# Family Law in the World Community

Carolina Academic Press Law Casebook Series Advisory Board

#### Ĩ

Gary J. Simson, Chairman Case Western Reserve University School of Law

> John C. Coffee, Jr. Columbia University Law School

Randall Coyne University of Oklahoma College of Law

> Paul Finkelman Albany Law School

Robert M. Jarvis Shepard Broad Law Center Nova Southeastern University

Vincent R. Johnson St. Mary's University School of Law

Michael A. Olivas University of Houston Law Center

Kenneth L. Port William Mitchell College of Law

H. Jefferson Powell Duke University School of Law

Michael P. Scharf Case Western Reserve University School of Law

> Peter M. Shane Michael E. Moritz College of Law The Ohio State University

> > Emily L. Sherwin Cornell Law School

John F. Sutton, Jr. Emeritus, University of Texas School of Law

David B. Wexler John E. Rogers College of Law, University of Arizona University of Puerto Rico School of Law

# Family Law in the World Community

### Cases, Materials, and Problems in Comparative and International Family Law

Second Edition

#### D. Marianne Blair

Professor of Law University of Tulsa

#### Merle H. Weiner

Philip H. Knight Professor of Law University of Oregon

#### **Barbara Stark**

Professor of Law Hofstra Law School

### Solangel Maldonado

Professor of Law Seton Hall Law School

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2009 D. Marianne Blair Merle H. Weiner Barbara Stark Solangel Maldonado All Rights Reserved

ISBN: 978-1-59460-560-4 LCCN: 2009929785

Carolina Academic Press 700 Kent Street Durham, North Carolina 27701 Telephone (919) 489-7486 Fax (919) 493-5668 www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

For my parents, Marilyn and Joel.

-Merle

This book is dedicated to Sean, whose creativity, courage, and humor inspire me, to Sarah, whose affectionate nature, perception, and determination bring me joy, to Meagan, whose smile I will always treasure, and to Chris, who has stood by me through the laughter and tears, and without whom I would never have fully known the fulfillment family can bring. With all my love,

—Marianne

For Karl and Sam.

—Barbara

For Carlos.

-Solangel

## Contents

Table of Cases	xxi
Preface for Instructors	XXXV
Acknowledgments	xxxvii
Part One Family Formation, Regulation, and Dissolution	
Chapter 1 • Introduction to the Study of Family Law in the World Community A. An Introduction to Comparative Law	3 3
1. Why Study Comparative Law?	4
Nora V. Demleitner, Combating Legal Ethnocentrism	8
Problem 1-1 2. What Is Comparative Family Law?	10 11
John C. Reitz, How to Do Comparative Law	11
Shirley S. Abrahamson & Michael J. Fischer, All the World's a	11
Courtroom: Judging in the New Millennium	18
Problem 1-2	10
Marckx v. Belgium	20
Notes and Questions	20
Johan Meeusen, Judicial Disapproval of Discrimination against	
Illegitimate Children	28
B. An Introduction to International Law	30
1. Overview of International Law	31
a. Sources of International Law	31
b. Explicit Agreements	32
Frederic L. Kirgis, International Agreements and U.S. Law	40
Notes	42
c. Customary International Law	43
d. General Principles of International Law	45
Notes and Questions	47
Problem 1-3	48
Notes	50
e. Enforcing Human Rights Norms in U.S. Courts	51
Kenneth Roth, The Charade of U.S. Ratification of International	
Human Rights Treaties	51
Note	53

Jack Goldsmith, Should International Human Rights Law Trump	
U.S. Domestic Law	53
Problem 1-4	56
Notes	56
2. International Institutions	58
a. United Nations	59
b. The Hague Conference on Private International Law	61
c. Council of Europe	62
L. v. Finland	66
Notes and Questions	72
d. European Union	77
e. Organization of American States	80
f. African Union	83
Problem 1-5	86
Notes and Questions	87
Chapter 2 • Regulation of Marriage	89
A. The Importance of Marriage	89
Claude Levi-Strauss, The Family, in Man, Culture, and Society	89
Joan A. Metge, Marriage in Modern Māori Society	90
B. The Power to Regulate Marriage	92
1. Customary Law	92
David L. Chambers, Civilizing the Natives: Customary Marriage	
in Post-Apartheid South Africa	93
Notes and Questions	95
Suen Toi Lee v. Yau Yee Ping	98
Problem 2-1	99
Kalyton v. Kalyton	100
Notes and Questions	102
Janet Kabeberi-Macharia & Celestine Nyamu, Marriage by	
Affidavit: Developing Alternative Laws on Cohabitation	100
in Kenya	102
2. Religious Law	104
In re Marriage of Vryonis	107
Notes and Questions	110
3. Constitutional Law	113
a. Constitutional Allocation of Power between the Legislative	112
Branches	113
b. Constitutional Allocation of Power between the Judiciaries	114
Notes and Questions	116
4. International Law	116 116
Universal Declaration of Human Rights [UDHR]	110
1956 Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade and Institutions and Practices Similar to	
	117
Slavery Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination	11/
against Women	118
Fact Sheet No. 23, Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the	110
Health of Women and Children, Office of the High	
Commission for Human Rights	119
Commission for Frankin Rights	

viii

Report of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination	
against Women	120
Report of the Committee on Progress Achieved in the	
Implementation of the Convention: Note by the Secretariat	120
Notes and Questions	121
Problem 2-2	122
C. Procedural Requirements for Entry into Marriage	123
1. France: Age, Consent, Banns, and Compulsory Civil Ceremony	123
The French Civil Code (1804)	123
Civil Code of Québec, Book Two	125
Notes and Questions	126
Karl August Prinz Von Sachsen-Gessaphe, Concubinage in Mexico	127
2. The Importance of Formalities	128
Chief Adjudication Officer v. Kirpal Kaur Bath	128
Notes and Questions	130
D. Mail-Order Marriages	131
1. The Factual Background	132
Robert J. Scholes & Anchalee Phataralaoha, The "Mail-Order	100
Bride" Industry and Its Impact on U.S. Immigration	132
Suzanne H. Jackson, Marriages of Convenience: International	
Marriage Brokers, "Mail-Order Brides," and Domestic	
Servitude	133
Notes and Questions	134
Kerry Abrams, Immigration Law and the Regulation of Marriage Robert J. Scholes & Anchalee Phataralaoha, The "Mail-Order	134
Bride" Industry and Its Impact on U.S. Immigration	135
2. Legal Responses of Countries of Destination	137
Suzanne H. Jackson, Marriages of Convenience: International	
Marriage Brokers, "Mail-Order Brides," and Domestic	
Servitude	137
3. Legal Responses of Countries of Origin	139
Republic Act No. 6955 (1990)	139
Republic Act No. 9208 (2003)	140
Notes and Questions	141
4. International Legal Responses	142
a. Discrimination against Women	142
CEDAW General Recommendation No. 21, ¶16	142
b. Trafficking	143
Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United	
Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime	143
Notes and Questions	143
c. Slavery	144
Problem 2-4	144
Chapter Three • Dissolution of Marriage: A Continuing Conundrum	147
A. Historical Origins of Western Law of Dissolution: From Customary to	
Religious to State Control	148
Mary Ann Glendon, The Transformation of Family Law	148
Notes and Questions	153

	Notes and Questions	155
B. Contem	porary Divorce Reform	156
	ern Divorce Reform in the United States	156
	Riley v. Riley	158
	Mo. Ann. Stat. §452.320	160
	La. Rev. Stat. Ann §9:307	161
	Problem 3-1	163
2. Divor	ce Reform in England	164
	Matrimonial Causes Act, 1973, c.18	165
	Problem 3-2	168
	Notes and Questions	168
3. Divor	ce Reform in the Republic of Ireland	170
	Article 41—The Family	172
	McA v. McA	173
	Problem 3-3	175
	Notes and Questions	176
4. A Gli	mpse of Divorce Reform Around Europe—And Around the World	179
2	a. Western Europe	179
	Notes and Questions	182
ł	o. East Asia	184
	Notes and Questions	188
	c. Africa	189
5. The I	Debate Continues	189
	ersection of Religion and the State in Contemporary Regulation	
of Divor	rce	191
1. Natio	ns Delegating Exclusive Control of Civil Marital Status to the State	192
	Williams v. Williams	192
	Note	193
	Avitzur v. Avitzur	194
	Notes and Questions	195
	Marcovitz v. Bruker	198
	Notes and Questions	201
2. Natio	ns Regulating Termination of Marriage through Religious Norms	
or In	stitutions	203
8	a. Unitary Systems and Islamic Law	203
ł	o. Pluralistic Personal Law Systems	206
	Notes and Questions	206
	Problem 3-4	209
	Problem 3-5	210
Chapter 4 • 1	Domestic Partnerships and Same-Sex Marriage	211
-	ic Partnerships	211
A. Doniest	Kelly Kollman, Same-Sex Unions: The Globalization of an Idea	211
	Notes and Questions	211
	Pacté Civil de Solidarite	215
	Notes and Questions	215
	Problem 4-1	210
R Same Se	ex Marriage	218
D. Same-Se	Notes and Questions	219
	TIOTO MIN QUEDUDID	1

х

Minister of Home Affairs and Another v. Fourie	224
In re Marriage Cases	230
Notes and Questions	232
Civil Marriage Act	234
Government Gazette, Republic of South Africa	236
Notes and Questions	237
Problem 4-2	238
C. International Human Rights and Same-Sex Couples	239
1. The European Court of Human Rights	239
Application No. 40016/98 Karner v. Austria	239
2. European Union	240
Arthur S. Leonard, European Court Victory for Same-Sex Partners	241
3. Organization of American States	242
4. United Nations Human Rights System	243
Introduction to the Yogyakarta Principles	244
Problem 4-3	246
Chapter 5 • Recognition of Foreign Marriages and Divorces	247
A. Recognition of Marriages and Alternative Partnerships	247
Leszinske v. Poole	248
People v. Ezeonu	250
Farah v. Farah	251
Notes and Questions	253
American Airlines, Inc. v. Mejia	260
Notes and Questions	262
Problems	265
B. Recognition of Foreign Marriage Dissolutions and Related Orders	267
1. Status Termination	267
Maklad v. Maklad	267
In the Matter of the Estate of Ian A. Pringle	269
Notes and Questions	271
Т.Т. <i>v. К.А.</i>	277
2. Property Division and Alimony	278
Aleem v. Aleem	278
Notes and Questions	280
Problems	288
Chapter 6 • Violence between Family Members	291
A. Violence and Context	291
1. Differences	292
2. Similarities	295
Jeffrey Fagan & Angela Brown, Violence between Spouses and	
Intimates: Physical Aggression between Women and Men	
in Intimate Relationships	295
INS Asylum and Withholding Definitions	295
World Health Organization, The World Report on Violence	
and Health	296
Report of the Secretary General, In-Depth Study on All Forms	
of Violence against Women	296

xi

World Health Organization, Preventing Violence: A Guide to	
Implementing the Recommendations of the World Report	
on Violence and Health	296
B. Family Violence as a Human Rights Issue in the United Nations' System	297
1. Traditional Human Rights Approaches	297
Dorothy Q. Thomas & Michele E. Beasley, Domestic Violence	
as a Human Rights Issue	297
Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women	299
Jan Arno Hessbruegge, Human Rights Violations Arising From	
Conduct of Non-State Actors	299
The Due Diligence Standard as a Tool for the Elimination of	
Violence against Women	301
Notes and Questions	302
2. Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination	
against Women	304
Sally Engle Merry, Constructing a Global Law—Violence against	
Women and the Human Rights System	305
Goekce v. Austria	306
Notes and Questions	311
San Francisco, Ca., 1 Admin. Code ch. 12K, §12K.3(b)	313
3. Convention against Torture	313
a. State Responsibility for Private Acts	314
Ali v. Reno	314
Notes and Questions	316
b. Torture	318
Rhonda Copelon, Recognizing the Egregious in the Everyday:	
Domestic Violence as Torture	319
Notes and Questions	319
4. Platforms for Action, Declarations, and Reports of the Special Rapporteur	322
Berta Esperanza Hernandez-Truyol, Sex, Culture, and Rights:	
A Re/Conceptualization of Violence for the Twenty-First	
Century	322
Notes and Questions	323
C. Regional Approaches	325
1. Convention of Belém do Pará	325
Maria da Penha Maia Fernandes	326
Notes and Questions	334
2. European Convention on Human Rights	341
Z and Others v. United Kingdom	341
Bevacqua and S. v. Bulgaria	342
Notes and Questions	346
3. Maputo Protocol	349
4. Arab Charter on Human Rights	350
D. Customary International Law	350
Rhonda Copelon, Recognizing the Egregious in the Everyday:	250
Domestic Violence as Torture	350
Notes and Questions Problem 6-1	351 353
E. Expanding the Analysis	353

CO	NT	<b>EN</b>	ITS

1.	Female Genital Mutilation: The Practice	353
	Fact Sheet No. 23, Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the	
	Health of Women and Children	354
2.	The Universality of Human Rights	357
	Katherine Brennan, Note, The Influence of Cultural Relativism on	
	International Human Rights Law: Female Circumcision as a	
	Case Study	357
	Makau Mutua, Savages, Victims, and Saviors: The Metaphor of	
	Human Rights	358
	Douglas Lee Donoho, Relativism Versus Universalism in Human	
	Rights: The Search for Meaningful Standards	358
	Justice Albie Sachs, Introduction to The Changing Family:	
	International Perspectives on the Family and Family Law	359
	Sally Engle Merry, Constructing a Global Law—Violence against	
	Women and the Human Rights System	360
_	Notes and Questions	360
3.	National Legal Responses	364
	a. Egypt's Approach	364
	Susan A. Dillon, Comment, Yoni in the Land of Isis:	
	Female Genital Mutilation Is Banned (Again) in Egypt	364
	Notes and Questions	367
	b. The United States' Approach	369
	Problem 6-2	371
	Adoption of Peggy	371
	Notes and Questions	372
	In re R-A	374
	Islam v. Secretary of State for the Home Dep't	378
	Notes and Questions	380 383
	Asylum & Withholding Definitions Problem 6-3	385
	FIODIeIII 0-5	303

#### Part Two

Rights and Responsibilities of Parents, Children, and the State

Chapter 7 • Custody: A Comparative Prologue	389
A. Decision-Makers and Private Ordering	390
B. Determining "Best Interests"—Permissible Factors and Considerations	394
1. Gender	395
Bolaji Owasanoye, The Regulation of Child Custody and Access	
in Nigeria	399
Note	400
Problem 7-1	401
Problem 7-2	401
Notes and Questions	403
D. Marianne Blair & Merle H. Weiner, Resolving Parental Custody	
Disputes—A Comparative Exploration	403
2. Religion	405
Hoffmann v. Austria	406
Notes and Questions	409

