 1980), 540
- Amalgamated Clothing and Textile Workers Union v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., 821 F. Supp. 877 (S.D.N.Y. 1993), 438
- American Federation of State County and Municipal Employees v. American International Group, Inc., 361 F. Supp. 2d 344 (S.D.N.Y. 2005), 449
- Anadarko Petroleum Corporation v. Panhandle Eastern Corporation, 545 A.2d 1171 (Del. 1988), 563
- Auer v. Dressel, 306 N.Y. 427 (1954), 358
- Auerbach v. Bennett, 47 N.Y.2d 619 (1979), 124
- Baker v. MacFadden Publications, Inc.; Baker v. Boord, 300 N.Y. 325 (1950), 110
- Basic Inc. v. Levinson, 485 U.S. 224 (1988), 299
- Bayer v. Beran, 49 N.Y.S.2d 2 (1944), 179
- Blasius Industries, Inc. v. Atlas Corporation, 564 A.2d 651 (Del. Ch. 1988), 373
- Broz v. Cellular Information Systems, Inc., 673 A.2d 148 (Del. 1996), 207
- Campbell v. Loew's Incorporated, 36 Del. Ch. 563 (1957), 365, 393
- Cede & Co. v. Technicolor, 1990 WL 161084 (Del. Ch. 1990), 614
- Cede & Co. v. Technicolor, Inc., 634 A.2d 345 (Del. 1993), 246
- Charter Township of Ypsilanti v. General Motors Corporation, 506 N.W.2d 556 (Mich. Ct. App. 1993), 82
- Chiarella v. U.S., 445 U.S. 222 (1980), 330
- Clark v. Dodge, 269 N.Y. 410 (1936), 498
- Coggins v. New England Patriots Football Club, Inc., 492 N.E.2d 1112 (Mass. 1986), 625
- Cooke v. Oolie, 23 Del. J. Corp. L. 775 (1997), 193
- Dirks v. Securities and Exchange Commission, 463 U.S. 646 (1983), 335
- Dodge v. Ford Motor Co., 204 Mich. 459 (1919), 19
- Donahue v. Rodd Electrotpe Company of New England, Inc., 367 Mass. 578 (1975), 508
- Ehrlich v. Audubon Quartet, Inc., Court of Common Pleas of Allegheny County, PA, 2005, 550
- Eisenberg v. The Flying Tiger Line, Inc., 451 F.2d 267 (2d Cir. 1971), 105
- Energy Resources Corporation, Inc. v. Porter, 14 Mass.App.Ct. 296 (1982), 216
- Essex Universal Corporation v. Yates, 305 F.2d 572 (2nd Cir. 1962), 578
- Farris v. Glen Alden Corporation, 143 A.2d 25 (Pa. 1958), 606
- Francis v. United Jersey Bank, 87 N.J. 15 (1981), 147
- Galler v. Galler, 32 Ill.2d 16 (1964), 501
- Glassman v. Unocal Exploration Corp., 777 A.2d 242 (Del. 2001), 622
- Grimes v. Donald, 673 A.2d 1207 (Del. 1996), 102, 109, 113

- Hariton v. Arco Electronics, Inc., 188 A.2d 123 (Del. 1963), 611
- Hidex Petroleum Corporation v. Tampimex Oil International, Ltd., 740 S.W.2d 838 (Tex. App.-Hous. 1987), 61
- Hoyt v. Thompson's Executor, 19 N.Y. 207 (1859), 100
- In re Caremark International Inc. Derivative Litigation, 698 A.2d 959 (Del. Ch. 1996), 159
- In re eBay, Inc. Shareholders Litigation, 2004 Del. Ch. LEXIS 4 (2004), 219
- In re The Walt Disney Derivative Litigation, 2005 Del. Ch. LEXIS 113, 260
- In the Matter of the Judicial Dissolution of Kemp & Beatley, Inc., 64 N.Y.2d 63 (1984), 545
- Japan Petroleum Co. (Nigeria) Ltd. v. Ashland Oil, Inc., 456 F. Supp. 831 (D.C. Del. 1978), 54
- Jedwab v. MGM Grand Hotels, Inc., 509 A.2d 584 (Del. Ch. 1986), 70
- Jordan v. Duff and Phelps, Inc., 815 F.2d 429 (7th Cir. 1987), 528
- Joy v. North, 692 F.2d 880 (2d Cir. 1982), 143
