

LEGISLATION AND THE REGULATORY STATE

LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

Paul Caron

Professor of Law

Pepperdine University School of Law

Bridgette Carr

Clinical Professor of Law

University of Michigan Law School

Steven I. Friedland

Professor of Law and Senior Scholar

Elon University School of Law

Carole Goldberg

Jonathan D. Varat Distinguished Professor of Law

UCLA School of Law

Oliver Goodenough

Professor of Law

Vermont Law School

John Sprankling

Distinguished Professor of Law

McGeorge School of Law

LEGISLATION AND THE REGULATORY STATE

Samuel Estreicher

Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law
Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law
Co-Director, Dwight D. Opperman Institute of Judicial Administration
New York University School of Law

David L. Noll

Assistant Professor of Law
Rutgers School of Law — Newark,
S.I. Newhouse Center for Law and Justice

Casebook ISBN: 978-0-7698-4688-0

Looseleaf ISBN: 978-0-7698-5993-4

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Estreicher, Samuel, author.

Legislation and the regulatory state / Samuel Estreicher, Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law, Co-Director, Dwight D. Opperman Institute of Judicial Administration New York University School of Law; David L. Noll, Assistant Professor of Law, Rutgers School of Law-Newark, S.I. Newhouse Center for Law and Justice.

pages cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-7698-4688-0 (hardbound) -- ISBN 978-0-7698-5993-4 (looseleaf) 1. Trade regulation--United States. 2. Administrative law--United States. 3. Legislative power--United States. I. Noll, David L., author. II. Title.

KF1600.E84 2015

346.7307--dc23

2015032162

This publication is designed to provide authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2015 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of LexisNexis. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed by LexisNexis or Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material may be licensed for a fee from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

Editorial Offices

630 Central Ave., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800

201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200

www.lexisnexis.com

Table of Contents

Chapter 1	WHY REGULATE — AND HOW?	1
A.	HISTORICAL BACKGROUND FOR FEDERAL REGULATION	1
B.	JUSTIFICATIONS FOR REGULATION	7
1.	What Justifies Legislative Changes to the Common Law?	8
a.	Government Provision of Public Goods	9
b.	Externalities	10
c.	Moral Hazard	13
d.	Flawed Decisionmaking	13
i.	<i>Information Failure or Asymmetry</i>	14
ii.	<i>Paternalism and “Choice Architecture”</i>	14
e.	Inequality/Limited Bargaining Power	16
2.	Why Federal Rather than State Regulation?	18
	<i>Toilet Goods Association v. Finch</i>	18
	Notes and Questions	22
	Note on Justifications for <i>Federal Regulation</i>	25
C.	HOW TO REGULATE?	27
1.	Regulation vs. Common Law	27
	<i>Brooklyn Savings Bank v. O’Neil</i>	27
	Notes and Questions	29
2.	Rules vs. Standards	32
	<i>Federal Trade Commission v. R.F. Keppel & Bro.</i>	32
	Notes and Questions	34
3.	Agency vs. Court	37
	<i>Skidmore v. Swift & Co.</i>	37
	Notes and Questions	40
	<i>Heckler v. Campbell</i>	42
	Notes and Questions	45
	<i>Christiansburg Garment Co. v. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission</i>	49
	Notes and Questions	52
4.	Federal vs. State Regulation	55
	<i>Riegel v. Medtronic, Inc.</i>	56
	Notes and Questions	61
5.	Criminal vs. Civil Liability	66
	<i>Church of The Holy Trinity v. United States</i>	66
	Notes and Questions	68