3. Race	413
Van de Perre v. Edwards	414
Notes and Questions	421
4. Children's Preferences	422
C. v. Finland	424
Notes and Questions	427
Problem 7-3	429
Chapter 8 • Child Abduction, Jurisdiction, and Enforcement in International	
Custody Disputes	431
A. The Hague Convention on the Civil Aspects of International Child	
Abduction	432
1. Wrongful Removal and Retention	433
a. Habitual Residence	433
Mozes v. Mozes	433
Notes and Questions	439
Problem 8-1	440
Problem 8-2	441
b. Rights of Custody	443
Whallon v. Lynn	443
Notes and Questions	446
Croll v. Croll	449
Notes and Questions	455
Problem 8-3	458
c. Actual Exercise	458
Friedrich v. Friedrich	458
Notes and Questions	461
2. The Defenses a. Grave Risk of Harm	461 461
Blondin v. Dubois	461
Blondin v. Dubois	461
Blondin v. Dubois	469
Notes and Questions	409
b. Children's Objection to Return	480
England v. England	480
Notes and Questions	483
c. Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	486
Freier v. Freier	487
Notes and Questions	488
d. Consent or Acquiescence to the Removal	489
In re Ponath	489
Notes and Questions	490
e. One Year Elapsed from the Date of Wrongful Removal	491
Wojcik v. Wojcik	491
Lops v. Lops	494
Notes and Questions	497
Problems	499
B. Jurisdiction in International Custody Disputes and Enforcement of	
Foreign Orders	500

xiv

1. U.S. Domestic Law	501
a. Jurisdictional Bases, Forum Non Conveniens, and Simultaneous	
Proceedings	502
In re Marriage of Reeman and Vikas Sareen	502
Notes and Questions	506
Problems	514
b. Modification and Enforcement Proceedings	515
White v. Harrison-White	516
Note and Questions	519
Susan L. v. Steven L.	521
Notes and Questions	524
Hosain v. Malik	528
Notes and Questions	537
Problems	540
2. International Conventions	542
a. 1996 Convention for the Protection of Children	542
Problems	544
Notes	544 545
	545 545
b. Regional Conventions and Regulations Notes	545 547
C. Other Remedies to Prevent or Respond to Abduction 1. Preventative Measures and Immediate Deterrence	549 540
Al-Silham v. Al-Silham	549 549
Notes and Questions	551
Long v. Ardestani	553
Notes and Questions	560
Patricia E. Apy, Managing Child Custody Cases Involving	5(2
Non-Hague Contracting States	563
Notes	565
2. Sanctions and Tort Liability	567
a. International Parental Kidnaping Crime Act and Other Federal	
Sanctions	567
United States v. Fazal-Ur-Raheman-Fazal	567
Notes and Questions	571
b. Additional Remedies under State Law	576
Anyanwu v. Anyanwu	576
Notes and Questions	582
c. Self Help and Other Options	584
Patricia E. Apy, Managing Child Custody Cases Involving	
Non-Hague Contracting States	584
Notes and Questions	585
Chapter Q. Financial Support of Children	590
Chapter 9 • Financial Support of Children	589
A. Who Must Support Children?	590
Chartier v. Chartier John Folgleen And Depents Monally Obliged to Constant Their	590
John Eekelaar, Are Parents Morally Obliged to Care for Their	E0.4
Children?	594
Notes and Questions Problem 9-1	596
F1001C111 7-1	599

xv

B. Parent-State Relationship for the Support of Children	600
1. Income Transfers/Family Allowances	600
Notes and Questions	604
Problem 9-2	608
2. Child Support Assurance	608
Notes and Questions	609
Problem 9-3	611
3. Departing from the Guidelines	611
a. Parents' Ability to Opt-Out of the Child Support Guidelines	611
i. Absence of a Child Support Order	612
Close v. Close	613
Notes and Questions	614
Solangel Maldonado, Deadbeat or Deadbroke: Redefining Child	
Support for Poor Fathers	614
ii. Private Agreements and Child Support Guidelines	616
Notes and Questions	618
Hyde v. Commissioner of Inland Revenue	619
b. Courts' Discretion to Depart from the Guidelines	621
Lyon v. Wilcox	621
Notes and Questions	624
Chapter 10 • Establishing and Enforcing Child Support Orders Transnationally	627
A. U.S. Participation in International Agreements	628
1. Foreign Reciprocating Countries	628
2. State Reciprocity Arrangements	629
3. 2007 Hague Maintenance Convention	630
B. Establishing, Enforcing, and Modifying Child Support Orders in U.S.	
Tribunals on Behalf of Residents of Foreign Nations	632
1. Establishing an Initial Support Order	635
Gladis v. Gladisova	636
Notes	640
2. Simultaneous Proceedings	641
3. Enforcing a Foreign Order in a U.S. Tribunal	642
Country of Luxembourg, on Behalf of Ana Ribeiro v. Canderas	642
Notes and Questions	645
4. Modification Restrictions	653
Grave v. Shubert	654
Notes and Questions	655
C. Enforcing U.S. Support Orders Abroad	661
Problems	662
D. Multilateral Child Support Agreements around the Globe	665
Note	666
Chapter 11 • Adoption: A Comparative Exploration	669
A. A Glimpse of Adoption across Time and Culture	670
Laura J. Schwartz, Models for Parenthood in Adoption Law:	-
The French Conception	674
Note and Questions	675
B. Termination of Parental Rights	676
1. Giving and Revoking Voluntary Consent	677

xvi

N v. Health Service Executive	678
Notes and Questions	684
2. Rights of Putative Fathers	685
Lehr v. Robertson	686
Keegan v. Ireland	689
Notes and Questions	692
Problem 11-1	695
C. Maintaining Links with the Family of Origin	695
Cheskes v. Ontario	702
I.O'T. v. B.	705
Notes and Questions	708
Odièvre v. France	711
Notes and Questions	713
Problem 11-2	714
Chapter 12 • International Adoption	717
A. Intercountry Adoption: Benevolent Option or Last Resort?	718
Problem 12-1	720
Elizabeth Bartholet, International Adoption: Propriety, Prospects and Pragmatics	720
Twila Perry, Transracial and International Adoption: Mothers,	720
Hierarchy, Race, and Feminist Legal Theory	724
Sara Dillon, Making Legal Regimes for Intercountry Adoption	, 2 1
Reflect Human Rights Principles: Transforming the United	
Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child with the	
Hague Convention on Intercountry Adoption	727
David M. Smolin, Intercountry Adoption and Poverty: A Human	, 2,
Rights Analysis	729
Susan R. Harris, Race, Search, and My Baby-Self: Reflections of a	, _ >
Transracial Adoptee	729
Susan Soon-Keum Cox, Ritual	731
Notes and Questions	732
D. Marianne Blair, Safeguarding the Interests of Children in	
Intercountry Adoption: Assessing the Gatekeepers	736
Notes and Questions	737
Problem 12-2	741
B. Regulation of International Adoption by International Conventions	742
1. U.N. Conventions	742
2. The Hague Intercountry Adoption Convention	744
a. Central Authorities	744
b. Accredited Agencies and Approved Persons	745
c. Convention Requirements for the Adoption Process	748
d. Recognition of Convention Adoptions and U.S. Certification	
Procedures	752
Notes and Questions	753
Problems	758
C. Adopting a Child from Abroad — The Process	760
1. Role of Adoption Agencies and Lawyers	760
2. U.S. Immigration Requirements	763
a. Eligibility for Immediate Relative Status for an Orphan	764

xvii

Description Description	765
0	765
Notes and Questions	767
b. Eligibility for Immediate Relative Status for a Hague Convention	
Adoption	769
Problem 12-6	770
Notes and Questions	770
c. Process for Obtaining Orphan and Convention Visas	771
Note	776
d. Eligibility and Process for Obtaining Immediate Relative Status	
1	776
	777
	780
3. Citizenship	783
4. Adoption, Readoption, and Recognition of Foreign Orders in U.S. Courts	784
a. Initial Adoption in U.S. Court	784
b. Readoption in a U.S. Court	785
c. Recognition of Foreign Adoption Decrees by U.S. Courts	785
Problems	786
1 1 0	789
	789
1. International Population Issues	789
Reed Boland, Symposium on Population Law: The Environment,	
Population, and Women's Human Rights	791
Paula Abrams, Population Politics: Reproductive Rights and	
U.S. Asylum Policy	792
2. An Overview of Reproductive Rights	793
Barbara Stark, Reproductive Rights and Abortion	793
Barbara Stark, Crazy Jane Talks with the Bishop: Abortion in China	,
Germany, South Africa and International Human Rights	793
General Recommendation No. 24, Report of the Committee	
	796
	797
3. The Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa	797
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	798
	799
1. Pro-Natalist Policies	799
	800
	800
	800
Janet Larsen, Iran's Birth Rate Plummeting at Record Pace:	
	800
	802
	803
	803
Xiaorong Li, License to Coerce: Violence against Women, State	
Responsibility, and Legal Failures in China's Family-Planning	
	803
Population and Family Planning Law of the People's Republic	555
	805
or online	555

xviii

Information Office of The State Council of the People's Republic	
of China, Human Rights in China	806
Notes and Questions	808
Problem 13-1	811
Notes and Questions	811
More on Asylum	812
Notes and Questions	813
Problem 13-2	814
Problem 13-3	814
C. Abortion	815
Barbara Stark, Reproductive Rights and Abortion	815
Note and Questions	815
1. Municipal Approaches	816
a. Canada	816
b. El Salvador	818
c. Lebanon	819
Problem 13-4	820
Notes and Questions	820
2. Regional Approaches	821
a. Europe	821
b. The Americas	822
c. Africa	822
Notes and Questions	822
3. International Law	823
Notes and Questions	824
Chapter 14 • Children's Human Rights within the Family	827
A. Convention on the Rights of the Child	827
Jaap E. Doek, What Does the Children's Convention Require?	828
Notes and Questions	833
Michael King, Against Children's Rights	835
B. Children's Rights in the United States and South Africa	836
1. Children's Rights in the United States	836
Barbara Bennett Woodhouse, The Constitutionalization of	000
Children's Rights: Incorporating Emerging Human Rights	
into Constitutional Doctrine	836
Martin Guggenheim, Ratify the U.N. Convention on the	000
Rights of the Child, But Don't Expect Any Miracles	837
Notes and Questions	840
2. Children's Rights in South Africa	841
Constitution of the Republic of South Africa	841
Tshepo L. Mosikatsana, Children's Rights and Family Autonomy	011
in the South African Context: A Comment on Children's	
Rights under the Final Constitution	842
Julia Sloth-Nielsen, Chicken Soup or Chainsaws: Some	
Implications of the Constitutionalisation of Children's Rights	
in South Africa	843
Notes and Questions	844
Government of the Republic of South Africa v. Grootboom	847

Notes and Questions	862
C. Corporal Punishment	865
1. The Committee's General Comment	865
The Committee's General Comment on Corporal Punishment	865
2. The Special Expert's Report	868
Paulo Sérgio Penheiro, World Report on Violence against	
Children	868
3. Domestic Law and Law Reform Efforts	869
Penny Booth, The United Nations Convention on the Rights of	
the Child and the Punishment of Children under English	
Law—Public and Private Vices?	869
Katie Sykes, Bambi Meets Godzilla: Children's and Parent's	
Rights in Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and	
the Law	870
Penny Booth, The United Nations Convention on the Rights of	
the Child and the Punishment of Children under English	
Law—Public and Private Vices?	872
Notes and Questions	874
Committee on the Rights of the Child, Consideration of	
Reports Submitted by States Parties	875
Note and Questions	876
Committee on the CRC—Comments on State Reports	
Regarding Corporal Punishment	876
Notes and Questions	878

Index

881

### **Table of Cases**

Principal cases are set in bold, while cases cited in the text and in the authors' notes are set in roman type. Where a principal case is also referenced elsewhere in the text, the principal pages are also bolded.

A. v. R., [1999] N.Z.F.L.R. 249, 597

- A. v. United Kingdom, 27 Eur. H.R. Rep. 611 (1999), 346, 874, 878
- A.D. v. D.W., 2008 (4) BCLR 359 (CC) (S. Afr.), 754–55

Abargil v. Abargil, 131 Cal. Rptr. 2d 429 (Cal. Ct. App. 2003), 561

Abbott v. Abbott, 542 F. 3d 1081 (5th Cir. 2008), 456

Abdullahi v. Pfizer, Inc., 562 F.3d 163 (2d Cir. 2009), 57

Abdul-Rahmen Omar Adra v. Clift, 195 F. Supp. 857 (D. Md. 1961), 58

Abouzahr v. Matera-Abouzahr, 824 A.2d 268 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 2003), 561

- Adams v. Adams, 869 A.2d 124 (Vt. 2005), 275
- Adoption of Christian A., 2004 WL 729071 (Cal. Ct. App. April 6, 2004), 526
- Adoption of Luis A.L.W., 620 N.Y.S.2d 219 (N.Y. Surr. Ct. 1994), 785

Adoption of Peggy, 767 N.E.2d 29 (Mass. 2002), 371–72

Adoption of W.A.T. v. Fischer, 808 P.2d 1083 (Utah 1991), 112

- Adoteye v. Adoteye, 527 S.E.2d 453 (Va. Ct. App. 2000), 286
- Aflalo v. Aflalo, 658 A.2d 523 (N.J. Super. Ct. Ch. Div. 1996), 197
- Agostini v. Felton, 521 U.S. 203 (1997), 405
- Aguirre-Cervantes v. INS, 242 F.3d 1169 (9th Cir. 2001), 382–83

Ahmad v. Ahmad, 2001 WL 1518116 (Ohio Ct. App. Nov. 30, 2001), 281

Ahmed v. Ahmed, 261 S.W.3d 190 (Tex. App. 2008), 281

- Airey v. Ireland, 32 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) (1979), 346
- Aker Verdal A/S v. Lampson, 828 P.2d 610 (Wash. Ct. App. 1992), 651
- Akileh v. Elchahal, 666 So. 2d 246 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1996), 281
- Akinci-Unal v. Unal, 832 N.E.2d 1 (Mass. App. Ct. 2005), 283–84
- Al Fassi v. Al Fassi, 433 So. 2d 664 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1983), 538
- Al Silham v. Al Silham, 1994 WL 102480 (Ohio Ct. App. Mar. 25, 1994), 549–51
- Al Silham v. Al Silham,1995 WL 803808 (Ohio Ct. App. Nov. 24, 1995), 551–52
- Aldinger v. Segler, 263 F. Supp. 2d 284 (D. Puerto Rico 2003), 525
- Aleem v. Aleem, 947 A.2d 489 (Md. 2008), 272, 274, 278–80, 282, 284
- Ali v. Ali, 652 A.2d 253 (N.J. Super. Ct. Ch. Div. 1994), 513, 538
- Ali v. Reno, 237 F.3d 591 (6th Cir. 2001), 314–16
- Alma Society v. Mellon, 601 F.2d 1225 (2d Cir. 1979), 699–700, 709
- Alonzo v. Claudino, 2007 WL 475340 (M.D. N.C. Feb. 7, 2007), 442
- Alton v. Alton, 207 F.2d 667 (3d Cir. 1953), vacated as moot, 347 U.S. 610 (1954), 273

