

# Insurance

*Carolina Academic Press  
Law Casebook Series  
Advisory Board*



Gary J. Simson, Chairman  
*Dean, Case Western Reserve University School of Law*

Raj Bhala  
*University of Kansas School of Law*

John C. Coffee, Jr.  
*Columbia University Law School*

Randall Coyne  
*University of Oklahoma College of Law*

John S. Dzienkowski  
*University of Texas School of Law*

Paul Finkelman  
*Albany Law School*

Robert M. Jarvis  
*Shepard Broad Law Center  
Nova Southeastern University*

Vincent R. Johnson  
*St. Mary's University School of Law*

Michael A. Olivas  
*University of Houston Law Center*

Kenneth Port  
*William Mitchell College of Law*

Michael P. Scharf  
*Case Western Reserve University School of Law*

Peter M. Shane  
*Michael E. Moritz College of Law  
The Ohio State University*

Emily L. Sherwin  
*Cornell Law School*

John F. Sutton, Jr.  
*Emeritus, University of Texas School of Law*

David B. Wexler  
*John E. Rogers College of Law  
University of Arizona*

# **Insurance**

---

## **Cases and Materials on Coverage, Claims, and Litigation**

**Barry Zalma**

**CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS**  

---

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2007  
Barry Zalma  
All Rights Reserved.

ISBN-10: 1-59460-312-X  
ISBN-13: 978-1-59460-312-9  
LCCN: 2007928099

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone: (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America.

*To my wife, Thea,  
the most important person in my life and my best friend.*



# Contents

---

<b>Table of Cases</b>	<b>xv</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>3</b>
A. Insurance and the Lawyer	3
B. Ancient Forms of Insurance	4
1. Lloyd's of London	5
2. The Modern Market at Lloyd's	6
3. Fire Insurance	8
4. The Definition of Insurance Today	8
C. Structure	9
1. The Prospective Insured's First Contact with an Insurer	9
i. Acquisition of the Policy	9
ii. The Underwriter	10
iii. The Loss Prevention Engineer	10
iv. The Pre-Risk Inspection Service	10
2. After Insurance Is in Effect	10
i. The Delivery of a Notice of Loss	10
ii. The Claims Adjuster	10
iii. The Claims Investigator	11
iv. The Claims Supervisor or Claims Manager	11
v. Claims Counsel	11
D. Use of Book	11
<b>Chapter 1 The History of Insurance</b>	<b>13</b>
A. The Context of Insurance	13
1. The Historical Basis for the Covenant of Good Faith and Fair Dealing	13
<i>Carter v. Boehm</i>	13
Notes	22
2. Statutes	22
Notes	24
Notes	25
3. The Business of Insurance and the U.S. Government	25
<i>German Alliance Insurance Company v. Lewis</i>	26
<b>Chapter 2 The Contract of Personal Indemnity</b>	<b>45</b>
A. Property Insurance	45
<i>Russell v. Williams</i>	46
Notes	50

	<i>Lighting Fixture Supply Co. v. Fidelity Union Fire Ins. Co</i>	51
	Notes	54
<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>Construction of Insurance Contracts</b>	<b>57</b>
A.	Rules of Insurance Contract Interpretation	57
	<i>Trade Center Properties, L.L.C. v. Hartford Fire Insurance Company</i>	59
	Notes	75
	<i>Mackinnon v. Truck Insurance Exchange</i>	76
	Notes	89
B.	Investigation Now Required	90
	<i>E.M.M.I. Inc. v. Zurich American Insurance Company</i>	91
	Notes	108
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>Differences between Property and Liability Policies</b>	<b>109</b>
A.	All Insurance is Not the Same	109
	1. Property	109
	2. Liability	109
	<i>Garvey v. State Farm Fire and Casualty Co.</i>	111
	Notes	124
	<i>Sabella v. Wisler</i>	124
	Notes	131
	<i>Prudential-LMI Commercial Insurance v. Superior Court of San Diego County</i>	132
	Notes	148
	<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Partridge</i>	149
	Notes	157
<b>Chapter 5</b>	<b>Rescission of Insurance Policies</b>	<b>159</b>
A.	Rescission	159
	1. An Equitable Remedy	159
	2. Required Proof	160
	3. Rescission Deprives the Innocent of Ability to Obtain Insurance Proceeds	160
	4. Return Consideration	161
	5. Concealment or Misrepresentation	161
	6. Materiality	162
	7. The Marine Rule	162
	<i>Imperial Casualty and Indemnity Co. v. Sogomonian</i>	162
	Notes	171
	<i>Simmons v. United Presidential Life Insurance Co.</i>	172
	Notes	177
	<i>Chawla v. Transamerica Occidental Life Insurance Co.</i>	178
	Notes	185
	<i>Stipcich v. Metropolitan Life Ins. Co</i>	185
	Notes	190
<b>Chapter 6</b>	<b>Duties of the Insured and the Insurer</b>	<b>191</b>
A.	Good Faith	191
	1. The Implied Covenant of Good Faith and Fair Dealing	191

