THE CRIMINALIZATION OF MENTAL ILLNESS
THE CRIMINALIZATION OF MENTAL ILLNESS

CRISIS & OPPORTUNITY FOR THE JUSTICE SYSTEM

Risdon N. Slate
and
W. Wesley Johnson

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina
Dedication

To Claudia and Virginia Slate for your love and support
and
To Dean Shoe for helping me find my voice
and
To Ron Vogel for assisting me in finding the confidence to use it
and
To every person who has ever been knocked down
and
To those, such as Ron Hudson, who have extended a hand to help them up.

Also
To Candy and Arretta Johnson
for riding the roller coaster of life with me and doing it in style
and
To Joe Jacoby, Ben Wright, and Dennis Longmire
who opened doors for me and changed my life
and
To my brothers, Barry and Gerrald and my youngest brother Alan,
who tried his best to fight the demons that haunted his life
and
To the many caring professionals in the mental health and criminal justice
systems that are dedicated to people that are troubled by their own thoughts.
CONTENTS

Foreword xi
Preface xv
Acknowledgments xvii

Chapter 1 • Introduction
References 10

Chapter 2 • The History of Maintaining Order with Persons with Mental Illnesses
Introduction 13
Pre-Civilization Era 14
The Era of Enlightenment 17
The Reform Era 19
Conclusion 23
References 24

Chapter 3 • The Criminalization of Persons with Mental Illnesses
Deinstitutionalization 27
Litigation 28
Thorazine 29
Negative Publicity 30
Anti-Psychiatry Movement 31
Inadequate Community Support: Where are the CMHCs? 33
Lack of Access to Long-Term Care 34
Difficulty Accessing Mental Health Treatment and Cost Shifting 35
Managed Care and Medicaid Reform 36
Difficultly Accessing Treatment upon Community Re-entry from Incarceration 38
Preferred Drug Lists/Restricted Formularies 39
The Haves and the Have Nots 44
Homelessness 46
Stigma 49
Most Persons with Mental Illnesses Are Not Violent 51
Virginia Tech and Its Aftermath 52
Media Influence 54
Less Stigma Improves Treatment Opportunities 57
Negative Side Effects of Medications and Anosognosia 57
Restricting Civil Commitment 58
The Criminal Justice System Has Evolved into the de Facto Mental Health System 59
Prevalence 61
Conclusion 63
References 65

Chapter 4 • The Law Enforcement Response to Persons with Mental Illnesses in Crises 79
Police Encounters with and Perceptions of Persons with Mental Illnesses 82
Police Training and Preparedness for Dealing with Persons with Mental Illnesses in Crises 84
Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department CIT Policy 85
Communication 86
Police Options 87
Conflicting Police Roles 89
Specialized Police/Mental Health Responses to Persons with Mental Illnesses in Crises 92
Mobile Crisis Team—Mental Health-Based Specialized Mental Health Response 92
PERT, MET, SMART, & CSOs—Police-Based Specialized Mental Health Responses 93
CIT—A Police-Based Specialized Police Response 94
Comparisons of the Law Enforcement Response Models 94
The Procedural Fairness of CIT 97
Results of CIT 99
CIT Training 100
Questions of Coerciveness, Stigmatization, and Infringements on Freedom 229
Advance Directives 237
Representative Payees 238
Conditional Release 239
Conservatorship or Guardianship 239
Violence Emphasized 239
Outpatient Commitment Is Ineffective 240
Outpatient Commitment Is Effective 241
The Legal Foundation for Outpatient Commitment 243
Asking for Help and Not Receiving It 247
The Need for Services 249
Conclusion 251
References 253

Chapter 8 • Jail Processing of Persons with Mental Illnesses 261
Mental Health Screening 263
Jail Suicide 265
New Diversion Initiatives 270
Conclusion 277
References 277

Chapter 9 • Dealing with Mental Illness in the Prison Population 281
Problems with Treating the Mentally Ill in Prison 282
Correctional Officers: On the Front Line 287
Mental Health Treatment in Prisons 289
Segregation/Super Max 294
Rising Costs of Incarcerating the Mentally Ill 295
Conclusion 296
References 296

Chapter 10 • Psychological Profiles of Criminal Justice Practitioners: How Experiences and Attitudes Shape the Treatment of Those with Mental Illnesses 301
Introduction 301
Attitudes towards Mentally Ill Offenders and the Criminal Justice System among Mental Health Providers: Biases and the Challenges of Developing a Committed Workforce 302
Assertive Case Management 304
Some Problem Attitudes of Mental Health Professionals 306
Chapter 11 • The Intersection of Mental Illness and Criminal Law