- American Airlines v. Mejia, 766 So. 2d 305 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2000), 260–62, 263
- American Online Dating Ass'n v. Gonzalez, NO. 3-06-cv-123 (S.D. Ohio May 25, 2006), 143
- Amin v. Bakhaty, 798 So. 2d 75 (La. 2001), 513
- Ammini Ej v. UOI, 82 AIR Ker 252 (Kerala H.C. 1995) (India), 177
- Amsellem v. Amsellem, 730 N.Y.S.2d 212 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 2001), 257
- Ananor v. Ashcroft, 364 F.3d 1013 (9th Cir. 2004), 317
- Ankenbrandt v. Richards, 504 U.S. 689 (1992), 115
- Antunez-Fernandes v. Connors-Fernandes, 292 F. Supp. 2d 800 (N.D. Iowa 2003), 498
- Anyanwu v. Anyanwu, 771 A.2d 672 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 2001), *cert. denied*, 788 A.2d 773 (N.J. 2001), 401–02, 576–82
- Apthorp v. Shearing, [1998] 42 R.F.L.4th 287 (Ont. Div. Ct. 1998), 596
- Armstrong v. Manzo, 380 U.S. 545 (1965), 677
- Arnold v. Harari, 772 N.Y.S.2d 727 (N.Y. App. Div. 2004), 507
- Arteaga v. Tex. Dept. of Prot. & Reg. Serv., 924 S.W.2d 756 (Tex. App. 1996), 514
- Attorney General v. X, [1992] I.R. 1, 16 (Ir. S.C.), 825
- Att'y Gen. v. Yehya & Ora Avraham, C.A.220/67, 22(1) P.D. 29 (Isr.), 208
- Avitzur v. Avitzur, 459 N.Y.S.2d 572 (N.Y. 1983), 194–95, 197, 208
- B & L v. United Kingdom, 39 Eur. Ct. H.R. SE19 227 (2004), 122
- B v. K (Child Abduction), 1 Fam. Ct. Rep. 382 (Eng. Fam. 1993), 478
- Bajrami v. Albania, 47 Eur. H.R. Rep. 22 (2008), 545
- Baker v. State, 744 A.2d 864 (Vt. 1999), 23, 91
- Baldwin v. Iowa State Traveling Men's Ass'n, 283 U.S. 522 (1931), 647
- Baran v. Beaty, 526 F. 3d 1340 (11th Cir. 2008), 477

- Baxter v. Baxter, 423 F.3d 363 (3d Cir. 2005), 491
- Belilos v. Switzerland, 132 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) (1988), 36
- Beth R. v. Donna M., 853 N.Y.S.2d 501 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 2008), 255
- Bevacqua and S. v. Bulgaria, App. No. 71127/01, Eur. Ct. H.R. (2008), 342–46, 347, 350
- Bishop v. Oklahoma ex rel. Edmondson, 447 F. Supp. 2d 1239 (N.D. Okla. 2006), 256
- Blair v. Blair, 643 N.E.2d 933 (Ind. Ct. App. 1995), 274
- Blondin v. Dubois, 189 F.3d 240 (2d Cir. 1999), 461–64
- Blondin v. Dubois, 238 F.3d 153 (2d Cir. 2001), 469–72
- Blondin v. Dubois, 78 F. Supp. 2d 283 (S.D.N.Y. 2000), 464–68
- Boddie v. Connecticut, 401 U.S. 371 (1971), 176
- Bokel v. United States, 2007 WL 1052482 (W.D. Va. April 4, 2007), 571
- Bounds v. O'Brien, 134 S.W.3d 666 (Mo. Ct. App. 2004), 508
- Bouquety v. Bouquety, 2006 WL 1751752 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. June 28, 2006), 633, 645, 660
- Brannan v. Smith, 2001 WL 950216 (Wash. App. Aug. 20, 2001), 649
- Brett v. Brett, [1969] 1 All. E.R. 1007 (Eng.), 198
- Brown v. United States, 12 U.S. (8 Cranch), 353
- Bruggemann and Scheuten v Federal Republic of Germany, (1981) 3 Eur. Ct. H.R. 244 1977, 821
- Buck v. Stankovic, 485 F. Supp.2d 576 (M.D. Pa. 2007), 258
- Butterfield v. Abou-Shaaban, 2006 WL 2987713 (D. Or. Oct. 16, 2006), 584
- C v. C (Minors) (Abduction: Rights of Custody Abroad) 2 All E.R. 465 (Eng. C.A. 1989), 455
- C. v. Finland, 46 Eur. H.R. Rep. 24 (2008), 424–27
- C.R. v. An Bord Uchtala, [1993] 3 I.R. 535 (Ir. H. Ct.), 704

Caban v. Mohammed, 441 U.S. 380 (1979), 686 Campbell v. Campbell, 917 A.2d 302 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 2007), 649 Cantor v. Cantor, 442 F. 3d 195 (4th Cir. 2006), 457 Carignan v. Carignan (1989), 61 Man. R. (2d) 66 (C.A.), 591-94 Carr v. Carr, 724 So. 2d 937 (Miss. Ct. App. 1998), 274 Carter v. Carter, 758 N.W.2d 1 (Neb. 2008), 507 CGRS Case No. 2698, Matter of Anon. (San Francisco, CA, Immigration Court, Feb. 18, 2004), 318 Chartier v. Chartier, [1999] 1 S.C.R. 242 (Can.), 590-94, 596-97 Chaudry v. Chaudry, 388 A.2d 1000 (N.J. Sup. Ct. App. Div. 1978), 281, 507 Chen v. INS, 195 F.3d 198 (4th Cir. 1999), 812-13 Cheskes v. Ontario, 87 O.R.(3d) 581 (Ont. Sup. Ct. Just. 2007), 702-04, 709, 714 Chief Adjudication Officer v. Kirpal Kaur Bath, 1 Fam. 8 (Eng. C.A. 2000), 128-30 Cho v. Jeong,, 1997 WL 306017 (Tenn. Ct. App. June 6, 1997), 401 Choi v. Kim, 404 F. Supp. 2d 495 (S.D.N.Y. 2005), 492 Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye, Inc. v. Hialeah, 508 U.S. 520 (1993), 405 CIBC Mellon Trust Co. v. Mora Hotel Corp., 762 N.Y.S.2d 5 (N.Y. 2003), 648 Cisneros v. Aragon, 485 F.3d 1226 (10th Cir. 2007), 58 Close v. Close, [1999] 50 R.F.L.4th 342 (N.B.Q.B.), 613–14 Coe v. Coe, 334 U.S. 378 (1948), 274, 647 Cons. Const. 1975 J.C.P. II, No. 18030 (Fr.), 820 Cook v. Cook, 342 U.S. 126 (1951), 274 Cornejo v. County of San Diego, 504 F.3d 853 (9th Cir. 2007), 514 Cotter v. Cotter, 648 S.E.2d 552 (N.C. App. 2007), 284

Country of Luxembourg, on behalf of Ana Ribeiro v. Canderas, 768 A.2d 283 (N.J. Super. Ct. Ch. Div. 2000), 642-45, 646, 648

- Cox v. Cox, 776 P.2d 1045 (Alaska 1989), 616
- Coy v. Coy, 2002 WL 31402080 (Cal. Ct. App. Oct. 25, 2002), 649
- Cresenzi v. Cresenzi, 2004 WL 2668272 (Conn. Super. Ct. Oct. 26, 2004), 648, 652
- Croll v. Croll, 229 F.3d 133 (2d Cir. 2000), 449–55
- Crouch v. Crouch, 566 F.2d 486 (5th Cir. 1978), 115
- Cucuzzella v. Keliikoa, 638 F.2d 105 (9th Cir. 1981), 575
- Currier v. Currier, 845 F. Supp. 916 (D.N.H. 1994), 491
- Curtis v. Kline, 542 Pa. 249 (1995), 621

Danaipour v. McLarey, 286 F.3d 1 (1st Cir. 2002), 472, 476, 525

- Dart v. Dart, 579 N.W.2d 82 (Mich. 1999), 281–83
- Davis v. Davis, 143 S.E.2d 835 (Va. 1965), 612–13
- Davis v. State, 892 N.E.2d 156 (Ind. Ct. App. 2008), 253
- Dennis v. Dennis, [2000] 3 W.L.R. 1443, 177
- Dep't of Human Serv. v. Shelnut, 777 So. 2d 1041 (Miss. 2000), 633–34, 647
- Diamond v. Diamond, 461 A.2d 1227 (Pa. 1983), 275
- Diehl v. United States, 438 F.2d 705 (5th Cir. 1971), 275
- Diorinou v. Mezitis, 237 F.3d 133 (2d Cir. 2001), 537, 641

Director General v. M.S., No. SY8917 of 1997, slip op. (Austl. Fam. Ct. 1998), 442

Distler v. Distler, 26 F. Supp. 2d 723 (D.N.J. 1998), 498

- Doe v. Sundquist, 2 S.W.3d 919 (Tenn. 1999), 701
- Domingues v. United States, Merits Case No. 12.285, Inter-Am. Comm'n Hum. Rts. Report No. 62/02 (2002), 45, 51
- Donlann v. Macgurn, 55 P.3d 74 (Ariz. Ct. App. 2002), 257

Downs v. Yuen, 748 N.Y.S.2d 131 (N.Y.App. Div. 2002), 284

- Dresser v. Cradle of Hope, 358 F. Supp. 2d 620 (E.D. Mich. 2005), 757
- Duarte v. Bardales, 526 F. 3d 563 (9th Cir. 2008), 497
- Duran v. Beaumont, 534 F. 3d 142 (2d Cir. 2008), 448
- E.B. v. France, 47 Eur. H.R. Rep. 21 (2008), 422
- Edwards v. Dominick, 815 So. 2d 236 (La. Ct. App. 2002), 635, 640
- El Universal, Compañia Periodistica Nacional, S.A. de C.V. v. Phoenician Imports, Inc., 802 S.W.2d 799 (Tex. App. 1991), 651
- Elsholz v. Germany, 2000 VIII Eur. Ct. H. R. 345, 428–29
- England v. England, 234 F.3d 268 (5th Cir. 2000), 480–83, 635
- Estin v. Estin, 334 U.S. 541 (1948), 247
- European Connections & Tours, Inc. v. Gonzalez, 480 F. Supp. 2d 1355 (N.D. Ga. 2007), 137, 142
- Exxon Shipping Co. v. Baker, 128 S. Ct. 2601 (2008), 5
- F. v. Switzerland, 128 Eur. Ct. H.R. (Ser. A) at 7 (1987), 177–78
- Fantony v. Fantony, 122 A.2d 593 (N.J. 1956), 537
- Farag v. Farag, 772 N.Y.S.2d 368 (N.Y. App. Div. 2004), 274
- Farah v. Farah, 429 S.E.2d 626 (Va. Ct. App. 1993), 251–53
- Fawcett v. McRoberts, 326 F. 3d 491 (4th Cir. 2003), 448–49, 456, 497
- Feder v. Evans-Feder, 63 F.3d 217 (3d Cir. 1995), 440
- Ferenc v. World Child, Inc., 977 F. Supp. 56 (D. D.C. 1997), *aff'd*, 1998 U.S. App. Lexis 25743 (D. C. Cir. 1998), 757
- Ferguson v. Director of Child Welfare, 44 O.R.(2d) 78 (Ont. Sup. Ct., Ct. of App. 1983), 702
- Filartiga v. Peña Irala, 630 F.2d 876 (2d Cir. 1980), 46, 57
- Finizio v. Scoppio-Finizio, [1999] 124 O.A.C. 308 (Can.), 472, 473
- Forbes v. Alliance for Children, C.A. No. 97004860 (Suffolk Sup. Ct. Dec. 16, 1998), 757

- Ford v. United States, 273 U.S. 593 (1927), 43
- Fox v. Fox, 904 P.2d 66 (Okla. 1995), 422
- Freier v. Freier, 969 F. Supp. 436 (E.D. Mich. 1996), 479–80, 487–88
- Freier v. Freier, 985 F. Supp. 710 (E.D. Mich. 1997), 498
- Frette v. France, 2002-I Eur. Ct. H.R. 345, 422
- Friedrich v. Friedrich, 78 F.3d 1060 (6th Cir. 1996), 458–61, 472–73, 490–91
- Furnes v. Reeves, 362 F. 3d 702 (11th Cir. 2004), 447–48, 456, 497
- Gandara v. Bennett, 528 F.3d 823 (11th Cir. 2008), 514
- Gardner v. Gardner, 2000 WL 1838744 (Wash. Ct. App. Dec. 14, 2000), 194
- Gaskin v. United Kingdom, 160 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A.) 2 (1989), 713
- Ghassemi v. Ghassemi, 998 So. 2d 731 (La. Ct. App. 2008), 254, 257–58
- Gitelman v. Gitelman, 2001 WL 128927 (Conn. Super. Ct. Jan. 22, 2001), 275
- Gitter v. Gitter, 396 F. 3d 124 (2d Cir. 2005), 440
- Gladis v. Gladisova, 856 A.2d 703 (Md. 2004), 636-40, 641
- Glaser v. United Kingdom, 33 Eur. H.R. Rep. 1 (2001), 429
- Godfrey v. DiNapoli, 866 N.Y.S.2d 844 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 2008), 255
- Godfrey v. Spano, 836 N.Y.S.2d 813 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 2007), 255
- Goekce v. Austria, Communication No. 5/2005, U.N. CEDAW, 39th Sess., U.N. Doc. No. CEDAW/C/39/D/5/2005 (2007), 306–11, 312, 313
- Golan v. Louise Wise Servs., 507 N.E.2d 275 (N.Y. 1987), 699
- Golden v. Patterson, 877 N.Y.S.2d 822 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 2008), 255
- Goldman v. Goldman, 554 N.E.2d 1016 (Ill. App. Ct. 1990), 197
- Gonzales et al. v. United States, Petition 1490—05, Inter-Am. C.H.R., Report No. 52/07, OEA/Ser.L/V/II.130, Doc.22, rev. ¶60 (2007), 340–41
- Gonzalez v. Gutierrez, 311 F. 3d 942 (9th Cir. 2002), 456