- Kamin v. American Express Company, 383 N.Y.S.2d 807 (1st Dept. 1976), 138
- Katz v. Bregman, 431 A.2d 1274 (Del. Ch. 1981), 599
- Kinney Shoe Corporation v. Polan, 939 F.2d 209 (4th Cir. 1991), 45
- Leader v. Hycor, Inc., 479 N.E.2d 173 (Mass. 1985), 630
- Lehrman v. Cohen, 222 A.2d 800 (Del. 1966), 468
- Levin v. Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer, Inc., 264 F. Supp. 797 (S.D.N.Y. 1967), 397
- Lewis v. Vogelstein, 699 A.2d 327 (Del. Ch. 1997), 223
- Marciano v. Nakash, 535 A.2d 400 (Del. 1987), 187
- Marx v. Akers, 88 N.Y.2d 189 (1996), 117
- McQuade v. Stoneham, 263 N.Y. 323 (1934), 493
- Meinhard v. Salmon, 249 N.Y. 458 (1928), 173
- Mills v. Electric Auto-Lite Co., 396 U.S. 375 (1970)
- Moran v. Household International, Inc., 500 A.2d 1346 (Del. 1985), 646
- Oceanic Exploration Company v. Grynberg, 428 A.2d 1 (Del. 1981), 475
- Omnicare, Inc. v. NCS Healthcare, Inc., 818 A.2d 914 (Del. 2003), 714
- Paramount Communications Inc. v. QVC Network Inc., 637 A.2d 34 (Del. 1994), 675
- Paramount Communications, Inc. v. Time Incorporated, 571 A.2d 1140 (Del. 1989), 662
- Perlman v. Feldmann, 219 F.2d 173 (2nd Cir. 1955), 573
- Poletown Neighborhood Council v. City of Detroit, 304 N.W.2d 455 (Mich. 1981), 80
- Rabkin v. Hunt Chemical Corporation, 498 A.2d 1099 (Del. 1985), 617
- Revlon, Inc. v. MacAndrews & Forbes Holdings, Inc., 506 A.2d 173 (Del. 1986), 652
- Ringling Bros.-Barnum & Bailey Combined Shows, Inc. v. Ringling, 53 A.2d 441 (Del. 1947), 455
- Rosenfeld v. Fairchild Engine and Airplane Corporation, 309 N.Y. 168 (1955), 386
- Rosiny v. Schmidt, 185 A.D.2d 727 (N.Y. 1992), 481
- Sanders v. Wang, 1999 WL 1044880 (Del. Ch. 1999), 234
- Schnell v. Chris-Craft Industries, Inc., 285 A.2d 437 (Del. 1971), 372
- Sea-Land Services, Inc. v. The Pepper Source, 941 F.2d 519 (7th Cir. 1991), 49
- Securities and Exchange Commission v. Texas Gulf Sulphur Co., 401 F.2d 833 (2nd Cir. 1969), 318
- Senn v. Northwest Underwriters Inc., 875 P.2d 637 (Wash. App. 1994), 157
- Simons v. Cogan, 549 A.2d 300 (Del. 1988), 67
- Sinclair Oil Corporation v. Levien, 280 A.2d 717 (Del. 1971), 559
- Steinway v. Steinway & Sons, 40 N.Y.S. 718 (1896), 64
- Sugarman v. Sugarman, 797 F.2d 3 (1st Cir. 1986), 522

- Trustees of Dartmouth College v. Woodward, 17 U.S. 518 (1819), 5
- TSC Industries, Inc. v. Northway, Inc., 426 U.S. 438 (1976), 410
- U.S. v. O'Hagan, 521 U.S. 642 (1997), 345
- Unitrin, Inc. v. American General Corp., 651 A.2d 1361 (Del. 1995), 695
- Unocal Corporation v. Mesa Petroleum Co., 493 A.2d 946 (Del. 1985), 636
- Virginia Bankshares, Inc. v. Sandberg, 501 U.S. 1083 (1991), 417
- Walkovszky v. Carlton, 18 N.Y.2d 414 (1966), 39
- Weinberger v. UOP, Inc., 457 A.2d 701 (Del. 1983), 585, 613
- West v. Prudential Securities, Incorporated, 282 F.3d 935 (7th Cir. 2002), 314
- Wilkes v. Springside Nursing Home, Inc., 370 Mass. 842 (1976), 517
- Zahn v. Transamerica Corporation, 162 F.2d 36 (3rd Cir. 1947), 569
- Zapata Corporation v. Maldonado, 430 A.2d 779 (Del. 1981), 130