Introduction 321
Legal Competence in Criminal Cases 322
   Competency to Stand Trial 322
   Who Is Responsible for Raising Issues of
      Competency to Stand Trial? 323
What Is the Standard for Determining Competency to Stand Trial? 324
What Happens When a Defendant Is Found Incompetent
   to Stand Trial? 325
The Insanity Defense 326
   Historical Background 326
   The “Hinckley” Backlash 328
   What Happens to People Who Are Found
      Criminally Non-responsible? 329
Informing Juries about the Consequences of Insanity Verdicts 329
   “Guilty but Mentally Ill” 330
The Right of Prisoners to Mental Health Treatment 331
Eighth Amendment Rights 331
Minimally Adequate Treatment 332
Discharge Planning and Re-entry 333
The Eighth Amendment 333
State and Local Statutes 334
The Rights of Prisoners to Refuse Treatment 335
The Right to Refuse Treatment in the Pre-trial Context 336
The Right of Prisoners to Refuse Treatment 338
People with Mental Illnesses and the Death Penalty 339
   The Legal Backdrop 340
Conclusion 342
References 342
## CONTENTS

Chapter 12 • Conclusion: Striving for Informed Policies 347
   Which Way Will the Virginia Tech Crisis Drive Policy? 348
   Who Wants to Take Responsibility for Ending the
   Needless Recycling of Persons with Mental Illnesses
   in and out of the Criminal Justice System? 352
   The System That Wouldn’t Say No Is Beginning to Say No
   Florida Partners in Crisis 355
   Testimony 361
      One-Page Summary Statement of
         Risdon N. Slate, Ph.D., Nami-FL Board Member 362
   Continuing Legislation, Testimony, and Considerations 363
   The Sequential Intercept Model 366
   Other Means for Influencing Policy 367
   Conclusion 369
   References 371

Case Index 377

Name Index 379

Subject Index 395
FOREWORD

By Henry J. Steadman, Ph.D.

In 2008, one in every 100 Americans was in jail or prison. In recent years, U.S. jails booked in approximately 14 million people. Just about five million U.S. citizens were under community correctional supervision in the last U.S. Bureau of Justice Statistics census.

Within these groups, rates of major depression are four times higher than national general population rates for men and 10 times higher for women. For schizophrenia, these rates for justice-involved people are two to three times higher and 10 times higher for bipolar disorders. Further, 75-80% of all these people with serious mental illness have co-occurring substance use disorders.

So what are we going to do? What will provide the groundwork to develop the political will, to equip advocates for the fight, and to frame strategies for adequate response? The answer lies in the content of this comprehensive and timely book by Drs. Slate and Johnson. As the 1999 Surgeon General’s Report on Mental Health clearly demonstrated, we have many technologies to effectively respond to the clinical conditions in question. We know much about what makes people better. Getting it to the people in need in a timely manner is what we are bad about.

A roadmap of where we have been and where we need to get is embedded in this book. There are no simple solutions. Law enforcement can be less confrontational and divert to community-based alternatives. Mental health courts can facilitate the reduction of unnecessary jail detentions. Discharge planning can be implemented to help with continuity of care. However, unless there is a greater commitment to provide the comprehensive and appropriate services these justice-involved people need in the community, all the CIT programs, mental health courts, and discharge planning initiatives will be in vain.

With the framework this book provides, the needs are clear. How we got here is apparent. The complexities of the solutions are starkly visible. In the face of these complexities, we cannot afford to be overwhelmed by the challenges. We must move forward. But how?
Again, the thinking encompassed here blazes the way. Responding to headline events makes for bad public policy. Instead, “... policymakers need to be provided not only with the reasons for implementing policies but also with the numbers to justify their existence” (Slate & Johnson, p. 369). The exceptional, high profile event, while often a catalyst for political action, usually posits the wrong premise on which to build effective policy and practice. The more informed approach, the one taken here by Slate and Johnson, is to look at history and recent data to move towards the thoughtful resolution of competing ideas. As Slate and Johnson emphasize, “… the cost to ‘do it right’ will be enormous, but the cost of not doing so, both in terms of human suffering and financially, is even greater” (p. 370).

In the end, doing right for justice-involved persons with mental illness, for the administrators of the systems of care and detention, for the caring clinicians who are all too often overwhelmed by inadequate resources, and for the general public is made much more likely by an understanding of these issues as laid out in this book. What is “right” really does benefit all the relevant parties; this is eminently clear from the ideas and information included in this book. Kudos!
Preface

Wesley Johnson and Risdon Slate met in a South Carolina prison in 1985. Wes was a professor bringing students for a tour, and Ris was the prison administrator who served as tour guide. It would be some nine years later in a strip cell in the Richland County South Carolina Jail that the seeds for this book would be planted.

For a myriad of reasons the criminal justice system has become the de facto mental health system, with the three largest inpatient psychiatric institutions in America being jails - not hospitals. This book explores how and why this is the case. Too often crises have driven missives in the interface between the mental health and criminal justice systems. Waiting for sensationalized cases to influence policy can lead to impulsively enacted and misguided interventions.