- Gonzalez v. Reno, 86 F. Supp. 2d 1167 (S.D. Fla. 2000), *aff'd*, 212 F.3d 1338 (11th Cir. 2000), 586–87
- Goode v. Goode, 997 P.2d 244 (Or. Ct. App. 2000), 272
- Goodridge v. Dept. of Public Health, 798 N.E.2d 941 (Mass. 2003), 233
- Gorham v. Gorham, 692 P.2d 1375 (Okla. 1984), 421
- Government of the Republic of South Africa v. Grootboom, 2001 (1) SA 46 (CC), 847–65, 878
- Grave v. Shubert, 2000 WL 1221343 (Minn. Ct. App. Aug. 23, 2000), 654–55, 656–57, 659
- Grutter v. Bollinger, 529 U.S. 306 (2003), 5
- Gumbrell v. Jones, [2001] N.Z.F.L.R. 593, 457
- Guzman v. Guzman, 205 S.W.3d 375 (Tenn. 2006), 258
- H.I. v. M.G., [1999] 2 I.L.R.M. 1 (Ir. S.C.), 448
- Haase v. Germany, 40 Eur. H.R. Rep. 19 (2005), 76
- Haase v. Germany, 46 Eur. H.R. Rep. 242 (2008), 64, 75
- Hadjimilitis (Tsavliris) v. Tsavliris, [2003] 1 F.L.R. 81 (Eng.), 166
- Haker Volkening v. Haker, 547 S.E.2d 127 (N.C. Ct. App. 2001), 633
- Hamdan v. Rumsfeld, 548 U.S. 557 (2006), 31, 57
- Hanano v. Alassar, 2001 WL 876399 (Va. Cir. Ct. Jan. 23, 2001), 286
- Hanley v. Roy, 485 F. 3d 641 (11th Cir. 2007), 449
- Hassan v. Gonzales, 484 F.3d 513, 518 (8th Cir. 2007), 381, 385
- Hazban Escaf v. Rodriguez, 200 F. Supp. 2d 603 (E.D. Va. 2002), 525
- Hennefeld v. Montclair, 22 N.J. Tax 166 (2005), 255
- Hernandez v. Robles, 855 N.E.2d 1 (N.Y. 2006), 255
- Hilton v. Guyot, 159 U.S. 113 (1895), 537
- Hirai v. Superior Court, 2008 WL 4216323 (Cal. Ct. App. Sept. 16, 2008), 510–11
- Hirschkorn v. Hait, 2008 WL 695892 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. Mar.17, 2008), 512

- Hixson v. Sarkesian, 123 P.3d 1072 (Ak. 2005), 660
- Hoffmann v. Austria, 225 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) 45 (1993), 406–09, 410–12
- Hokkanon v. Finland, 299 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) (1994), 428–29
- Hosain v. Malik, 671 A.2d 988 (Md. Ct. Spec. App. 1996), 528–37, 538–39
- Huaman-Cornelio v. Board of Immigr. Appeals, 979 F.2d 995 (4th Cir. 1992), 813
- Huynh Thi Anh v. Levi, 586 F.2d 625 (6th Cir. 1978), 58
- Hyde v. Commissioner of Inland Revenue, [2000] N.Z.F.L.R. 385, 619–21
- I.O'T. v. B, [1998] 2 I.R. 321 (Ir.), 705–08, 709
- Ibarra v. Garcia, 476 F. Supp. 2d 630 (S.D. Tex. 2007), 448
- Ibrahim v. Aziz, 953 A.2d 508 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 2008), 640
- Ignaccolo-Zenide v. Romania, 2000 I Eur. Ct. H.R. 241, 546–47
- Ignaccolo-Zenide v. Romania, 31 Eur. H.R. Rep. 7 (2001), 443
- In re [Name Redacted], 2008 WL 5651986 (INS) (OAA Nov. 6, 2008), 768
- In re A.C., 30 Cal. Rptr. 3d 431 (Cal. Ct. App. 2005), 508
- In re A.K., 72 P.3d 402 (Colo. Ct. App. 2003), 640
- In re Acosta, 19 I. & N. Dec. (1985), 382
- In re Adoption of Baby S., 705 A.2d 822 (N.J. Super. Ct. Ch. Div. 1997), 714
- In re Adoption of D.J.F.M., 643 S.E.2d 879 (Ga. App. 2007), 784–85
- In re Adoption of Sherman, 2007 WL 703498 (V.I. Super. Feb. 6, 2007), 714
- In re Adoption of W.J., 942 P.2d 37 (Kan. 1997), 784, 785
- In re Alicia Z., 784 N.E.2d 240 (Ill. Ct. App. 2002), 514
- In re Al-Zhouhayli, 486 N.W.2d 10 (Minn. Ct. App. 1992), 552
- In re Application of Adams ex rel. Naik v. Naik, 363 F. Supp. 2d 1025 (N.D. Ill. 2005), 448
- In re Application of George, 625 S.W.2d 151 (Mo. Ct. App. 1981), 699

- In re B. Del C.S.B. (minor), 525 F. Supp. 2d 1182 (C.D. Cal. 2007), 448
- In re C.T., 121 Cal. Rptr. 897 (Cal. Ct. App. 2002), 525
- In re Calderon-Garza, 81 S.W.3d 899 (Tex. App. 2002), 507, 512–13
- In re Certification of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 (10) BCLR 1253 (CC), 844
- In re Chang, Interim Decision 3107, 1989 WL 247513 (B.I.A. 1989), 812–13
- In re Christine, 397 A.2d 511 (R.I. 1979), 714
- In re D.W., Jr., 2008 WL 5423586 (Cal. Ct. App. Dec. 31, 2008), 509
- In re D\_\_\_ K\_\_\_, File A76 491 421 (B.I.A. July 12, 2001), 318
- In re Dalip Singh Bir's Estate, 188 P.2d 499 (Cal. Ct. App. 1948), 254
- In re Dixon, 323 N.W.2d 549 (Mich. Ct. App. 1982), 699
- In re Estate of Gernold, 800 N.Y.S.2d 329 (N.Y. Surr. Ct. 2005), 263
- In re Estate of Ian A. Pringle, 2000 WL 1349231 (Terr. Ct. V.I. July 25, 2000), 269–71, 272–75
- In re Estate of Robert Huyot, 645 N.Y.S.2d 979 (N.Y. Surr. Ct. 1996), *aff'd*, 666 N.Y.S.2d 697 (N.Y. App. Div. 1997), 263
- In re Estate of Rodriguez, 160 P.3d 679 (Ariz. Ct. App. 2007), 255
- In re Extradition of Cheung, 968 F. Supp. 791 (D. Conn. 1997), 43
- In re Fauziya Kasinga, 21 I. & N. Dec. 357 (B.I.A. 1996) (en banc), 373, 381, 383
- In re Gonzalez, 2000 WL 492102 (Fla. Cir. Ct. Apr. 13, 2000), 587
- In re H., [2000] 1 FLR 374, 1999 WL 1319095, 449
- In re Hegney, 158 P.3d 1193 (Wash. Ct. App. 2007), 43
- In re Interest of J.J.L.-P, 256 S.W. 3d 363 (Tex. Ct. App. 2008), 491
- In re Jawad, 759 N.E.2d 1002 (Ill. Ct. App. 2001), 552
- In re Kandu, 315 B.R. 123 (Bankr. W.D. Wash. 2004), 256
- In re Kohl, 778 N.E.2d 1169 (Ill. App. Ct. 2002), 649

- In re Kowalewski, 182 P.3d 959 (Wash. 2008), 287
- In re L.A.M. & R.K.M., 996 P.2d 839 (Kan. 2000), 514
- In re Lewin, 149 S.W.3d 727 (Tex. App. 2004), 507, 512, 526
- In re Manuel P., 215 Cal. App. 3d 48, *cert. denied*, 498 U.S. 832 (1990), 34
- In re Maples, 563 S.W.2d 760 (Mo. 1978), 699
- In re Marino, 737 N.Y.S.2d 496 (N.Y. App. Div. 2002), 699
- In re Marriage Cases, 43 Cal. 4th 757, 183 P.3d. 384 (2008), 230–32
- In re Marriage of Brown, 587 N.E.2d 648 (Ill. App. Ct. 1992), 284
- In re Marriage of Condon, 62 Cal. App. 4th 533 (1998), 499
- In re Marriage of Donboli, 128 Wash. Ct. App. 1039 (2005), 507–08
- In re Marriage of Galante, 2003 WL 22719326 (Cal. Ct. App. Nov. 14, 2003), 276, 284
- In re Marriage of Gur, 2005 WL 3409379 (Cal Ct. App. Dec. 13, 2005), 633, 651
- In re Marriage of Handeland, 564 N.W.2d 445 (Iowa Ct. App. 1997), 616
- In re Marriage of Kimura, 471 N.W.2d 869 (Iowa 1991), 286–87
- In re Marriage of Reeman and Vikes Sareen, 62 Cal. Rptr. 3d 687 (Cal. Ct. App. 2007), 502–06, 507–08
- In re Marriage of Saheeb and Khazal, 880 N.E.2d 537 (Ill. App. Ct. 2007), 561
- In re Marriage of Shaban, 105 Cal. Rptr. 2d 863 (Cal. Ct. App. 2001), 106
- In re Marriage of Steinmetz (1980) 6 F.L.R. 554 (Austl.), 198
- In re Marriage of Vryonis, 248 Cal. Rptr. 807 (Cal. Ct. App. 1988), 107–10, 111
- In re Marriage of Winegard, 278 N.W.2d 505, 510 (Iowa, 1979), 100, 103
- In re Matter of R-A-, Order No. 3007-2008, (Attorney General Michael B. Mukasey, Sept. 25, 2008), 385
- In re May, [1959] I.R. 74 (Ir. H. Ct.), 409–10, 412
- In re Nada R., 108 Cal. Rptr. 2d 493 (Cal. Ct. App. 2001), 525

In re Parentage of Robinson, 890 A.2d 1036 (N.J. Super. Ct. Ch. Div. 2005), 255 In re Ponath, 829 F. Supp. 363 (D. Utah 1993), 441–42, 489–90 In re R (Child Abduction: Acquiescence), 1 Fam. 716 (Eng. C.A. 1995), 484 In re R-A, 22 I. & N. Dec. 906 (B.I.A. 1999) (en banc), 318, 374, 374–79, 381, 383, 384-85 In re Ramadan, 891 A.2d 1186 (N.H. 2006), 272 In re Robinson, 983 F. Supp. 1339 (D. Colo. 1997), 485, 648 In re Roger B., 418 N.W.2d 751 (Ill. 1981), 699 In re S. (Minors) (Abduction: Acquiescence), 1 Fam. 819 (Eng. Fam. 1994), 483 In re S., A.C. 750 (Eng. H.L. 1998), 458 In re S-A, 22 I. & N. Dec. 1328 (B.I.A. 2000), 381 In re Schenck, 568 N.W.2d 567 (Neb. Ct. App. 1997), 103 In re Schweidenback, 3 F. Supp. 2d 118 (D. Mass. 1998), 575 In re Sigmar, 270 S.W.3d 289 (Tex. App. 2008), 551, 552, 563 In re Skrodski, 2007 WL 1965391 (E.D.N.Y. July 2, 2007), 485 In re Stephanie M., 867 P.2d 706 (Cal. 1994), 513-14 In re V.L.C. 225 S.W.3d 221 (Tex. App. 2006), 633, 659 In re Zappa, 197 P.3d 905 (Kan. Ct. App. 2008), 552 Infant No. 10968 v. Ontario, 88 O.R.(3d) 600 (Ont. Ct. App. 2007), 702 Innes v. Carrascosa, 918 A.2d 686 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 2007), 512, 567, 583 INS v. Aguirre-Aguirres, 119 S. Ct. 1439 (1999), 382INS v. Cardoza-Fonseca, 480 U.S. 421, 430-31 (1987), 382, 813 Inze v. Austria, 10 Eur. H.R. Rep. 394 (1988), 26Ireland v. United Kingdom, 25 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) (1978), 319

Irwin v. Irwin, [1997] O.J. 3892 (Ont. Div. Ct.), 596 Islam v. Sec'y of State for the Home Dep't; Regina v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal ex parte Shah (conjoined appeals) 38 I.L.M. 827 (Eng. H.L. 1999), 378-80 Ivaldi v. Ivaldi, 685 A.2d 1319 (N.J. 1996), 431, 510, 538 Jaggi v. Switzerland, 47 Eur. H.R. Rep. 30 (2008), 713Jahed v. Acri, 468 F.3d 230 (4th Cir. 2006), 272 James v. James, 45 S.W.3d 458 (Mo. Ct. App. 2001), 257, 258 Jane Does v. State, 993 P.2d 822 (Or. Ct. App. 1999), rev. denied, 6 P.3d 1098 (Or. 2000), 701 Jensen v. Olagues, [2003] N.S.F.L.R. 19 (N.Z. Fam. Ct.), 457 Jewell v. Jewell, 751 A.2d 735 (R.I. 2000), 272 Jogi v. Voges, 480 F.3d 822 (7th Cir. 2007), 514 Johnson v. Johnson, 493 S.E.2d 668 (Va. Ct. App. 1997), 519–20 Johnson v. Johnson, 676 So. 2d 458 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1996), 283 Johnston v. Ireland, 112 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) (1987), 25–26, 28, 177–78, 276 Jose Alberto Perez, Meza, Report No. 96/01 (2001), 242 Joslin v. New Zealand, Communication No. 902/1999, CCPR/C/75/D/902/1999 (July 30, 2002), 243 Journe v. Journe, 911 F. Supp. 43 (D.P.R. 1995), 491 K. & T. v. Finland, 31 Eur. H.R. Rep. 484 (2000), 75-76K. & T. v. Finland, 36 Eur. H.R. Rep. 18 (2002), 75Kaho v. Ilchert, 765 F.2d 877 (9th Cir. 1985), 777-80 Kalia v. Kalia, 783 N.E.2d 623 (Ohio Ct. App. 2002), 289, 633 Kalyton v. Kalyton, 74 P. 491 (Or. 1903), 100 - 02Karadz'i'c v. Croatia, 44 Eur. H.R. Rep. 45 (2007), 545

- Karam v. Karam, 2009 WL 605401 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. Mar. 11, 2009), 507
- Karner v. Austria, Application No. 40016/98 24.7.2003, 239–40
- Katare v. Katare, 105 P.3d 44 (Wash. Ct. App. 2004), 563
- Katjtazi v. Kajtazi, 288 F. Supp. 15 (E.D. N.Y. 1978), 583–84
- Kearns v. France, No. 35991/04 (Eur. Ct. H.R. Jan. 10, 2008), 678, 684–85
- Keegan v. Ireland, 290 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) (1994), 29, 689–92, 693–94
- Kerrigan v. Commissioner of Public Health, 957 A.2d 407 (Conn. 2008), 233
- Kijowska v. Haines, 463 F. 3d 583 (7th Cir. 2006), 440
- Kiobel v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co., 456 F. Supp. 2d 457 (S.D.N.Y. 2006), 57
- Knothe v. Rose, 392 S.E.2d 570 (Ga. Ct. App. 1990), 652
- Koch v. Koch, 450 F. 3d 703 (7th Cir. 2006), 440
- Kolovrat v. Oregon, 366 U.S. 187 (1961), 43
- Kovacs v. Kovacs, 633 A.2d 425 (Md. Ct. Spec. App. 1993), 111
- Krishna v. Krishna, 1997 WL 195439 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 11, 1997), 491
- Kulko v. Super. Ct. of Cal., 436 U.S. 84 (1976), 283, 645–46
- Kushnik v. Kushnik, 763 N.Y.S.2d 889 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 2003), 274, 283
- Kwongyuen Hangkee Co. Ltd. v. Starr Fireworks, Inc., 634 N.W.2d 95 (S.D. 2001), 648
- L. v. Finland, 31 Eur. H.R. Rep. 737 (2000), 66–72, 73, 75–76, 347, 874
- L. v. S., 691 M.L.J.U. 1 (Malay. High Ct., Sibu 2001), 396
- Lalli v. Lalli, 439 U.S. 259 (1978), 27, 28
- LaSelva v. Ziomek, 2006 WL 433635
- (Tenn. Ct. App. Feb. 23, 2006), 649
- Lau v. Kiley, 563 F.2d 543 (2d Cir. 1977), 5 Lawrence v. Texas, 539 U.S. 558 (2003), 5, 31
- Lazaridus v. Wehmer, 288 F. App'x 800 (3rd Cir. 2008), 567
- LeClair v. LeClair, 137 N.H. 213 (1993), 611