Table of Contents

Chapter 2	THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS AND STATUTORY INTERPRETATION	73
A.	THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS	73
1.	An Overview of the Legislative Process	73
a.	Origination	73
b.	The Rules of the Legislative Process	73
c.	Preliminary Steps	74
d.	Committee Consideration	74
e.	Consideration by the Full House	76
f.	Senate Consideration	77
g.	Reconciliation of Conflicting Bills — Conference	78
h.	Publication	79
2.	The Dynamics of Legislation	80
a.	The Madisonian Vision	80
	FEDERALIST NO. 10, James Madison	81
	Notes and Questions	83
	Note on the Dynamics of Legislation	84
b.	Extending Interest Group Theory	85
c.	Political Parties	87
d.	Parties and Interest Groups	89
e.	Legislative Process	89
B.	STATUTORY INTERPRETATION	91
1.	Tools of Statutory Interpretation	91
a.	Text	91
	<i>Maracich v. Spears</i>	92
	Notes and Questions	98
	<i>Yates v. United States</i>	105
	Notes and Questions	115
b.	Purpose	121
	<i>Church of the Holy Trinity v. United States</i>	121
	Notes and Questions	124
	<i>General Dynamics Land Systems, Inc. v. Cline</i>	129
	Notes and Questions	134
c.	Legislative History	138
	<i>Hanrahan v. Hampton</i>	139
	Notes and Questions	141
	Note on the Textualist Critique of Legislative History	145
2.	Recurring Problems of Statutory Interpretation	147
a.	Government-Wide Statutes	147
	<i>Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill</i>	148
	Notes and Questions	162

Table of Contents

b.	Shared Regulatory Space	173
	<i>Pom Wonderful LLC v. Coca-Cola Co.</i>	173
	Notes and Questions	178
c.	Technical vs. Lay Meaning	183
	<i>Nix v. Hedden</i>	183
	Notes and Questions	184
	<i>Corning Glass Works v. Brennan</i>	185
	Notes and Questions	191
d.	Unanticipated Changes in Regulated Activity	193
	<i>Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System v. Dimension</i> <i>Financial Corp.</i>	193
	Notes and Questions	199
e.	Statutory “Blindspots”	204
	<i>Morrison v. National Australia Bank Ltd.</i>	204
	Notes and Questions	212
f.	Application of Statute Raises Risk of Constitutional Invalidity	217
	<i>NLRB v. Catholic Bishops of Chicago</i>	217
	Notes and Questions	225
	Note on “Substantive” Canons of Statutory Interpretation	229
	<i>Gregory v. Ashcroft</i>	230
	Notes and Questions	235

Chapter 3	ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES IN THE FEDERAL SYSTEM	239
------------------	--	------------

A.	INTRODUCTION	239
B.	THE CONSTITUTIONAL POSITION OF ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES	240
1.	Limits on the Statutory Design of Administrative Agencies	240
a.	Delegation of Legislative Functions to Agencies	240
	<i>A.L.A. Schechter Poultry Corp. v. United States</i>	242
	Notes and Questions	246
	<i>Yakus v. United States</i>	248
	Notes and Questions	251
	<i>Whitman v. American Trucking Associations, Inc.</i>	252
	Notes and Questions	255
b.	Delegation of Judicial Functions to Agencies	260
	<i>Crowell v. Benson</i>	260
	Notes and Questions	263
	<i>Commodity Futures Trading Commission v. Schor</i>	265
	Notes and Questions	269
c.	Appointment of Administrative Officials	272

Table of Contents

	<i>Freytag v. Commissioner of Internal Revenue</i>	272
	<i>Edmond v. United States</i>	277
	Notes and Questions	281
d.	Removal of Agency Officials	287
	<i>Humphrey's Executor v. United States</i>	288
	Notes and Questions	292
	Note on the Federal Civil Service	301
	Notes and Questions	302
2.	Limits on Congressional Control of Agency Action	303
	<i>Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha</i>	303
	Notes and Questions	311
	<i>Bowsher v. Synar</i>	316
	Notes and Questions	324
C.	CONGRESSIONAL CONTROL OF AGENCY ACTION	327
1.	Appropriations	327
	The Congressional Appropriations Process: An	
	Introduction	328
	Notes and Questions	334
2.	Oversight	338
	<i>McGrain v. Daugherty</i>	338
	Notes and Questions	342
D.	PRESIDENTIAL CONTROL OF AGENCY ACTION	345
1.	Formal Oversight	345
	EXECUTIVE ORDER 12866 OF SEPTEMBER 30, 1993	345
	Notes and Questions	354
	Note on the Office of Management and Budget	360
	Notes and Questions	362
2.	Informal Oversight	363
	<i>Tummino v. Torti</i>	363
	Notes and Questions	370
	Note on the President's Authority to Direct the Actions of	
	Administrative Agencies	373
Chapter 4	THE WORK OF ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES	379
A.	THE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE ACT: HISTORICAL	
	BACKGROUND	379
B.	ADJUDICATION	382
1.	Formal Adjudication	382
	<i>Richardson v. Perales</i>	382
	Notes and Questions	389
2.	Informal Adjudication	396