Persons with mental illnesses are disproportionately coming into contact with the criminal justice system, a system that has been largely ill equipped to deal with such individuals. Many in both the mental health and criminal justice systems don’t see it as their job or responsibility to intervene. However, today some criminal justice practitioners, often faced with inadequate treatment resources, are taking the lead in seeking innovative alternatives for linking justice involved persons with mental illnesses to mental health treatment. These initiatives are taking place in both pre and post booking formats and may engage law enforcement, the courts, corrections, and/or probation/parole authorities in collaborative partnerships that often involve persons with mental illnesses, their family members, and mental health treatment providers. Various examples are presented in this book.

Topics covered in the book run the gamut from specialized law enforcement responses, to mental health courts, to jails and prisons, to discharge planning, diversion, re-entry, and outpatient commitment. An examination of criminal justice practitioners who become mentally ill is also considered, and the standard topics of insanity and competency are addressed. The balance between preserving civil liberties and maintaining public safety is emphasized. The need
for adequate mental health treatment services and the compilation of outcome data to establish evidence-based practices while maintaining allegiance to the concept of therapeutic jurisprudence is stressed. Real-life illustrative vignettes from professionals engaged in dispensing justice to persons with mental illnesses are included throughout.

It is our belief that this book can serve a multitude of purposes. We hope it educates college students who may one day act as positive change agents in this interface of the mental health and criminal justice systems. We also believe this book can be of benefit to training academies, criminal justice practitioners and mental health providers in identifying and assessing what feasible alternatives are in existence and how to develop comprehensive services. This book also provides guidance for advocates, persons with mental illnesses and their family members to use in their advocacy. Lastly, this book should be used to inform policymakers.

Risdon N. Slate
W. Wesley Johnson
Acknowledgments

Special thanks are in order for Hank Steadman for his expertise through the years and his willingness to write the insightful foreword. Ron Hudson once said that meeting Jackson Browne must be like meeting Buddha. Hank Steadman writing the foreword was like having Buddha write it. We are also honored to have Xavier Amador provide an endorsement as well. His work has provided profound insight and understanding regarding persons with mental illnesses. We keep waiting for the Dr. X television show, and we hope to be among his first guests.

We would like to thank our friends and colleagues who have provided understanding and/or levity: Pat Anderson, Bruce Darby, Mike Denham, Bill and Melody Gregory, Frank Hodges, Sharon Masters, Ed Plowman, and Pat Smith. Also, a thank you is due to Dean Susan Conner and President Anne Kerr at Florida Southern College and Lisa Nored at the University of Southern Mississippi for their appreciation and support of scholarship. On the home front, Claudia Slate provided comfort and expert editing skills. Thanks also to Rhonda Hickey at USM for hours of work on the index and chores that enabled us to bring the book to print.

We are indebted to the Carolina Academic Press team beginning with Jennifer Whaley and continuing with Karen Clayton, who has done an excellent job with editing, Beth Hall (communications), and Tim Colton (cover design). In particular, we are grateful to Keith Sipe for his appreciation of this project and his willingness to give it a try.

We are pleased to have expert contributions by distinguished professionals, as one chapter was written by Ron Honberg, and Dick Lamb, Anand Pandya, and Suzanne Vogel-Scibilia contributed another chapter. Also, various professionals when asked submitted significant input regarding their personal experiences with the interface of the mental health and criminal justice systems, and we are pleased to include these offerings from Sam Cochran, Ginger Lerner-Wren, Stephanie Rhoades, Angela Cowden, Mark Heath, Michele Saunders, Barbara Lewis, Tony Rolón, John Thomason, Paul Michaud, Kendall Wiley,
Joyce Wilde, Jack Richards, Brian Garrett, Jim Rice, Louise Pyers, Denise Spratt, and Anne Marie Wendel. Stephen Bacallao and Peggy Symons are to be commended for their tenacity and sharing their bureaucratic battle with us. Thanks also to Grady Judd for his commitment to CIT and willingness to explore alternatives to the incarceration of persons with mental illnesses. Two fellow travelers who know something about turning crisis into opportunity, Jack Gillen and Bob Carolla, are recognized for all their good works.

Larry Thompson thankfully early on provided research documents from his archives, and John Petrila provided information as well. Friends who have offered encouragement before, during, and/or after this project include Carl Reed, Jacki Buffington-Vollum, Mike Mathes, Steve Leifman, Mike Thompson, Arlene Stoltz, Dennis Longmire, Randy Garner, and David Lauterbach. Thanks are also in order to the entire NAMI family. Terry Wells would have likely been involved in this project if he were still with us, but in many ways his presence was felt.

Risdon N. Slate—Lakeland, Florida
W. Wesley Johnson—Hattiesburg, Mississippi
— Huntsville, Texas
or somewhere between