- Lehr v. Robertson, 463 U.S. 248 (1983), 448, 685, 686-88, 692, 694
- Lemm v. Salamey, 2005 WL 1880200 (Mich. Ct. App. Aug. 9, 2005), 525
- Leslie v Noble, 377 F. Supp. 2d 1232 (S.D. Fla. 2005), 448
- Leszinske v. Poole, 798 P.2d 1049 (N.M. Ct. App. 1990), 248–50, 253–54
- Levy v. Louisiana, 391 U.S. 68 (1968), 29
- Lewis v. Harris, 908 A.2d 196 (N.J. 2006), 255
- Lieverman v. Tabachnik, 2008 WL 1744353 (D. Colo. April 10, 2008), 448
- Lily Thomas v. Union of India, [2000] 2 L.R.I. 623 (India), 207
- Liuksila v.Stoll,887 A.2d 501 (D.C.2005)
- Livingstone-Stallard v. Livingstone-Stallard, [1974] Fam. 47 (Eng.), 166
- Long v. Ardestani, 624 N.W.2d 405 (Wisc. Ct. App. 2001), 553–60
- Lopes v. Lopes, 852 So. 2d 402 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2003), 258, 273, 276, 653
- Lops v. Lops, 140 F.3d 927 (11th Cir. 1998), 494–97
- Lord v. Living Bridges, 1999 WL 562713 (E.D. Pa. July 30, 1999), 757
- Loizidou v. Turkey, 310 Eur. Ct. H. R. (ser. A) (1995), 36
- Loving v. Virginia, 388 U.S. 1 (1967), 142
- Lowe v. Broward County, 766 So. 2d 1199 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2000), 218
- Lwin v. INS, 144 F.3d 505 (7th Cir. 1998), 381
- Lyon v. Wilcox, [1994] N.Z.F.L.R. 422, 621–24
- M.A. v. INS, 899 F.2d 304, 311 (4th Cir. 1990), 813
- M.C. v. Bulgaria, 40 Eur. H.R. Rep. 20 (2005), 346, 347–48
- Ma v. Ma (In re Marriage of Yi Ning Ma), 483 N.W.2d 732 (Minn. Ct. App. 1992), 257
- Magaya v. Magaya, S.C. No. 210-98 (Zimb. 1999), 97
- Maklad v. Maklad, 2001 WL 51662 (Conn. Super. Ct. Jan. 3, 2001), 267–69, 273, 274, 275, 276

- March v. Levine, 136 F. Supp. 2d 831 (M.D. Tenn. 2000), *aff'd*, 249 F.3d 462 (6th Cir. 2001), 524
- Marckx v. Belgium, 2 Eur. H.R. Rep. 330 (1979), 177
- Marckx v. Belgium, 2 Eur. H.R. Rep. 330 (1979), 19, 20, 21, 22, 24, 25, 26, 28, 276
- Marcovitz v. Bruker, [2007] 3 S.C.R. 607 (Can.), 198–201, 202, 208
- Marfo v. Hagan, 2003 WL 21404692 (Conn. Super. Ct. June 6, 2003), 256
- Maria da Penha Maia Fernandes, Case No. 12.051, Inter-Am C.H.R. 54-1 (2001), 326–34
- Maria Eugenia Morales De Sierra, Case No. 11.625, Inter-Am C.H.R. 4-01 (2001), 335–38
- Maria v. McElroy, 68 F. Supp. 2d 206 (E.D.N.Y. 1999), 43
- Marta Lucia Alvarez Giraldo, Case 11.656, Report No. 71/99 (1999), 242
- Martian v. Martian, 328 N.W.2d 844 (N.D. 1983), 193
- Martinez v. County of Monroe, 850 NY.S.2d 740 (N.Y. App. Div. 2008), 255
- Maruko v. Versorgungsanstalt der deutschen Buhen, Case C-267/06 (ECJ, Grand Chamber, April 1, 2008), 241–42
- Mathews v. Eldridge, 424 U.S. 319 (1976), 28
- Matovski v. Matovski, 2007 WL 2600862 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 31, 2007), 498
- Matsumoto v. Matsumoto, 762 A.2d 224 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 2000), 583–84
- Mattenklott v. Germany, 44 Eur. H.R. Rep. SE12 (2007), 546
- Matter of [name withheld], [number withheld], slip. op. (IJ Oct. 24, 2001) (N.Y., N.Y.) (Chew, I.J.), 381
- Matter of Acosta, 19 I. & N. Dec. 211 (BIA 1985), 373
- Matter of A-M-E & J0G-U, 24 I & N Dec. 69 (BIA 2007), 385
- Matter of A-T-, 24 I. & N. Dec. 296 (BIA 2007), 385

- Matter of C-A, 23 I & N Dec. 951 (BIA 2006), 385 Matter of Cabucana, 16 I. & N. Dec. 217 (B.I.A. 1977), 782
- Matter of Cho, 16 I. & N. Dec. 188 (B.I.A.1977), 782, 783
- Matter of E-A-G, 24 I & N Dec. 591 (BIA 2008), 385
- Matter of Khatoon, 19 I. & N. Dec. 153 (B.I.A. 1984), 781
- Matter of Kwok, 14 I. & N. Dec. 127 (B.I.A. 1972), 781
- Matter of Mogharrabi, 19 I. & N. Dec. 439 (B.I.A. 1987), 373
- Matter of Ng, 14 I. & N. Dec.135 (B.I.A. 1972), 781
- Matter of Patel, 17 I. & N. Dec. 414 (B.I.A. 1980), 783
- Matter of Reputan, 19 I. & N. Dec. 199 (B.I.A. 1984), 783
- Matter of S-E-G, 24 I & N Dec. 579 (BIA 2008), 385
- Maumousseau and Washington v. France, No. 39388/05 (Eur. Ct. H.R. Dec. 6, 2007), 546
- May v. Anderson, 345 U.S. 528 (1953), 513
- Mayer v. Mayer, 311 S.E.2d 659 (N.C. Ct. App. 1984), 276
- Maynard v. Hill, 125 U.S. 190 (1888), 91
- Mazurek v. France, App. No. 34406/97 (Eur. Ct. H.R. Feb. 1, 2000), 26
- McA v. McA, 1 I.R. 457 (Ir. H. Ct. 2000), 173–75
- McArthur v. McArthur, [1998] 235 A.R. 297 (Alta. Q.B.), 651
- McBride v. McBride, [2001] N.W.T.S.C. 59 (N.W.T. Sup. Ct.), 596
- McDonald v. Wrigley, 870 P.2d 777 (Okla. 1994), 427
- McKay v. Kalyton, 204 U.S. 458, 469 (1907), 102
- McMichael v. United Kingdom, 307 Eur. Ct. H.R. 27 (ser. A) (1995), 694
- McMullen v. European Adoption Consultants, Inc. 129 F. Supp. 2d 805 (W.D. Pa. 2001), 757
- Mendez Lynch v. Mendez Lynch, 220 F. Supp. 2d 1347 (M.D. Fla. 2002), 524
- Michael McC v. Manuela, 848 N.Y.S.2d 147 (N.Y. App. Div. 2007), 507

- Michie v. Michie, 1997 Carswell Sask 608, 48 C.R.R. (2d) 333 (Sask Q.B.), 621
- Mila v. Dist. Dir. of the Denver, Col. Dist. of the INS, 678 F.2d 123 (10th Cir. 1982), 781
- Miller v. Albright, 523 U.S. 420 (1998), 28
- Miller v. Miller, 97 N.J. 154 (1984), 597
- Minister for Welfare and Population Development v. Fitzpatrick, 2000 (3) SA 422 (CC) (S. Afr.), 733
- Minister of Health v. Treatment Action Campaign, 2002 (5) SA 703 (CC) (S. Afr.), 863
- Minister of Home Affairs and Another v. Fourie and Another, Constitutional Court—CCT 60/04 Judgment date: 1 December 2005, 224–30
- Minkin v. Minkin, 434 A.2d 665 (N.J. Super. Ct. Ch. Div. 1981), 197
- Minot v. Eckardt Minot, 13 F.3d 590 (2d Cir. 1994), 584
- Mir v. Birjandi, 2007 WL 4170868 (Ohio Ct. App. Nov. 21, 2007), 281
- Mir v. Birjandi, 2007 WL 1934219 (Ohio App. June 29, 2007), 281
- Miron v. Trudel, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 418 (Can.), 259
- Missouri v. Holland, 22 U.S. 416 (1920), 352
- MOC v. MOC, [2003] 181 C.A. (H.Ct.) (Ir.), 178
- Mohamed v. Canada, [1997] F.C. IMM-4742-96 (Fed. Ct.), 386
- Mohammed v. Gonzales, 400 F.3d 785, 797 (9th Cir. 2005), 381
- Monory v. Romania & Hungary, 41 Eur. H.R. Rep. 37 (2005), 443
- Morabu Chacha v. Marwa Wambura (Mwanza High Ct., Matr. Civ. App. Nov. 25, 1976) (Tanzania), 398
- Moreno v. Moreno, 481 S.E.2d 482 (Va. Ct. App. 1997), 616
- Morgentaler v. Prince Edward Island, [1995] 122 D.L.R. (4th) 728 (Can.), 817
- Moser v. Austria, No. 12643/02 (Eur. Ct. H.R. Sept. 21, 2006), 76
- Mozes v. Mozes, 239 F.3d 1067 (9th Cir. 2001), 433–39

- Mthembu v. Letsela, 2000 (3) SA 867 (A), (S. Afr.), 97
- N. v. Health Service Executive, [2006] 3 I.R. 449 (Ir.), 678–84
- N.S. v. M.I., [2007] 1 F.L.R. 444 (Eng.), 183
- Navas v. INS, 217 F.3d 646 (9th Cir. 2000), 318
- Nerghes v. Mukasey, 2008 U.S. App. LEXIS 7729 (6th Cir. 2008), 316
- Nguyen v. INS, 121 S. Ct. 2053 (2001), 27, 28
- Nicaragua v. Reagan, 859 F.2d 929 (D.C. Cir. 1988), 144
- Niergarten v. Lutheran Social Services, 563 N.W.2d 181 (Wis. Ct. App. 1997), *rev'd on other grounds*, 580 N.W.2d 320 (Wis. 1998), 757
- Nippon Emo Trans Co., Ltd,. v. Emo Trans, Inc., 744 F. Supp. 1215 (E.D.N.Y. 1990), 647
- Nischal v. Nischal, 879 A.2d 813 (Pa. Super. Ct. 2005), 635, 640, 641
- No she po v. Wa win ta, 65 P. 15 (Or. 1900), 671
- Noordin v. Abdulla (In re Custody of R), 947 P.2d 745 (Wash. Ct. App. 1997), 526, 538
- Nunez v. Ramirez, 2008 WL 898658 (D. Ariz. Mar. 28, 2008), 498
- O v. H, [1998] N.Z.F.L.R. 673, 599
- O'Darling v. O'Darling, 188 P.3d 137 (Okla. 2008), 256
- Odatalla v. Odatalla, 810 A.2d 93 (N.J. Super. Ct. Ch. Div. 2002), 281
- Odievre v. France, 38 Eur. H.R. Rep. 43 (2004), 22, 25
- Odièvre v. France, 2003-III Eur. Ct. H.R. 51, 711–13
- Office of Child Support v. Sholan, 782 A.2d 1199 (Vt. 2001), 652
- Oforji v. Ashcroft, 354 F.3d 609 (7th Cir. 2003), 317
- Open Door and Dublin Well Woman v. Ireland, (14234/88) [1992] ECHR 68 (29 October 1992), 822
- Orzeczenie Trybunalu Konstytucyjnego z Dnia 28 May 1997 r. (Sygn.akt K. 26/96) (Pol.), 820

Osman v. United Kingdom, 29 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) 245 (1998), 348, 349 Ostevoll v. Ostevoll, 2000 WL 1611123 (S.D. Ohio Aug. 16, 2000), 483 P.C. & S. v. United Kingdom, 35 Eur. H.R. Rep. 31 (2002), 76 Padron v. Padron, 641 S.E.2d 542 (Ga. 2007), 286 Palau-Martinez v. France, 2003-XII Eur. Ct. H.R. 321, 410-11 Palmore v. Sidoti, 466 U.S. 429 (1984), 413-14, 421, 427 Papakosmas v. Papakosmas, 483 F. 3d 617 (9th Cir. 2007), 442 Paradis and Others v. Germany, No. 4065/04 (Eur. Ct. H.R. Sept. 4, 2007), at http://www.coe.int/eng., 583 Pascual v. O'Shea, 421 F. Supp. 80 (D. Haw. 1976), 782 Pater v. Pater, 588 N.E.2d 794 (Ohio 1992), 406 Paton v. U.K, 3 Eur. H.R. Rep. 408 (1981), 821 Patsone v. Pennsylvania, 232 U.S. 138 (1914), 43Payne v. Payne, 1 F.L.R 1052 (Eng. C.A. 2001), 499 Pennoyer v. Neff, 95 U.S. 714 (1877), 513 People v. Ezeonu, 588 N.Y.S.2d 116 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 1992), 250-51, 254 People v. Wu, 286 Cal. Rptr. 868 (Cal. Ct. App. 1991), 5 Perrin v. Perrin, 408 F.2d 107 (3d Cir. 1969), 273 Pfeifer v. Cutshall, 851 A.2d 983 (Pa. Super Ct. 2004), 650, 652 Phinikaridou v. Cyprus, No. 23890/02 (Eur. Ct. H.R. Dec. 20, 2007), 713 Pierce v. Society of Sisters, 269 U.S. 510 (1925), 863Pini v. Romania, 40 Eur. H.R. Rep. 13 (2005), 733Pirayesh v. Pirayesh, 596 S.E.2d 505 (S.C. App. 2004), 561 Pollastro v. Pollastro, [1999] 118 O.A.C. 169 (Can.), 474 Polovchak v. Meese, 744 F.2d 731 (7th Cir. 1985), 587 Poor v. Poor, 409 N.E.2d 758 (Mass. 1980), 276

