LABOR LAW: A PROBLEM BASED APPROACH

LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

William Araiza

Professor of Law Brooklyn Law School

Ruth Colker

Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law Ohio State University Moritz College of Law

Olympia Duhart

Professor of Law and Director of Lawyering Skills & Values Program Nova Southeastern University, Shepard Broad Law Center

Samuel Estreicher

Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law NYU School of Law

David Gamage

Assistant Professor of Law UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway

College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried

Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law UC Davis School of Law

Paul Marcus

Haynes Professor of Law William and Mary Law School

Melissa Weresh

Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law Drake University Law School

LABOR LAW: A PROBLEM BASED APPROACH

Paul M. Secunda

Associate Professor of Law Marquette University Law School

Jeffrey M. Hirsch

Associate Professor of Law University of North Carolina School of Law



ISBN: 978-1-4224-8530-9

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Secunda, Paul M.

Labor law: a problem based approach / Paul M. Secunda, Associate Professor of Law, Marquette University Law School, Jeffrey M. Hirsch, Associate Professor of Law, University of North Carolina School of Law. p. cm.

Includes index

ISBN 978-1-4224-8530-9

1. Labor laws and legislation—United States. I. Hirsch, Jeffrey M. II. Title.

KF3319.S43 2012

344.7301-dc23

2012034603

This publication is designed to provide authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2012 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of LexisNexis. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed by LexisNexis or Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material may be licensed for a fee from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

Editorial Offices 121 Chanlon Rd., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800 201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200 www.lexisnexis.com

MATTHEW & BENDER

DEDICATION

PMS: To my grandfather, Joseph B. Godick, for instilling in me a life-long desire to fight the good fight for workers' rights, and with love to Mindy, Jake, and Izzy

JMH: With love to Lynn, Noah, and Naomi

Copyright © 2012 Carolina Academic Press, LLC. All rights reserved.

PREFACE

Labor law is facing challenging times in the first part of the 21st Century. This is especially true in the American private sector, which largely comes under the federal, Wagner-model based, National Labor Relations Act (NLRA). Just over 75 years after its enactment, both employers and unions are seriously questioning the continuing viability of the Wagner model.

Regardless of which side they take in labor law debates, it is important for students to have a model of learning that mirrors the type of problems that newly-minted labor attorneys will face in practice. The problem-based approach we take in this book derives from prescient statements made by Professor Pavel Wonsowicz of the UCLA Law School. In discussing why moving beyond lectures and the Socratic method would be a pedagogical improvement over the way law students have traditionally been taught, Professor Wonsowicz commented: "I tell my students at the outset of a course that there's an unfairness going on in the way classes have been traditionally handled. It's this: We teach you on the case method and test on the problem method." We also believe strongly that the problem-based pedagogical method will directly help students in their eventual practice of labor law by synchronizing the way labor law is taught with the way it is tested in the law school environment.

A typical chapter in this book commences with a clear synopsis of the materials to be covered in the chapter. Second, introductory materials relate the basic thrust of the materials about to be covered. Third, in most sections, a problem is presented based on scholarly articles in the area, recent case law, and current events. Fourth, students are given problem materials to work through to solve the hypothetical presented; these materials include case excerpts, public documents, and law review articles and other secondary materials. Fifth, and finally, the students are presented with a section entitled, "Post Problem Discussion." Similar in structure to the Notes section of more traditional casebooks, this section seeks to highlight important areas in the primary and secondary materials, while providing additional materials for consideration of the problem. We hope that professors will engage in classroom teaching based on the problem(s) assigned for class. Indeed, this material lends itself well to classroom role-playing exercises and other experiential learning techniques.

To be clear, *Labor Law: A Problem Based Approach*, still features the most important cases, documents, and articles for students to study in order to become proficient in the practice of American private-sector labor law. But rather than attempting to have students glean the important facets of the law solely through the traditional case method, this book's problem-based approach requires students to act like attorneys. In short, this book provides a pedagogical alternative that we believe many professors and students will embrace as more compatible with the challenges that labor law practitioners will face in the coming decades. In our view, engagement with both the theoretical foundations and practical implications of labor law is essential for any labor law student who wishes to think critically about these issues and become a more effective advocate for their clients.

Throughout this book, we also hope to bring to bear our familiarity with the Internet, blogs, and social media to make our book one of the most interactive for students yet. In this vein, students will find relevant links to government websites, links to the Workplace

PREFACE

Prof Blog (which we co-edit along with three other law professors), and links to other relevant information on the web.