B. Tort of Bad Faith	192
<i>Comunale v. Traders &amp; General Insurance Company</i>	192
Notes	196
<i>Critz v. Farmers Insurance Group</i>	197
Notes	205
<i>Crisci v. Security Insurance Company</i>	205
Notes	210
<i>Gruenberg v. Aetna Ins. Co.</i>	211
Notes	222
<i>Egan v. Mutual of Omaha Insurance Company</i>	223
<i>Eckenrode v. Life of America Ins. Co.</i>	227
Notes	231
<i>A.A.A. Pool Service &amp; Supply, Inc. v. Aetna Casualty &amp; Surety Co.</i>	232
Notes	235
<i>Farris v. United States Fidelity and Guaranty Co.</i>	235
Notes	241
B. The Tort of Outrage—A Substitute for the Tort of Bad Faith	242
<i>Hormann v. New Hampshire Ins. Co.</i>	242
Notes	248
<i>Beck v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co.</i>	249
Notes	253
C. Coercive or Abusive Practices	254
<i>John Norman Shafer v. Berger, Kahn, Shafton, Moss</i>	254
Notes	272
D. Conduct During Litigation	273
<i>White v. Western Title Ins. Co., 40 Cal. 3d 870 (1985)</i>	273
Notes	281
<i>O'Donnell v. Allstate Insurance Co</i>	282
Notes	289
E. Statutory Bad Faith	289
F. Abuses of the Tort of Bad Faith	291
<i>Royal Globe Insurance Co. v. Superior Court of Butte County</i>	292
Notes	302
<i>Moradi-Shalal v. Fireman's Fund Insurance Companies</i>	304
Notes	311
G. Exposure of Insured to Other Claims	312
<i>Coe v. State Farm Mutual Auto. Insurance</i>	312
Notes	319
H. Defenses to the Tort of Bad Faith—The Genuine Dispute Doctrine	320
<i>Chateau Chamberay Homeowners Assoc. v. Assoc. International Insurance Company</i>	320
Notes	328
<i>State Farm Fire and Casualty Co. v. Balmer</i>	329
Notes	332
<b>Chapter 7 Conditions, Warranties, and Exclusions</b>	<b>335</b>
A. Conditions	335
<i>MBE Collection, Inc. v. Westfield Companies, Inc</i>	335
Notes	339