- Promise Doe v. Sundquist, 106 F.3d 702 (6th Cir. 1997), 700–01, 709
- Quarto v. Adams, 929 A.2d 1111 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 2007), 255
- Quilloin v. Walcott, 434 U.S. 246 (1978), 686, 699
- Quilter v. Attorney General, [1998] 1 N.Z.L.R. 523, 243
- Quiner v. Quiner, 59 Cal. Rptr. 503 (Cal. Ct. App. 1967), 406
- R (K.M.) v. R (D.E.), [2001] 14 R.F.L.5th 168 (Sask. Q.B.), 764
- R. v. Morgentaler, [1988] 1 S.C.R. 30 (Can.), 817
- R. v. Morgentaler, [1993] 1 S.C.R. 462 (Can.), 817
- Rabbani v. Rabbani, 578 N.Y.S.2d 213 (N.Y. App. Div. 1991), 273
- Rahawangi v. Alsamman, 2004 WL 1752957 (Ohio Ct. App. Aug. 5, 2004), 274, 286
- Re C (Abduction: Grave Risk of Physical or Psychological Harm), 2 Fam. 478 (Eng. C.A. 1998), 479
- Re E, [2000] W.L.R. 1036, 2 Fam. 642 (Eng. C.A. 1999), 539
- Re HB (Abduction: Children Objections), (No. 2), 1 Fam. 564 (Eng. Fam. 1998), 479
- Re HB (Abduction: Children Objections), 1 Fam. 392 (Eng. Fam. 1997), 478–79
- Re HB (Abduction: Children Objections), 1 Fam. 422 (Eng. C.A. 1997), 479
- Re J, 2 F.C.R. 34, 2 Fam. 678 (Eng. Fam. 1999), *aff'd*, 1 Fam. 571 (Eng. C.A. 1999), 411–12
- Re JA, 1 Fam. 231 (Eng. C.A. 1998), 539
- Re R (Child Abduction: Acquiescence), 1 Fam. 716 (Eng. C.A. 1995), 484
- Re T. (Abduction: Child's Objection to Return), 2 Fam. Ct. Rep. 159 (Eng. Fam. 2000), 478, 484–85
- Regensburger v. China Adoption Consultants, Ltd., 138 F.3d 1201 (7th Cir. 1998), 757
- Republic of Ireland v. United Kingdom, 25 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) ¶162 (1978), 346
- Restrepo v. McElroy, 369 F.3d 627 (2d Cir. 2004), 43

Reynolds v. United States, 98 U.S. 145 (1878), 112Richardson v. Richardson, [1987] 1 S.R.C. 857,618 Riley v. Riley, 271 So. 2d 181 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1972), 158-60 Robert v. Tesson, 507 F. 3d 981 (6th Cir. 2007), 440 Roe v. Roe, 324 S.E.2d 691 (Va. 1985), 422 Rogan v. Reno, 75 F. Supp. 2d 63 (E.D.N.Y. 1999), 765-67, 768, 769, 770 Roper v. Simmons, 543 U.S. 551 (2005), 5, 31, 50 Rosales v. Battle, 113 Cal. App.4th 1178 (Cal. App. 2004), 127, 263 Rreshpja v. Gonzales, 420 F.3d 551, 555-56 (6th Cir. 2005), 385 Ruffier v. Ruffier, 190 S.W.3d 884 (Tex. App. 2006), 508 Ruiz v. Tenorio, 392 F. 3d 1247 (11th Cir. 2007), 440 Russell v. Russell, (1976) 134 C.L.R. 495, 114 Sagar v. Sagar, 781 N.E.2d 54 (Mass. App. Ct. 2003), 412-13 Salguiero da Silva Mouta v. Portugal, 1999 IX Eur. Ct. H.R. 309, 422 Saltarelli v. Saltarelli, 670 S.W.2d 785 (Tex. App. 1984), 194 Salvatierra v. Calderon, 836 So. 2d 149 (La. Ct. App. 2002), 287 Sanchez-Trujillo v. INS, 801 F.2d 1571 (9th Cir. 1986), 381 Sanderson v. Tryon, 739 P.2d 623 (Utah 1987), 112 Sangha v. INS, 103 F.3d 1482 (9th Cir. 1997), 318 Sasson v. Shenhar, 667 S.E.2d 555 (Va. 2008), 567, 583 Savoie v. Savoie, 583 A.2d 762 (N.J. Super. Ct. 1990), 598 Schaeffer v. Schaeffer,741 N.Y.S.2d 895 (N.Y. App. Div. 2002), 275 Schecter v. Boren, 535 F. Supp. 1 (W.D. Okla. 1980), 699 Scholl v. Scholl, 621 A.2d 808 (Del. Fam. Ct. 1992), 197 Schwartz v. Schwartz, 652 N.Y.S.2d 616 (N.Y. App. Div. 1997), 197

Seewald v. Seewald, 22 P.3d 580 (Colo. Ct. App. 2001), 258, 274

Shaffer v. Heitner, 433 U.S. 186 (1977), 273

Shalit v. Coppe, 182 F.3d 1124 (9th Cir. 1999), 447

Sharma v. Sharma, 667 P.2d 395 (Kan. Ct. App. 1983), 194

Shephard v. Lopez-Barcenas, 116 P.3d 254 (Or. Ct. App. 2005), 507

Sherrer v. Sherrer, 334 U.S. 343 (1948), 274, 647

Shikoh v. Murff, 257 F.2d 306 (2d Cir. 1958), 111

Siderman de Blake v. Argentina, 965 F.2d 699 (9th Cir. 1992), 46

Silverman v. Silverman, 338 F. 3d 886 (8th Cir. 2003), 440, 480

Silvestri v. Oliva, 403 F. Supp. 2d 378 (D. N.J. 2005), 498

Sinha v. Sinha, 834 A.2d 600 (Pa. Super. Ct. 2003), 276

Smith v. Org. of Foster Families for Equal. & Reform, 431 U.S. 816 (1977), 74–75

Söderbäck v. Sweden, 1998 VII Eur. Ct. H.R. 3086, 694

Sommerfeld v. Germany, 2003-VIII Eur. Ct. H.R. 137, 428

Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain, 542 U.S. 692 (2004), 43, 46, 57–58, 584

Sosna v. Iowa, 419 U.S. 393 (1975), 113, 176

Spindler v. Mayol, 849 So. 2d 1102 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2003), 513

Stanley v. Illinois, 405 U.S. 645 (1972), 685

2007 WL 1934219 (Ohio App. June 29,2007), 649

State (Nicolaou) v. An Bord Uchtala, [1996] I.R. 567 (Ir. S.C.), 693

State of Ohio ex rel.Popovici v.Agler, 280 U.S.379 (1930), 287

State v. Baxter, 141 P.3d 92 (2006), 370

State v. Rivera, 977 P.2d 1247 (Wash. Ct. App. 1999), 257, 258, 653

State v. Tomaskovic, 275 F. App's 884 (11th Cir. 2008), 571

State v. Vakilzaden, 742 A.2d 767 (Conn. 1999), 583

xxxii

- Steinberg v. Steinberg, 1982 WL 2446 (Ohio Ct. App., June 24, 1982), 198 Stone v. Wall, 734 So. 2d 1038 (Fla. 1999),
- 584 Suen Toi Lee v. Yau Yee Ping, [2001] 4 H.K.C.F.A.R 474 (C.F.A.), 98–99
- Summerfield v. Galante, 2003 WL 22719326 (Cal. Ct. App. Nov. 14, 2003) 642, 652
- Susan L. v. Steven L., 729 N.W.2d 35 (Neb. 2007), 521–24, 525–27
- Sylvester v. Austria, 37 Eur. H.R. Rep. 417 (2003), 443, 545–46
- TC, Apr. 16, 2007 (S.T.C. No. 69), 103
- T.T. v. K.A., 2008 WL 2468525 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. June 18, 2008), 277–78, 283
- Tabacchi v. Harrison, No., 2000 WL 190576 (N.D. Ill. Feb. 10, 2000), 491
- Taveras v. Taveraz, 477 F.3d 767 (6th Cir. 2007), 46, 58, 584
- Taylor v. Rossu, [1998] 216 A.R. 348 (Alta. C.A.), 23, 24, 366
- Teijeiro Fernandez v. Yeager, 121 F. Supp. 2d 1118 (W.D. Mich. 2000), 457
- Temlock v. Temlock, 898 A.2d 209 (Conn. App. Ct. 2006), 506, 509
- Terrell v. Terrell, 578 S.W.2d 637 (Tenn. 1979), 273
- The Paquete Habana, 175 U.S. 677 (1900), 352
- Theriault v. Theriault, (1994), 149 A.R. 210 (C.A.), 596
- Thompson v. Oklahoma, 487 U.S. 815 (1988), 49
- Toonen v. Australia, Communication No. 488/1992, CCPR/C/50/D/488/1992 (April 4, 1994), 244
- Toren v. Toren, 26 F. Supp. 2d 240 (D. Mass. 1998), 497–98
- Torrico v. Smithson, 2006 WL 334032 (Tenn. Ct. App. Feb. 13, 2006), 634–35
- Tostado v. Tostado, 151 P.3d 1060 (Wash. Ct. App. 2007), 527
- Town of Castle Rock v. Gonzales, 545 U.S. 748 (2005), 340

- Treatment Action Campaign v. Minister of Health, 2002 (4) BCLR 356 (T) (S. Afr.), 863
- Trimble v. Gordon, 430 U.S. 762 (1977), 28
- Trinidad & Tobago v. Ramjattan, Case 11837, Report No. 92/98, Inter-Am. C.H.R., OEA/ser.L/V/II.95, doc. 7 rev. at 259 (1998), 326
- Trop v. Dulles, 356 U.S. 86 (1958), 320
- Troxel v. Granville, 530 U.S. 57 (2000), 427, 429, 677
- Tsai-Yi Yang v. Fu-Chang Tsui, 449 F. 3d 259 (3d Cir. 2007), 440
- Tsirlin v. Tsirlin, 2008 WL 2052492 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. May 14, 2008), 258, 276–77
- Turner v. Turner, 192 So. 2d 787 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1967), 198
- Ugochukwu v. Ugochukwu, 627 S.E.2d 625 (N.C. Ct. App. 2006), 650, 653
- United States v. Alahmad, 211 F.3d 538 (10th Cir. 2000), 572
- United States v. Amer, 110 F.3d 873 (2d Cir. 1997), 572, 574
- United States v. Amer, 163 F.3d 1149 (2d Cir. 1998), 574
- United States v. Arjona, 120 U.S. 479 (1887), 352
- United States v. Bandu, 479 F. Supp. 2d 195 (D. Mass. 2007), 571
- United States v. Cummings, 281 F.3d 1046 (9th Cir. 2002), 498–99, 572–74
- United States v. Fazal-Ur-Raheman Fazal, 355 F.3d 40 (1st Cir. 2004), 567–71, 573–74
- United States v. Maddox, 2006 WL 1207964 (D. Or. May 2, 2006), 572–73
- United States v. Morrison, 120 S. Ct. 1740 (2000), 352
- United States v. Shahani-Jahrami, 286 F. Supp. 2d 723 (E.D. Va. 2003), 571–73
- United States v. Smith, 18 U.S. (5 Wheat.) 153 (1820), 44
- United States v. Tabaja, 91 F.App'x 405 (6th Cir. 2004), 572
- United States v. Ventre, 228 F.3d 1047 (9th Cir. 2003), 573
- United States v. Duarte Acero, 208 F.3d 1282 (11th Cir. 2000), 43

- Van de Perre v. Edwards, [2001] 2 S.C.R. 1014 (Can.), 414–21, 427 Van De Sande v. Van De Sande, 431 F. 3d
- 567 (7th Cir. 2005), 477
- Vang v. Toyed, 944 F.2d 476 (9th Cir. 1991), 5
- Vazifdar v. Vazifdar, 547 A.2d 249 (N.H. 1988), 276
- Vermeire v. Belgium, 15 Eur. H.R. Rep. 488 (1993), 24
- Victor v. Victor, 866 P.2d 899 (Ariz. Ct. App. 1993), 198
- Virginia v. Tennessee, 148 U.S. 503 (1893), 34
- W.O'R v. E.H. & An Bord Uchtala, [1996] 2 I.R. 248 (Ir.), 693–94
- Waite v. Waite, 64 S.W.3d 217 (Tex. App. 2001), 193
- Walsh v. Bona, [2002] 4 S.C.R. 325 (Can.), 259, 263
- Walsh v. Walsh, 221 F.3d 1 (1st Cir. 2002), 525
- Wasniewski v. Grzelak-Johannsen, 2007 WL 2071957 (N.D. Ohio July 13, 2007), 497
- Watson v. Watson, 2008 WL 287812 (Cal. Ct. App. Feb. 4, 2008), 552
- Weber v. Weber, 929 So. 2d 1165 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2006), 286
- Welstead v. Bainbridge, [1994] 2 R.F.L. 4th 419, 599
- Wentworth v. Wentworth, 2001 WL 1301535 (Wash. Ct. App. Oct. 26, 2001), 659
- Whallon v. Lynn, 230 F.3d 450 (1st Cir. 2000), 443-46
- White & Potter v. U.S., Inter-Am. C.H.R. 25, 38, OEA./ser.L./V./II.54, docv 9 rev 1 (1980-81), 822
- White v. Harrison-White, 760 N.W.2d 691 (Mich. Ct. Ap. 2008), 516–18, 519

- White v. White, [2001] 1 A.C. 596 (H.L.) (Eng.), 283
- Wikoski v. Wikoski, 513 A.2d 986 (Pa. Super. 1986), 193
- Wilkinson v. Kitzinger, [2006] E.W.H.C. (Fam.) 2022 (Eng.), 265
- Williams v. North Carolina, 325 U.S. 226 (1945), 272–73, 283, 647
- Williams v. Williams, 543 P.2d 1401 (Okla. 1975), *cert. denied*, 426 U.S. 901 (1976), 192–93
- Wilson v. Ake, 354 F. Supp. 2d 1298 (M.D. Fla. 2005), 256
- Wojcik v. Wojcik, 959 F. Supp. 413 (E.D. Mich. 1997), 491–94, 497, 498, 544
- Woodall v. Woodall, 471 S.E.2d 154 (S.C. 1996), 488
- X & Y v. The Netherlands, 8 Eur. Ct. H.R. 235 (1985), 347
- X" & "Z" v. Argentina, Case No. 11.676, Rep. No. 71/00, Inter-Am. C.H.R., OEA/ser.L/V/II.111 doc. 20 rev. 582 (2000), 443
- Xiong v. Xiong, 648 N.W.2d 900 (Wis. Ct. App. 2002), 264
- Yu v. Zhang, 885 N.E.2d 278 (Ohio App. 2008), 274
- Z & Others v. United Kingdom, 34 Eur. H.R. Rep. 3 (2002), 341–42, 348
- Z v. Finland, 1997-I Eur. Ct. H.R. 323, 713
- Zablocki v. Redhail, 434 U.S. 374 (1978), 91, 142
- Zapppone v. Revenue Comm'rs, [2006] I.E.H.C. 404 (H.Ct.) (Ir.), 265
- Zawahiri v. Alwattar, 2008 WL 2698697 (Ohio Ct. App. July 10, 2008), 281
- Zenide v. Superior Court, 27 Cal. Rptr. 2d 703 (Cal. Ct. App. 1994), 546
- Zubeda v. Ashcroft, 333 F.3d 463 (3rd Cir. 2003), 317
- Zummo v. Zummo, 574 A.2d 1130 (Pa. Super. Ct. 1990), 406, 410

## **Preface for Instructors**

Before we began writing this book in 1999, we surveyed the courses in comparative and/or international family law offered by American law schools, both on campus and in their overseas programs. Our examination confirmed our suspicion that the courses were extremely diverse, both in structure and content. Some of these courses were two credit hours, others were three; some of these courses were seminars, others were not. The instructors' pedagogical goals and coverage fell along a continuum: some focused almost exclusively on training students for the practice of transnational family law; others concentrated mostly on examining discrete family law issues from a comparative perspective; some emphasized international human rights conventions affecting the family. Notwithstanding this variety, several generalizations were evident. The majority of the instructors utilized a combination of public international law, private international law, and comparative law sources. In addition, all taught with materials that they or others had gathered, as no casebook yet existed in this field.