We offer thanks to all who helped us with this project, especially to the law professors who gave us permission to reproduce their works and to our families for putting up with our long hours in bringing this book to publication. A special thanks goes to Alana Leffler, Marquette University Law School Class of 2013, and Casey Turner, University of North Carolina School of Law Class of 2013, for their exceptional and tireless editorial assistance on this Casebook. It would not have been possible to complete this book without them. Also, thanks to Leslie Levin who was our initial contact with the publisher and to Pali Parekh who was our principal editor for this edition.

Paul M. Secunda Milwaukee, Wisconsin

Jeffrey M. Hirsch Chapel Hill, North Carolina

May 2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1	THE STRUGGLE FOR CONTROL OVER THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP	. 1
Section 1	WHAT IS LABOR LAW AND IS IT STILL RELEVANT?	1
	Problem #1: Is Labor Law Still Relevant?	2
	Wilma Liebman, Decline and Disenchantment: Reflections on the Aging	
	of the National Labor Relations Board	3
	The Dunlop Commission on the Future of Worker-Management Relations	7
	— Final Report	6
	Post Problem Discussion	8
Section 2	A BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE AMERICAN LABOR MOVEMENT	10
A.	The Roots of American Labor Law	11
B.	Events Leading up to the Enactment of Modern Labor Laws	12
C.	The First Attempts at Federal Labor Legislation	14
D.	Modern Day Labor Legislation	16
E.	The Global Workplace, Intra-Union Disputes, and Present Day Attacks of	
	Unions	19
	UNIONIZATION AND COLLECTIVE BARGAINING: JUSTIFICATION	
	AND CRITIQUE	
	Problem #2: Should I Seek Unionization?	
	Post Problem Discussion	22
Chapter 2	THE ORGANIZATION, PROCEDURES, AND JURISDICTION OF THE NLRB	25
Section 1	THE NLRB'S ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE	25
A.	Office of General Counsel	26
B.	Division of Judges	27
C.	NLRB Members	27
Section 2	NLRB PROCEDURES	29
A.	Representation Questions	29
B.	Unfair Labor Practices	32
Section 3.	JURISDICTIONAL LIMITS OF THE NLRB	
A.	Who is an "Employer" Under the NLRA?	35
1.	Private-Sector Employers	35
2.	Railway and Airline Exclusion	35
3.	Monetary Threshold	36
4. D	Religion Exception	36
B.	Who is an "Employee" Under the NLRA?	37
1.	Landauvee of independent Contractor (.10

<i>TABLE</i>	OF CONTENTS	
	Problem #1: "Freelance" Software Engineers	38
	Roadway Package System, Inc	
	Post Problem Discussion	
2.	Employee or Student?	47
	* *	48
	Boston Medical Center Corp	48
	•	53
	·	59
3.	Unions Salts	60
	NLRB v. Town & Country Electric, Inc	61
		65
C.	Excluded Employees	
1.	Managers	
	Problem #3: Compuware's Purchasing Controller	
	NLRB v. Yeshiva University	
	·	73
2.	Supervisors	
		74
		75
	Brief of the NLRB General Counsel, in <i>Oakwood Healthcare</i> ,	
		76
		77
		87
3.	Confidential Employees	88
4.	- ·	89
		89
		90
	Post Problem Discussion	96
Chapter 3	DOMINATION AND DISCRIMINATION	99
Section 1	EMPLOYER DOMINATION OF A LABOR ORGANIZATION	99
	Problem #1: There's No Such Thing as a Free Lunch	00
	Electromation, Inc	01
	Michael H. LeRoy, Employee Participation in the New Millennium:	
		11
		16
Section 2		20
A.	What Section 8(a)(3) is not: A Very Brief Introduction to Section 8(a)(1)'s	
		20
B.	What Section 8(a)(3) is: Prohibition Against Union-Based	
	Discrimination 1	2.2