B. Warranties	339
1. Types of Warranties	339
<i>Aetna Ins. Co. v. Houston Oil &amp; Transport Co.</i>	340
Notes	343
<i>Holz Rubber Co. v. American Star Insurance Co</i>	343
Notes	355
2. Coinsurance	356
<i>Los Angeles Mutual Insurance Co. v. Cawog</i>	356
Notes	360
<i>Williamson &amp; Vollmer Engineering Inc. v. Sequoia Insurance Co</i>	360
Notes	368
C. Exclusions	368
<i>State Farm Fire and Casualty Co. v. Lieth</i>	369
Notes	376
D. Exclusion for Inherent Vice	376
<i>City of Burlington v. Indemnity Insurance Company of North America</i>	377
Notes	386
E. Wear and Tear or Corrosion	386
<i>Brodkin v. State Farm Fire &amp; Casualty Co</i>	387
Notes	391
<b>Chapter 8 Fortuity</b>	<b>393</b>
A. Assault and Battery and Other Intentional Acts Exclusions	393
<i>State Farm Insurance Companies v. Gerrity</i>	393
Notes	396
<i>J. C. Penney Casualty Insurance Co. v. M. K.</i>	397
Notes	408
B. Fortuity	409
<i>National Union Fire Insurance Co. v. Stroh Companies, Inc</i>	409
Notes	421
C. Assault and Battery	421
<i>Gray v. Zurich Insurance Co.</i>	421
Notes	431
D. The “Loss in Progress” Rule	431
<i>Inland Waters Pollution Control Inc. v. National Union Fire Insurance Co.</i>	432
Notes	438
<i>Morton International Inc. v. General Accident Insurance Co</i>	438
Notes	459
<b>Chapter 9 Trigger of Coverage</b>	<b>461</b>
A. Policy Format and Structure	461
<i>Keene Corporation v. Insurance Company of North America</i>	465
Notes	480
<i>Insurance Co. v. Forty-Eight Insulations Inc</i>	481
Notes	495
<i>E.R. Squibb &amp; Sons, Inc. v. Lloyd’s &amp; Companies</i>	495

<i>Port Authority of New York and New Jersey v. Affiliated FM Insurance Company</i>	508
Notes	514
<b>Chapter 10 Appraisal</b>	<b>517</b>
A. Appraisal in First Party Insurance Policies	517
1. Appraisal Is Arbitration	518
<i>Klubnikin v. California Fair Plan Association</i>	518
Notes	521
<i>Opar v. Allstate Insurance Co</i>	521
Notes	525
2. Appraisal is Not an Arbitration	525
<i>Minot Town &amp; Country v. Fireman's Fund Insurance Co</i>	525
Notes	527
<i>Munn v. National Fire Insurance Co. Of Hartford, et al.</i>	527
Notes	532
3. Grounds to Set-Aside Appraisal Awards	532
<i>Cheeks v. California Fair Plan Association</i>	532
Notes	536
<i>Figi v. New Hampshire Insurance Co.</i>	537
Notes	539
4. Waiver	540
<i>Christiansen v. First Insurance Co.</i>	540
Notes	549
<b>Chapter 11 Independent Counsel and the Law of Unintended Consequences</b>	<b>551</b>
A. The Right to Independent Counsel	551
1. The Cumis Doctrine	551
<i>San Diego Navy Federal Credit Union v. Cumis Insurance Society Inc.</i>	552
Notes	563
<i>Center Foundation v. Chicago Insurance Co.</i>	563
Notes	572
2. Criminal Conduct	573
<i>United States v. Stites</i>	573
Notes	576
<i>Fireman's Fund Insurance Co. v. Stites</i>	577
Notes	580
<b>Chapter 12 Fraud and False Swearing</b>	<b>581</b>
A. False Swearing	581
<i>Cummings v. Fire Insurance Exchange</i>	581
Notes	590
<i>Ichthys Inc. v. Guarantee Insurance Co.</i>	591
Notes	593
<i>Chubb &amp; Son Inc. v. Consoli</i>	594
Notes	595
<i>Oak Point Industrial Park v. Massachusetts Bay Insurance Company</i>	596
Notes	597
<i>CIGNA Property and Casualty Insurance Co. v. Polaris Pictures Corp</i>	597