Ours was the first casebook created for American law students in the field of comparative and international family law. As such, we tried to create a book that could be used flexibly in many types of courses. We included more material than could be taught in a course of two- or three-credit hours in order to ensure sufficient content to meet each instructor's interests and goals. We used recurring themes throughout the book to try to provide coherence regardless of the material chosen. In the second edition, we have trimmed the materials while attempting to keep the book useful for instructors with a wide range of teaching objectives and interests.

The first chapter presents an overview of the comparative and international law disciplines. We have presumed that students have not had either an international or comparative law course. Therefore, we use family law topics not covered elsewhere in the book to introduce the skills and information necessary to explore effectively the topical chapters that follow.

The remaining chapters are divided into two parts. Chapters Two through Six focus primarily on relationships between adult partners. Chapters Seven through Fourteen concentrate largely upon the relationships between children and their parents and other caregivers.

For those instructors who want to teach a mixture of comparative, international, and transnational law, and consequently will seek material by topic rather than by discipline, Chapters Two through Fourteen offer a range of options. The book is organized topically because we believe that the study of family law is particularly rich and exciting when one explores a particular topic through a combination of comparative law, public international law, and private international law. However, for those instructors who want to organize materials around a specific discipline, we offer the following suggestions. Instructors who want to emphasize transnational family law will find most useful Chapters One (sec-

tion B), Two (section D), Five, Eight, Ten, and Twelve. Instructors who wish to concentrate mostly on comparative family law might want to select Chapters One (section A), Two (sections A, B, and C), Three, Four, Seven, Nine, Eleven, Thirteen, and Fourteen. Chapter Eight might also be usefully included in such a course, as certain portions take a comparative approach to examining the topics of child abduction and custody jurisdiction, and many of the cases provide significant insight into the substantive custody law of the nations involved. Instructors who seek to focus on the intersection of international human rights law and family law will find most relevant Chapters One (section B), Two (sections B.4 and D), Four (section B), Six, Seven, Eleven, Thirteen, and Fourteen.

The book incorporates a broad range of materials, including judgments from international tribunals and domestic courts of many nations, statutes from around the world, and excerpts from professional journals in law and related fields. Each chapter includes problems and exercises that permit instruction through problem-solving and role-playing. Each chapter also contains both specific and open-ended questions to facilitate policy discussions and socratic dialogue.

A separate paperback, entitled *International Family Law: Conventions, Statutes, and Regulatory Materials*, complements this casebook and is also available through Carolina Academic Press. It contains the edited text of global and regional international conventions relevant to the field of family law, selected U.S. federal statutes and regulations, and the text of the Uniform Interstate Family Support Act (2001 and 2008), the Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act (1997), and the Uniform Child Abduction Prevention Act (2006). We placed these materials in a separate supplement because these materials are referred to throughout the book and because they are lengthy. An instructor certainly could make available these treaties and statutory materials through other means; we have only sought to eliminate that inconvenience for those who would prefer not to have it.

This book was not created for the basic domestic Family Law course taught in most U.S. law schools, and this book is not well suited for that purpose. Although the book contains some U.S. cases, legislative materials, and summaries of legal doctrine, this material is provided solely for comparative purposes or to contextualize a discussion of transnational or public international law. Rather, our goals were to create a book that would allow students to explore family law issues from a global or comparative perspective, to understand the influence and limitations of international law. To those of you who share these goals, we hope that this book provides you a useful tool for exploring this fascinating and rapidly expanding field of law with students. We welcome your comments and suggestions. Please direct comments about Chapters 1.B, 3, 5, 7, 8.B, 8.C, and 10–12 to Marianne Blair, Chapters 1.A, 6, and 8.A to Merle Weiner, Chapters 2 and 9 to Solangel Maldonado, and Chapters 4, 13, and 14 to Barbara Stark.

xxxvi

### Acknowledgments

We gratefully acknowledge and appreciate the many individuals who made this book possible, including our research assistants, our support staff, our colleagues, and others who have shared their expertise with us about various substantive issues. We also want to thank our respective institutions and deans for making the project possible through the provision of sabbatical and other support.

- 1956 Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery, 18 U.S.T. 3201, 266 U.N.T.S. 3 (Sept. 7, 1956). Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Abrahamson, Shirley S. & Michael J. Fischer, *All the World's a Courtroom: Judging in the New Millennium*, 26 Hofstra L. Rev. 273 (1997). Reprinted with permission of Hofstra Law Review and the authors.
- Abrams, Kerry, *Immigration Law and the Regulation of Marriage*, 91 Minn. L. Rev. 1625 (2007). Reprinted with permission of the author and the Minnesota Law Review.
- Abrams, Paula, *Population Politics: Reproductive Rights and U.S. Asylum Policy*, 14 Geo. Immigr. L.J. 881 (2000). Reprinted with permission of the Georgetown Immigration Law Journal and the author.
- Al-Hibri, Azizah Y., Marriage Laws in Muslim Countries: A Comparative Study of Certain Egyptian, Syrian, Moroccan, and Tunisian Marriage Laws, 4 Int'l Rev. of Comp. Pub. Pol'y 227 (1992). Reprinted with permission of the International Review of Comparative Public Policy, Michigan State University, and the author.
- Apy, Patricia E., Managing Child Custody Cases Involving Non-Hague Contracting States, 14 J. Am. Acad. Matrim. Law. 77 (1997). Reprinted with permission of the copyright holder, Journal of the American Academy of Matrimonial Lawyers.
- Australian Law Reform Commission, *Multiculturalism and the Law, Report No. 57* (1992). Copyright Commonwealth of Australia, reproduced by permission.
- Baker, Maureen, *Canadian Family Policies: Cross-National Comparisons*. Reprinted with permission of the University of Toronto Press, Inc.
- B & L v. United Kingdom, 39 Eur. Ct. H.R. SE 19 227 (2004). Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- Bartholet, Elizabeth, *International Adoption: Propriety, Prospects, and Pragmatics*, 13 J. Amer. Acad. Matrim. Law. 181 (1996). Reprinted with permission of the copyright holder, Journal of the American Academy of Matrimonial Lawyers.
- Bennett, T.W., Human Rights and African Customary Law 48 (1995). Reprinted with permission of Juta & Co., Ltd.

- Bevacqua and S. v. Bulgaria, App. No. 71127/01, Eur. Ct. H.R. (2008). Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- Blair, Marianne D., & Merle Weiner, *Resolving Parental Custody Disputes A Comparative Exploration*, 39 Fam. L. Q. 247 (2005). Copyright 2005 © by the American Bar Association. Reprinted with permission. This information or any portion thereof may not be copied or disseminated in any form or by any means or downloaded or stored in an electronic database or retrieval system without the express written consent of the American Bar Association.
- Blair, Marianne D., *Safeguarding the Interests of Children in Intercountry Adoption: Assessing the Gatekeepers*, 34 Cap. U.L. Rev. 349 (2005). Reprinted with permission of the Capital University Law Review.
- Boland, Reed, Symposium on Population Law: The Environment, Population, and Women's Human Rights, 27 Envtl. L. 1137 (1997). Reprinted by permission of Environmental Law, Northwestern School of Law at Lewis & Clark College and the author.
- Bott, Sarah, Andrew Morrison & Mary Ellsberg, *Preventing and Responding to Gender-Based Violence in Middle and Low-Income Countries: A Global Review and Analysis*, World Book Policy Research Working Paper 3618, June 2005. Reprinted with permission of the copyright holder, World Bank.
- Booth, Penny, The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Punishment of Children Under English Law—Public v. Private Vices?, 27 Liverpool L. Rev. 395 (2006). Reprinted with permission of the author and the publisher.
- Brauch, Jeffrey A., *The Margin of Appreciation and the Jurisprudence of the European Court* of Human Rights: Threat to the Rule of Law, 11 Colum. J. Eur. L. 113 (2004/5). Reprinted with permission of the Columbia Journal of European Law and the Copyright Clearance Center.
- Brennan, Katherine, Note, *The Influence of Cultural Relativism on International Human Rights Law: Female Circumcision as a Case Study*, 7 Law & Ineq. J. 367 (1989). Reprinted with permission from the Journal of Law and Inequality.
- Burwick, Andrew, Idea Brief, *Child Support Assurance* (The Century Foundation, 2000). Reprinted with permission.
- Butler, William E., International Law in Comparative Perspective 5. Copyright © 1980. Reprinted with the kind permission of Kluwer Law International, Kluwer Academic Plenum Publishers, and with the permission of the author, William E. Butler.
- C. v. Finland, 46 Eur. H.R. Rep. 24 (2008). Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- CEDAW General Recommendation No. 21, ¶16, General Recommendations made by the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women. Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Chambers, David L., "Civilizing the Natives: Customary Marriage in Post-Apartheid South Africa," *in Engaging Cultural Differences: The Multicultural Challenge in Liberal Democracies* (Richard Shweder et al., eds.) © 2002 Russell Sage Foundation, 112 East 64th Street, New York, NY 10021. Reprinted with permission.
- Chartier v. Chartier, [1999] 1 S.C.R. 242, 4 W.W.R. 633 (S.C.C.). Reprinted by permission of Carswell, a division of Thomson Reuters Canada Limited.
- Cheskes v. Ontario, 87 O.R. (3d) 581 (Ont. Sup. Ct. Just. 2007). Available at CanLII, Canadian Legal Information Institute, http://www.canlii.org/en/on/onsc/doc/2007/

2007canlii3837/2007canlii38387.html., and reproduced consistently with its terms at http:///www.canlii.org/en/info/terms.html. Reproduced with the knowledge of the Law Society of Upper Canada and the Minister of Public Works and Government Services Canada, 2009.

- Chief Adjudication Officer v. Kirpal Kaur Bath, 1 Fam. 8 (Eng. C.A. 2000). Reprinted with the permission of LexisNexis.
- Chiu, Elaine M., The Cultural Differential in Parental Autonomy, 41 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1773 (2008). This work, copyright 2008 by Elaine M. Chiu, was originally published in the UC Davis Law Review, vol. 41, pp. 1773-1828, copyright 2008 by The Regents of the University of California. All rights reserved. Reprinted with permission.
- Civil Code of Québec (1993). Copy authorized by Les Publications du Québec.
- Clearinghouse on International Developments on Child, Youth, and Family Policies at Columbia University: Sweden (2005). Reprinted with permission.
- Close v. Close (1999), 50 R.F.L. (4th) 342 (N.B. Q.B.). Reprinted by permission of Carswell, a division of Thomson Reuters Canada Limited.
- Committee on the CRC Comments on State Reports Regarding Corporal Punishment 50th Session: 12-30 January 2009. Reprinted with permission of the United Nations.
- Committee on the Rights of the Child Consideration of Reports Submitted by States Parties, Second Periodic Report of the United Kingdom (1999). Reprinted with permission of the United Nations.
- Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, G.A. Res. 34/180, 34 U.N. GAOR Supp. (No. 46) at 193, U.N. Doc. A/34/46 (Sept. 3, 1981). Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Copelon, Rhonda, International Human Rights Dimensions of Intimate Violence: Another Strand in the Dialectic of Feminist Law Making, 11 Am. U. J. Gender Soc. Pol'y & L. 865 (2003). Reprinted with permission of the author.
- Copelon, Rhonda, *Recognizing the Egregious in the Everyday: Domestic Violence as Torture*, 25 Colum. Hum. Rts. L. Rev. 291 (1994). Reprinted by permission of the Columbia Human Rights Law Review and the author.
- Cox, Susan Soon-Keum, *Ritual*, Yale J. L. & Feminism 17 (1997). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Journal of Law and Feminism, Inc., from The Yale Journal of Law and Feminism Vol. 9, No.1.
- Demleitner, Nora V., *Combating Ethnocentrism*, 31 Ariz. St. L.J. 737 (1999). Reprinted with permission of Arizona State Law Journal and the author.
- Dillon, Sara, Making Legal Regimes for Intercountry Adoption Reflect Human Rights Principles: Transforming the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child with the Hague Convention on Intercountry Adoption, 21 B.U. Int'l. L.J. 179 (2003). Reprinted with permission of Boston University International Law Journal and the author.
- Dillon, Susan A., Comment, *Yoni in the Land of Isis: Female Genital Mutilation is Banned* (*Again*) *in Egypt*, 22 Hous. J. Int'l L. 289 (2000). Reprinted with permission from Houston Journal of International Law and the author.
- Doek, Jaap E., *What Does the Children's Convention Require*?, 20 Emory Int'l L. Rev. 199 (2006). Reprinted with permission of the author.