TABLE	OF CONTENTS	
1.	The Wright Line Test	122
	Problem #2: Boing Trampolines and Pogo Sticks	122
	NLRB v. Transportation Management Corp	123
	Textile Workers Union of America v. Darlington Manufacturing	
	Co	127
	Post Problem Discussion	132
C.	Refusal-to-Hire Cases	135
	Problem #2: The Electric Company	135
	NLRB, Office of the General Counsel Guideline Memorandum	
	Concerning Toering Electric Company	136
	Michael C. Duff, Union Salts as Administrative Private Attorneys	
	General	139
	Post Problem Discussion	143
D.	Remedies for Section 8(a)(3) Violations (and Section 8(a)(1) Too)	144
	Problem #3: Career Opportunities	146
	Jeffrey M. Hirsch, NLRB Reverses Backpay Burden	147
	Hoffman Plastic Compounds, Inc. v. NLRB	149
	Post Problem Discussion	155
Chapter 4	PROTECTED CONCERTED ACTIVITIES UNDER	
Chapter	SECTION 7	159
Section 1	CONCERTEDNESS OF THE EMPLOYEE CONDUCT	159
	Problem #1: Facing the Music, With a Buddy	160
	NLRB v. City Disposal Systems, Inc	160
	NLRB v. J. Weingarten, Inc	166
	<i>IBM Corp.</i>	171
	Post Problem Discussion	182
Section 2	LEGITIMATE PURPOSE FOR CONCERTED ACTIVTY	184
	Problem #2: Politics as Usual?	184
	Eastex, Inc. v. NLRB	186
	Post Problem Discussion	189
Section 3	LEGITIMATE MEANS FOR CONCERTED ACTIVITY	190
	Problem #3: The Six-Foot Inflatable Rat	190
	NLRB v. Local 1229, IBEW (Jefferson Standard Broadcasting Co.)	191
	Matthew W. Finkin, Disloyalty! Does Jefferson Standard Stalk Still? .	196
	Post Problem Discussion	201
Chapter 5	ORGANIZING A UNION	205
	THE RIGHT TO COMMUNICATE v. EMPLOYERS' PROPERTY	
	RIGHTS	207207

TABLE	C OF CONTENTS	
A.	Employee Communications at the Workplace	208
	Republic Aviation Corp. v. NLRB	208
	Post Problem Discussion	
В.	Non-Employee Access to the Workplace	
	Lechmere, Inc. v. NLRB	214
	Post Problem Discussion	221
C.	Electronic Communications	225
	Problem #2: Union E-Mails	
	Jeffrey M. Hirsch, Communication Breakdown: Reviving the Role of	
	Discourse in the Regulation of Employee Collective Action	226
	Guard Publishing Co. (Register-Guard)	230
	Post Problem Discussion	
Section 2	EMPLOYER SPEECH	
	Problem #3: The Election Campaign: The Mall's Captive Audience	
	Meetings	248
A.	Captive Audience Meetings	249
	Livingston Shirt Co	249
	NLRB v. United Steelworkers of America (Nutone Inc. & Avondale	
	Mills)	252
	Post Problem Discussion	256
B.	Threats or Predictions?	257
	NLRB v. Gissel Packing Co	257
	Post Problem Discussion	260
Section 3	FACTUAL MISREPRESENTATION	261
	Problem #4: The Election Campaign: Altered Sample Ballots	261
	Midland National Life Insurance Co	262
	Post Problem Discussion	267
Section 4	PROVIDING OR PROMISING BENEFITS	268
	Problem #5: The Election Campaign: A Visit from the Corporate	
	President and a Union Raffle	268
	NLRB v. Exchange Parts Co	268
	NLRB v. Savair Manufacturing Co	271
	Post Problem Discussion	275
Section 5	SURVEILLANCE	278
	Problem #6: I Always Feel Like Somebody's Watching Me	278
	F.W. Woolworth Co	279
	Post Problem Discussion	280
Section 6	INTERROGATION AND POLLING	281
	Problem #7: The Election Campaign: Questions from a Supervisor	281
	Struknes Construction Co	282
	Sunnyvale Medical Clinic	284

TABLE	OF CONTENTS	
	Post Problem Discussion	287
Chapter 6	SELECTING AND DESELECTING THE BARGAINING REPRESENTATIVE	289
Section 1 C	GROUNDS FOR NOT HOLDING AN ELECTION	289
1.	Lack of support from employees for union	290
2.	The commission of an unremedied ULP: the blocking charge policy.	290
3.	The election bars: certification bar, voluntary recognition bar, and	
	contract bar	290
a.	Certification Bar	291
b.	Election Bar	291
c.	Contract Bar and Its Exceptions	
d.	Voluntary Recognition Bar	292
	Problem #1: The New NLRB Elections Rules	293
	Post Problem Discussion	295
Section 2 T	THE MEANING OF "APPROPRIATE BARGAINING UNIT"	296
	Problem #2: Holy Appropriate Bargaining Unit, Batman!	299
	NLRB v. Chicago Health & Tennis Clubs, Inc	299
	Post Problem Discussion	305
Section 3 R	REPRESENTATION PROCEEDING REVIEW	306
Section 4	GISSEL BARGAINING ORDERS	307
	Problem #3: Non-Majority Bargaining Orders	307
	NLRB v. Gissel Packing Co	308
	Linden Lumber Division, Summer & Co. v. NLRB	312
	Gourmet Foods, Inc. v. Warehouse Employees of St. Paul	313
	Post Problem Discussion	316
Section 5 V	VITHDRAWAL OF UNION RECOGNITION	318
	Problem #4: Boxing Out the Union	319
	Douglas E. Ray, Withdrawal of Recognition After Curtin-Matheson: A	
	House Built on Sand	319
	Allentown Mack Sales and Services, Inc. v. NLRB	
	Levitz Furniture Co	
	Post Problem Discussion	329
Chapter 7	EXCLUSIVITY AND THE DUTY TO BARGAIN IN GOO FAITH	
Section 1 D	DIRECT DEALING	
	Problem #1: Are You Ready for Some Kickball?	
	Section 9(A) of the NLRA	337
	James J. Brudney, A Famous Victory: Collective Bargaining Protection	
	and the Statutory Aging Process	