Notes	605
<b>Chapter 13 Subrogation</b>	<b>607</b>
A. The Equitable Remedy of Subrogation	607
<i>Merchants' Cotton Press and Storage Company v. Insurance Company North America</i>	607
<i>Liberty Mutual Insurance Co. v. Borsari Tank Corp.</i>	611
Notes	622
<i>Liberty Mutual Insurance Co. v. Altfillisch Construction Co.</i>	623
Notes	628
<b>Chapter 14 "Other Insurance" Clauses</b>	<b>629</b>
A. How Insurers Deal with Multiple Insurance Covering the Same Loss	629
<i>State Farm Mutual Auto Insurance Co. v. Powers</i>	630
Notes	636
1. Excess Clauses	636
<i>Frederick C. Bosco, Pers v. Chris L. Bauermeister</i>	636
Notes	647
<i>Niswonger v. Farm Bureau Town &amp; Country Insurance Co.</i>	647
Notes	658
2. Escape Clauses	659
<i>Allstate Ins. Co. v. Employers Liability Assurance Corp.</i>	659
Notes	665
<i>CSE Ins. Group v. Northbrook Property &amp; Casualty Co.</i>	665
Notes	669
3. Contingent Escape Clauses	669
<i>Broome County Co-Operative Fire Ins. Co. v. Aetna Life &amp; Cas. Co.</i>	669
Notes	672
4. Other "Other Insurance" Clauses	673
B. Resolution of Conflicts Involving "Other Insurance" Clauses	673
<i>Jefferson Insurance Company New York v. Glens Falls Insurance Company et al.</i>	673
Notes	674
1. Excess Clause v. Escape Clause	675
<i>Putnam v. New Amsterdam Cas. Co.</i>	675
Notes	678
<i>Horace Mann Insurance Co. v. Continental Casualty Co.</i>	679
Notes	681
<b>Chapter 15 Mold and Fungi</b>	<b>683</b>
<i>Allison v. Fire Insurance Exchange</i>	683
Notes	713
A. Is Mold Toxic?	714
<i>Centex-Rooney Construction Co. v. Martin County, Florida</i>	714
Notes	721
<b>Chapter 16 Punitive Damages</b>	<b>723</b>
<i>Pacific Mutual Life Insurance Company v. Cleopatra Haslip et al.</i>	723

<i>Pacific Mutual Life Insurance Company, Petitioner v. Cleopatra Haslip Et Al.</i>	724
Notes	754
<i>BMW of North America, Inc. v. Gore</i>	754
Notes	783
<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i>	784
Notes	800
<b>Chapter 17 Preemption and the Power to Control Insurance</b>	<b>801</b>
<i>Unum Life Insurance Co. v. Ward</i>	801
Notes	813
<i>American Insurance Association v. Garamendi</i>	813
Notes	838
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>839</b>
<b>The Author</b>	<b>841</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>843</b>



# Table of Cases

---

This is a list of the cases whose text as written by the court, with some deletions from the official text by the author, can be found in this book ...

- A.A.A. Pool Service & Supply, Inc. v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Co., 232
- Aetna Ins. Co. v. Houston Oil & Transport Co., 340
- Allison v. Fire Insurance Exchange, 683
- Allstate Ins. Co. v. Employers Liability Assurance Corp., 645, 659
- American Insurance Association v. Garamendi, 813
- Beck v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co., 249
- BMW of North America, Inc. v. Gore, 754, 784, 787, 789, 795-796
- Brodkin v. State Farm Fire & Casualty Co., 387
- Broome County Co-Operative Fire Insurance Company v. Aetna Life And Casualty Company Et Al, 669
- Carter v. Boehm, 13, 160, 162, 172, 186, 191
- Center Foundation v. Chicago Insurance Co., 563
- Centex-Rooney Construction v. Martin County, Florida, 714
- Chateau Chamberay Homeowners Assoc. v. Assoc. International Insurance Company, 320
- Chawla v. Transamerica Occidental Life Insurance Co., 178
- Cheeks v. California Fair Plan Association, 532
- Christiansen v. First Insurance Co., 540
- Chubb & Son Inc. v. Consoli, 594
- CIGNA Property and Casualty Insurance Co. v. Polaris Pictures Corp., 597
- City of Burlington v. Indemnity Insurance Company of North America, 377
- Coe v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co., 312
- Comunale v. Traders and General Insurance Co., 192, 193, 196, 198, 199, 200, 207, 209, 213, 214, 218, 219, 225, 315, 324, 627
- Crisci v. Security Insurance Co., 205, 213, 214, 218, 225, 226, 230, 231, 241, 302, 315, 318
- Critz v. Farmers Insurance Group, 197
- CSE Ins. Group v. Northbrook Property & Casualty Co., 665
- Cummings v. Fire Insurance Exchange, 581
- Eckenrode v. Life of America Insurance Co., 227
- Egan v. Mutual of Omaha Insurance Co., 90, 227
- E.M.M.I. Inc. v. Zurich American Insurance Company, 91
- E.R. Squibb & Sons, Inc. v. Lloyd's & Companies, 495
- Farris v. United States Fidelity and Guaranty Co., 235
- Figi v. New Hampshire Insurance Co., 537
- Fireman's Fund Insurance Co. v. Stites, 577
- Frederick C. Bosco, Pers v. Chris L. Bauermeister, K, 636
- Garvey v. State Farm Fire and Casualty Co., 45, 111
- German Alliance Insurance Company v. Lewis, 26, 46
- Gray v. Zurich Insurance Co., 76, 83, 218, 399, 401, 421, 554, 557
- Gruenberg v. Aetna Insurance Co., 191, 211, 233, 239
- Holz Rubber Co. v. American Star Insurance Co., 343
- Horace Mann Insurance Co. v. Continental Casualty Co., 679