Table of Contents

	<i>Citizens to Preserve Overton Park, Inc. v. Volpe</i>	396
	Notes and Questions	400
	United States Customs Service Department of the Treasury	403
	Notes and Questions	407
C.	RULEMAKING	408
	<i>Portland Cement Association v. Ruckelshaus</i>	408
	Notes and Questions	415
	<i>Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	422
	Notes and Questions	428
D.	THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN RULEMAKING AND ADJUDICATION	433
	<i>Securities & Exchange Commission v. Chenery Corp.</i>	433
	Notes and Questions	440
	<i>NLRB v. Wyman-Gordon Co.</i>	441
	Notes and Questions	447
	<i>NLRB v. Bell Aerospace Co.</i>	448
	Notes and Questions	450
	Note on Rulemaking's Consequences for Adjudication — and Vice Versa	453
E.	POLICY ELABORATION	455
	<i>General Electric Co. v. Gilbert</i>	455
	Notes and Questions	461
	<i>Chevron U.S.A. Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council</i>	465
	Notes and Questions	478
F.	EXCEPTIONS TO APA § 553: INTERPRETIVE RULES AND POLICY STATEMENTS	481
	<i>Perez v. Mortgage Bankers Association</i>	482
	Notes and Questions	489
G.	LITIGATION	497
	<i>Auer v. Robbins</i>	498
	Notes and Questions	500
Chapter 5	JUDICIAL REVIEW	507
A.	AVAILABILITY OF PRE-ENFORCEMENT JUDICIAL REVIEW	507
	<i>Abbott Laboratories v. Gardner</i>	507
	Notes and Questions	516
	Note on Standing to Sue and Other Issues of “Justiciability”	525
B.	UNREVIEWABLE ACTION “COMMITTED TO AGENCY DISCRETION”	528

Table of Contents

	<i>Citizens to Preserve Overton Park, Inc. v. Volpe</i>	528
	Notes and Questions	530
	<i>Heckler v. Chaney</i>	534
	Notes and Questions	540
C.	REVIEW OF FINAL AGENCY ACTION	545
1.	Findings of Fact	546
	<i>Universal Camera Corp. v. NLRB</i>	546
	Notes and Questions	551
2.	Application of Law to Fact	553
	<i>National Labor Relations Board v. United Insurance Co.</i> <i>of America</i>	554
	Notes and Questions	556
	<i>NLRB v. Bell Aerospace Co.</i>	558
	Notes and Questions	564
3.	Policy Elaboration: “Chevron Deference” and “Skidmore Respect” . . .	566
	<i>Skidmore v. Swift & Co.</i>	566
	Notes and Questions	567
	<i>Chevron U.S.A. Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council</i>	570
	Notes and Questions	570
	<i>United States v. Mead Corp.</i> ,	577
	Notes and Questions	586
	<i>City of Arlington v. FCC</i>	590
	Notes and Questions	595
D.	REVIEW OF DISCRETIONARY AGENCY ACTION	597
	<i>Motor Vehicle Manufacturers Association v. State Farm Mutual</i> <i>Automobile Insurance Co.</i>	597
	Notes and Questions	609
	<i>FCC v. Fox Television Stations, Inc.</i>	616
	Notes and Questions	624
TABLE OF CASES		TC-1
INDEX		I-1