<i>TABLE</i>	OF CONTENTS	
	Emporium Capwell Co. v. Western Addition Community	
	Organization	340
	Post Problem Discussion	345
Section 2 I	BARGAINING TACTICS	347
A.	Economic Pressure	347
	Problem #2: By-The-Book	348
	NLRB v. Insurance Agents' Union	348
	Post Problem Discussion	354
В.	Surface Bargaining	354
	Problem #3: Do You Want Ketchup with That?	354
	NLRB v. American National Insurance Co	355
	Garden Ridge Management, Inc	360
	Post Problem Discussion	366
Section 3 I	OUTY TO PROVIDE INFORMATION	368
	Problem #4: A Note from Your Doctor	369
	NLRB v. Truitt Manufacturing Co	370
	Detroit Edison Co. v. NLRB	373
	Post Problem Discussion	378
Section 4 I	MPASSE	379
	Problem #5: I'm Going to Take My Ball and Go Home!	380
	NLRB v. Katz	381
	Post Problem Discussion	384
Chapter 8	SUBJECTS OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	387
Section 1 N	MANDATORY v. PERMISSIVE SUBJECTS OF BARGAINING	387
	Problem #1: Testing the Mandatory-Permissive Distinction	389
	NLRB v. Wooster Division of Borg-Warner Corp	389
	Johnson-Bateman Co. v. International Association of Machinists	394
	Post Problem Discussion	397
Section 2 I	DUTY TO BARGAIN OVER SUBCONTRACTING AND PARTIAL	
(CLOSINGS	399
	Problem #2: When the Lights Go Out in Milwaukee	400
	Fibreboard Paper Products Co. v. NLRB	400
	First National Maintenance Corp. v. NLRB	406
	Theodore J. St. Antoine, Legal Barriers to Worker Participation in	
	Management Decision Making	412
a	Post Problem Discussion	419
Section 3 I	RUNAWAY SHOPS	421
	Problem #3: Sweet Home Missalabama, Where the Skies are so Blue.	421
	United Food & Commercial Workers, Local 150-A v. NLRB (Dubuque	422
	PACKINO LA)	411

TABLE 0	OF CONTENTS	
	Dorsey Trailers, Inc. v. NLRB	
Chapter 9	STRIKES, LOCKOUTS, AND EMPLOYER RESPONSES TO UNION CONCERTED ACTIVITY	437
Section 1 S	TRIKES AND PERMANENT REPLACEMENTS	437
	Problem 1: Is the Right to Strike in the U.S. Illusory?	438
	NLRB v. Mackay Radio & Telegraph Co	439
	Laidlaw Corp	442
	Paul M. Secunda, Politics Not As Usual: Inherently Destructive Conduc	et,
	Institutional Collegiality, and the National Labor Relations Board	446
	Post Problem Discussion	447
Section 2 S	UPER-SENIORITY AND LOCKOUTS	449
	Problem 2: Keep on Knockin', But You Can't Come in	449
	NLRB v. Erie Resistor Corp	450
	American Ship Building Co. v. NLRB	455
	Paul M. Secunda, Politics Not As Usual: Inherently Destructive Conduc	ct,
	Institutional Collegiality, and the National Labor Relations Board	461
	Post Problem Discussion	463
Section 3 T	HE GREAT DANE FRAMEWORK AND INHERENTLY DESTRUCTIVE	VE
C	CONDUCT UNDER SECTION 8(a)(3)	464
	Problem 3: The 30% Rule	
	Paul M. Secunda, Politics Not As Usual: Inherently Destructive Conduc	
	Institutional Collegiality, and the National Labor Relations Board	
	Local 15 IBEW v. NLRB	
	Post Problem Discussion	474
Chapter 10	PICKETING, BOYCOTTS, AND UNION SECONDARY	
	ACTIVITY	477
Section 1 C	CONSTITUTIONAL LIMITATIONS ON THE RIGHT TO STRIKE ANI)
	ICKET	477
Section 2 R	ECOGNITIONAL PICKETING UNDER SECTION 8(b)(7)	479
	Problem #1: Can I Get Some Recognition Here?	480
	Lee Modjeska, Recognition Picketing Under the NLRA	480
	Hod Carriers Local 840 (Blinne Construction Co.)	487
	Post Problem Discussion	494
Section 3 S	ECONDARY BOYCOTTS UNDER SECTION 8(b)(4)	
	Problem #2: Secondary Boycotting Bradgelina	
	NLRB v. Denver Building & Construction Trades Council	
	Sailors Union of the Pacific (Moore Dry Dock Co.)	
	Douds v. Metropolitan Federation of Architects	503