- Hormann v. New Hampshire Ins. Co., 242, 248
- Ichthys Inc. v. Guarantee Insurance Co., 591  
Imperial Casualty and Indemnity Co. v. Sogomonian, 159, 162
- Inland Waters Pollution Control Inc. v. National Union Fire Insurance Co., 432  
Insurance Co. v. Forty-Eight Insulations Inc, 481
- J. C. Penney Casualty Insurance Co. v. M. K., 397
- Jefferson Insurance Company New York v. Glens Falls Insurance Company et al., 673
- Keene Corporation v. Insurance Company of North America, 465
- Klubnikin v. California Fair Plan Association, 518
- Liberty Mutual Insurance Co. v. Altfillisch Construction Co, 623
- Liberty Mutual Insurance Co. v. Borsari Tank Corp, 611
- Lighting Fixture Supply Co. v. Fidelity Union Fire Ins. Co., 50–51
- Los Angeles Mutual Insurance Co. v. Cawog, 356
- MacKinnon v. Truck Insurance Exchange, 76, 89
- MBE Collection, Inc. v. Westfield Companies, Inc., 335
- Merchants' Cotton Press and Storage Company v. Insurance Company North America, 607
- Minot Town & Country v. Fireman's Fund Insurance Co, 525
- Moradi-Shalal v. Fireman's Fund Insurance Companies, 304
- Morton International Inc. v. General Accident Insurance Co., 438
- Munn v. National Fire Insurance Co. of Hartford, 518, 527
- National Union Fire Insurance Co. v. Stroh Companies, Inc., 409
- Niswonger v. Farm Bureau Town & Country Insurance Co., 647
- Oak Point Industrial Park v. Massachusetts Bay Insurance Company, 596
- O'Donnell v. Allstate Insurance Co., 282
- Opar v. Allstate Insurance Co., 521
- Pacific Mutual Life Insurance Company v. Cleopatra Haslip et al., 723
- Port Authority of New York and New Jersey v. Affiliated FM Insurance Company, 508
- Prudential-LMI Commercial Insurance v. Superior Court of San Diego County, 132
- Putnam v. New Amsterdam Cas. Co., 675
- Royal Globe Insurance Co. v. Superior Court of Butte County, 292
- Russell v. Williams, 46
- Sabella v. Wisler, 111, 116, 122, 124, 145, 155, 372, 389–390
- San Diego Navy Federal Credit Union v. Cumis Insurance Society Inc., 552
- Shafer v. Berger, Kahn, Shafton, Moss, Figler, Simon & Gladstone, 254
- Simmons v. United Presidential Life Insurance Co., 172
- State Farm Fire and Casualty Co. v. Balmer, 329
- State Farm Fire and Casualty Co. v. Lieth, 369
- State Farm Insurance Companies v. Gerrity, 393
- State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell, 784
- State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Partridge, 149
- State Farm Mutual Auto Insurance Co. v. Powers, 630
- Stipcich v. Metropolitan Life Ins. Co, 185
- Trade Center Properties, L.L.C. v. Hartford Fire Insurance Company, 59, 90
- United States v. Stites, 573, 577
- Unum Life Insurance Co. v. Ward, 801
- White v. Western Title Insurance Co., 83, 273, 304
- Williamson & Vollmer Engineering Inc. v. Sequoia Insurance Co., 360