- Donoho, Douglas Lee, *Relativism Versus Universalism in Human Rights: The Search For Meaningful Standards*, 27 Stan. J. Int'l L. 345 (1991). Reprinted with permission of the Stanford Journal of International Law. Copyright © 2002 by the Board of Trustees of the Leland Stanford Junior University.
- Eekelaar, John, *Are Parents Morally Obliged to Care for Their Children?*, 11 Oxford J. Leg. Stud. 340 (1991). Reprinted with permission of Oxford University Press.
- Ertürk, Yakin, The Due Diligence Standard as a Tool for the Elimination of Violence Against Women, Report of the Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women, its Causes and Consequences, U.N. Hum. Rts. Comm., 62d Sess., Agenda Item 12(a), U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/2006/61 (2006). Reprinted with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Fact Sheet No. 23, Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the Health of Women and Children, Office for the High Commissioner for Human Rights (1995). Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Fagan, Jeffrey & Angela Browne, Violence Between Spouses and Intimates: Physical Aggression Between Women and Men in Intimate Relationships, in 3 Understanding and Preventing Violence: Panel on the Understanding and Control of Violent Behavior, (Albert J. Reiss, Jr. & Jeffrey A. Roth eds., 1994). Reprinted with permission from Understanding and Preventing Violence, copyright 1994 by the National Academy Press, Washington, D.C.
- French Civil Code (1804). Reprinted with permission from Claitor Publishing.
- Garrison, Marsha, *The Goals and Limits of Child Support Policy*, in Child Support: The Next Frontier 16 (J. Thomas Oldham & Marygold S. Melli eds., 2000). Reprinted with permission of the University of Michigan Press.
- Glendon, Mary Ann, The Transformation of Family Law (1989). Reprinted with permission of the publisher and copyright holder, The University of Chicago Press.© 1989 by The University of Chicago.
- Goekce v. Austria, Comm. No. 5/2005, U.N. CEDAW, 39th Sess., U.N. Doc. No. CEDAW/C/39/D/5/2005 (2007). Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Goldsmith, Jack, *Should International Human Rights Law Trump U.S. Domestic Law*, 1 Chi. J. Int'l L. 327 (2000). Reprinted with permission of the copyright holder, The Chicago Journal of International Law.
- Guggenheim, Martin, *Ratify the U.N. Convention on the Rights of Child But Don't Expect Any Miracles*, 20 Emory Int'l L. Rev. 42 (2006). Reprinted with permission of the author.
- Gunning, Isabelle R., Arrogant Perception, World-Travelling and Multicultural Feminism,
  23 Colum. Hum. Rts. L. Rev.189 (1992). Reprinted by permission of the Columbia Human Rights Law Review and the author.
- Gunning, Isabelle R., *Global Feminism at the Local Level: Criminal and Asylum Laws Regarding Female Genital Surgeries*, 3 J. Gender Race & Just. 45 (1999). Reprinted with permission from the Journal of Gender, Race and Justice, University of Iowa College of Law, and the author.
- Harris, Susan R., *Race, Search, and My Baby-Self: Reflections of a Transracial Adoptee*, 9Yale J. L. & Feminism 5 (1997). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Journal Law & Feminism, Inc. from the Yale Journal of Law & Feminism Vol. 9, No. 1.

xl

- Hathaway, Oona A., Do Human Rights Treaties Make A Difference?, 111 Yale L.J. 1935 (2002). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal Company, Inc., from The Yale Law Journal, Vol. 111, pp. 1935, William S. Hein Company and the author.
- Hernandez-Truyol, Berta Esperanza, *Latinas, Culture and Human Rights: A Model for Making Change, Saving Soul,* 23 Women's Rts. L. Rep. 21 (2001). Reprinted with permission from the Women's Rights Law Reporter and the author.
- Hernandez-Truyol, Berta Esperanza, *Law, Culture, and Equality Human Rights' Influence on Domestic Norms: The Case of Women in the Americans*, 13 Fla. J. Int'l L. 33 (2000). Reprinted with permission by the Florida Journal of International Law © 2000 and the author.
- Hernandez-Truyol, Berta Esperanza, Sex, Culture, and Rights: A Re/Conceptualization of Violence for the Twenty First Century, 60 Alb. L. Rev. 629 (1997). Reprinted by permission of the Albany Law Review and the author.
- Hessbruegge, Jan Arno, *Human Rights Violations Arising From Conduct of Non-State Actors*, 11 Buff. Hum. Rts. L. Rev. 21 (2005). Reprinted with permission of the Buffalo Human Rights Law Review.
- Hoffman v. Austria, 225 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) at 45 (1993). Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- Hyde v. Commissioner of Inland Revenue, [2000] N.Z.F.L.R. 385; 1999 N.Z.F.L.R. LEXIS 45. Reprinted with the permission of LexisNexis.
- I.O'T. v. B., [1998] 2 I.R. 321 (Ir. S.C.). Reprinted with permission of the publisher and copyright holder, Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for Ireland.
- Islam v. Secretary of State for the Home Dep't; Regina v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Another *ex parte* Shah (conjoined appeals), 38 I.L.M. 827 (Eng. H.L. 1999). Reprinted with the permission of the American Society of International Law.
- Jackson, Suzanne H., *Marriages of Convenience: International Marriage Brokers*, "*Mail-Order Brides*," *and Domestic Servitude*, 38 U. Tol. L. Rev. 895 (2007). Reprinted with permission of the University of Toledo Law Review and the author.
- Kabeberi-Macharia, Janet & Celestine Nyamu, Marriage by Affidavit: Developing Alternative Laws on Cohabitation in Kenya, in The Changing Family: International Perspectives on the Family and Family Law 197 (John Eekelaar & Thandabantu Nhlapo eds., 1998). Reprinted with permission of Hart Publishing.
- Karner v. Austria, Application No. 40016/98, July 7, 2003. Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- Keegan v. Ireland, 290 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) (1994). Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- King, Michael, *Against Children's Rights*, 1996 Acta Juridica 28. Reprinted by permission of Juta & Co., Ltd. and the author.
- Kirgis, Frederic L., International Agreements and U.S. Law, ASIL Insight, at http://www.asil.org/insigh10.htm, May 1997. Reproduced with permission from ASIL Insight, http://www.asil.org/insigh10.htm, May 1997, © The American Society of International Law.
- Kornhauser, Marjorie E., *A Legislator Named Sue: Re-Imagining the Income Tax*, 5 J. Gender, Race & Just. 289 (2002). Reprinted with permission of the Journal of Gender, Race and Justice.

- L. v. Finland, 31 Eur. Ct. H.R. 737 (2000). Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- Larsen, Janet, *Iran's Birth Rate Plummeting at Record Pace: Success Provides a Model for Other Developing Countries* (December 28, 2001), *available at* http://www.earth-policy.org/Updates/Update4ss\_printable.htm. Reprinted with permission.
- Leonard, Arthur S., *European Court Victory for Same-Sex Partners*, April 1, 2008, *avail-able at* http://newyorklawschool.typepad.com/leonardlink2008/04/european-court.html. Reprinted with permission of the author.
- Levi-Strauss, Claude, *The Family*, in Man, Culture, and Society, Harry L. Shapiro (ed., Oxford University Press, Inc. 1956). Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Li, Xiaorong, *License to Coerce: Violence Against Women, State Responsibility, and Legal Failures in China's Family Planning Program,* 8 Yale J. L. & Feminism 145 (1996). Reprinted with permission of the Yale Journal of Law and Feminism and the author.
- Lyon v. Wilcox, [1994] N.Z.L.R. 422; 1994 N.Z.L.R. LEXIS 631. Reprinted with the permission of LexisNexis.
- Maldonado, Solangel, *Deadbeat or Deadbroke: Redefining Child Support For Poor Fathers*, 39 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 991 (2006). Reprinted with the permission of UC Davis Law Review and the author.
- Marckx v. Belgium, 31 Eur. Ct. H.R. (ser. A) at 19 (1979). Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- Marcovitz v. Bruker, [2007] 3 S.C.R. 607 (Can.). Reprinted for educational purposes with the knowledge and authorization of Crown Copyright and Licensing, Canadian Government Publishing. Reproduced with the permission of the Minister of Public Works and Government Services, Canada, 2009.
- Maria da Penha Maia Fernandes, Case No. 12.051, Inter-Am C.H.R. 54-1 (2001). Reprinted with permission of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights.
- McA v. McA, [2000] 1 I.R. 457 (Ir. H. Ct.). Reprinted with permission of the publisher and copyright holder, Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for Ireland.
- Meeusen, Johan, *Judicial Disapproval of Determination Against Illegitimate Children*, 43 Am. J. Comp. L. 119 (1995). Reprinted with permission of the American Journal of Comparative Law, University of California at Berkeley School of Law (Boalt Hall) and the author.
- Merry, Sally E., *Constructing a Global Law Violence Against Women and the Human Rights System*, 28 Law & Soc. Inquiry 941 (2003). Reprinted with permission of Blackwell Publishing and the American Bar Foundation.
- Mlyniec, Wallace J., *A Judge's Ethical Dilemma: Assessing a Child's Capacity to Choose*, 64 Fordham L. Rev. 1873 (1996). Reprinted with permission of the Fordham Law Review and the author.
- Mosikatsana, Tshepo, *Children's Rights and Family Autonomy in the South African Constitution: A Comment on Children's Rights under the Final Constitution*, 3 Mich. J. Race & L. 341 (1998). Reprinted with permission of the Michigan Journal of Race and Law and the author.
- Mutua, Makau, *Savages, Victims, and Saviors: The Metaphor of Human Rights*, 42 Harv. Int'l L.J. 201 (2000). Reprinted by permission © 2000 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College, the Harvard International Law Journal, and the author.

- N v. Health Service Executive, [2006] 3 I.R. 449 (Ir.). Reprinted with permission of the publisher and copyright holder, Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for Ireland.
- Odièvre v. France, 2003-III Eur. Ct. H.R. 51. Reprinted with permission of the Council of Europe.
- OECD Country Note, Early Childhood Education and Care Police in Sweden, December 1999. Reprinted with permission.
- OECD Country Note, Early Childhood Education and Care Policy in The United States of America, July 2000. Reprinted with permission.
- Owasanoye, Bolaji, *The Regulation of Child Custody and Access in Nigeria*, 39 Fam. L. Q. 405 (2005). Family Law Quarterly; 39:2, pp. 405-428. Copyright 2005 © by the American Bar Association. Reprinted with permission. This information or any portion thereof may not be copied or disseminated in any form or by any means or downloaded or stored in an electronic database or retrieval system without the express written consent of the American Bar Association.
- Penheiro, Paulo Sérgio, *World Report on Violence against Children* (published Nov. 21, 2006). Reprinted with permission of the United Nations.
- Perry, Twila, Transracial and International Adoption: Mothers, Hierarchy, Race, and Feminist Legal Theory, 10 Yale J. L. & Feminism 101 (1998). Reprinted by permission of the Yale Journal of Law & Feminism, Inc. from The Yale Journal of Law & Feminism Vol. 10, No. 1.
- Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime. Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Reitz, John C., *How to Do Comparative Law*, 46 Am. J. Comp. L. 617 (1998). Reprinted with permission of the American Journal of Comparative Law, University of California at Berkeley School of Law (Boalt Hall), and the author.
- Report of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, U.N. GAOR, 56th Sess. Supp. No. 38, at 70, U.N. Doc. A/56/38 (2001). Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Report on the Committee on Progress Achieved in the Implementation of the Convention: Note by the Secretariat, CEDAW, 14th Sess., U.N. Doc. CEDAW/C/1995/7 (1995). Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Roth, Kenneth, *Domestic Violence as an International Human Rights Issue*, from Human Rights of Women, edited by Rebecca J. Cook. Copyright © 1994 University of Pennsylvania Press. Reprinted with permission of the University of Pennsylvania Press and the authors.
- Roth, Kenneth, *The Charade of U.S. Ratification of International Human Rights Treaties*, 1 Chi. J. Int'l L. 347 (2000). Reprinted with permission of the copyright holder, The Chicago Journal of International Law.
- Russell v. Russell, [1976] 134 C.L.R. 495. Reprinted with permission of Thomson Reuters.
- Sachs, Justice Albie, Introduction to The Changing Family: International Perspectives on the Family and Family Law xii (John Eekelaar & Thandabantu Nhlapo eds., 1998). Reprinted with permission of Hart Publishing, Ltd., and the author.
- Scholes, Robert J. & Anchalee Phataralaoha, The "Mail-Order Bride" Industry and its Impact on U.S. Immigration (1999), at http://www.uscis.gov/files/article/MobRept\_AppendixA.pdf. Reprinted with permission.

- Schwartz, Laura J., Models for Parenthood in Adoption Law: The French Conception, 28 Vand. J. Transnat'l. L. 1069 (1995). Reprinted with permission of the copyright holder, Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law.
- Sloth-Nielsen, Julia, *Chicken Soup or Chainsaws: Some Implications of the Constitutionalisation of Children's Rights in South Africa*, 1996 Acta Juridica 6. Reprinted by permission of Juta & Co., Ltd. and the author.
- Smolin, David M., *Intercountry Adoption and Poverty: A Human Rights Analysis*, 36 Cap. U.L. Rev. 413 (2007). Reprinted with permission of the Capital University Law Review.
- Sorensen, Elaine & Chava Zibman, *Child Support Offers Some Protection Against Poverty*, *in* New Federalism: National Survey of America's Families (2000). Reprinted with permission of the Urban Institute.
- Stark, Barbara, *Crazy Jane Talks with the Bishop: Abortion in China, Germany, South Africa and International Human Rights*, 12 Tex. J. Women & L. 287 (2003) Reprinted with permission of the author.
- Stark, Barbara, *Reproductive Rights and Abortion*, in International Family Law: An Introduction 138-39, 148 (2005). Reprinted with permission of the author.
- Suen Toi Lee v. Yau Yee Ping, (2001) 4 H.K.C.F.A.R. 474 (C.F.A.). Reprinted with permission of Thomson Reuters.
- Sykes, Katie, Bambi Meets Godzilla: Children's and Parent's Rights in Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and the Law, 51 McGill L.J. 131 (2006). Reprinted with the permission of the author.
- The Committee's General Comment on Corporal Punishment. Reprinted with permission of the United Nations.
- Thomas, Dorothy Q. and Michele E. Beasley, *Domestic Violence as a Human Rights Issue*, 58 Alb. L. Rev. 1119 (1995). Reprinted with permission of Albany Law Review.
- United Nations Publication Board, Population Division, Department for Economic and Social Policy, *Country Profiles: Canada, El Salvador, and Lebanon*. Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publication Board.
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights, G.A. Res. 217A (III), U.N. Doc. A/810 at 71 (1948). Reproduced with permission of the United Nations Publications Board.
- Van de Perre v. Edwards, [2001] 2 S.C.R. 1014 (Can.). Reprinted for educational purposes with the knowledge and authorization of Crown Copyright and Licensing, Canadian Government Publishing. Reproduced with the permission of the Minister of Public Works and Government Services, Canada, 2009.
- Vergara, Vanessa B.M., Comment, Abusive Mail-Order Bride Marriages and the Thirteenth Amendment, 94 Nw. U. L. Rev. 1547 (2000). Reprinted by special permission of Northwestern University School of Law, Northwestern University Law Review.
- Von Sachsen-Gessaphe, Karl August Printz, *Concubinage in Mexico*, 3 Int'l J. L., Pol'y & the Fam. 40 (1989). Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press.
- Weiner, Merle, *International Child Abduction and the Escape from Domestic Violence*, 69 Fordham L. Rev. 593 (2001). Reprinted with permission of the Fordham Law Review and the author.
- Wikeley, Nick, *Child Support: The Brave New World*, 38 Fam. L. 1024, 1026 (2008). Reprinted with permission of Jordan Publishing Ltd.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

- Willekens, Harry, Long Term Developments in Family Law in Eastern Europe: An Explanation, in The Changing Family: International Perspectives on the Family and Family Law 55 (John Eekelaar & Thandabantu Nhlapo eds., 1998). Reprinted with permission of Hart Publishing, Ltd.
- Woodhouse, Barbara Bennett, *The Constitutionalization of Children's Rights: Incorporating Emerging Human Rights into Constitutional Doctrine*, 2 U. Pa. J. Const. L. 1 (1999).
   Reprinted with permission of the University of Pennsylvania Journal of Constitutional Law and the author.
- Wright v. Zaver, [2002] 211 D.L.R.4th 260 (Ont. C.A.). Reproduced with permission of Carswell Publishing, through *Access Copyright*, The Canadian Copyright Licensing Agency.

Editorial Note: In many of the cases and materials that we have excerpted, citations and footnotes have been omitted. Footnotes, in particular, were frequently omitted without notes or symbols indicating their omission. When we have retained footnotes from cases or excerpted materials, we have retained the original footnote numbers.