TABLE (OF CONTENTS	
	Local 761, International Union of Electrical, Radio and Machine	
	Workers v. NLRB	506
	Post Problem Discussion	510
Section 4 Co	ONSUMER APPEALS AND CORPORATE CAMPAIGNS	512
	Problem #3: "Ocean Gasoline Made by Scabs"	513
	NLRB v. Fruit & Vegetable Packers & Warehouseman, Local 760 (Tree	!
	Fruits)	514
	NLRB v. Retail Store Employees Union Local No. 1001 (Safeco Title	
	<i>Insurance Co.</i>)	517
	Edward J. DeBartolo Corp. v. Florida Gulf Coast Building &	
	Construction Trades Council	522
	Post Problem Discussion	525
Chapter 11	LABOR LAW PREEMPTION DOCTRINES	529
Section 1 M	IANDATORY PREEMPTION: GARMON PREEMPTION	531
	Problem #1: Worker Freedom Laws and Captive Audience Meetings,	
	Take 1	531
	San Diego Building Trades Council v. Garmon	532
	Paul M. Secunda, Toward the Viability of State-Based Legislation to	
	$Address\ Workplace\ Captive\ Audience\ Meetings\ in\ the\ United\ States\ \ .\ .$	536
	Post Problem Discussion	536
Section 2 PI	ERMISSIVE PREEMPTION: MACHINISTS PREEMPTION	538
	Problem #2: Worker Freedom Laws and Captive Audience Meetings,	
	Take 2	538
	Lodge 76, International Association of Machinists v. Wisconsin	
	Employment Relations Commission	539
	Chamber of Commerce of the United States v. Brown	543
	Brief of Law Professors as Amicus Curiae in Support of Defendants'	
	Opposition to Motion For Summary Judgment, Associated Oregon	
	Industries v. Avakian	548
	Post Problem Discussion	554
Section 3 SI	ECTION 301 PREEMPTION	555
Chapter 12	WORKER RIGHTS IN A UNION	557
Section 1 Tl	HE DUTY OF FAIR REPRESENTATION	557
	Problem #1: The Tale of the Deceitful Motel Clerk	559
	Vaca v. Sipes	560
	Air Line Pilots Association International v. O'Neill	565
	Post Problem Discussion	571
	NION SECURITY CLAUSES AND STATE RIGHT-TO-WORK	572

<i>TABLE</i>	OF CONTENTS	
Section 3	Problem #2: Safeguarding the Rights of a Dissenting Actress	575 579 ee 589 598 601
	Problem #3: I Don't Walk the Line	601
	NLRB v. Allis-Chalmers Manufacturing Co	602
	Scofield v. NLRB	609
	Roger Hartley, National Labor Relations Board Control of Union Discipline and the Myth of Nonintervention	613
	Post Problem Discussion	623
	1 05t 1 100tem Discussion	023
Chapter 1	ADVANCED ISSUES IN LABOR LAW	627
Section 1	THE GRIEVANCE AND ARBITRATION PROCESS	627
	Problem #1: Layoffs, Up on the Roof	628
A.	Why Have a Grievance and Arbitration Process?	629
	Arbitration	629
	Post Problem Discussion	
В.	The Arbitration-Court Relationship	634
	Labor Organizations	
	United Steelworkers of America v. Warrior & Gulf Navigation Co	
_	Post Problem Discussion	
C.	The Arbitration-NLRB Relationship	639
	at the NLRB	639
	Management Casehandling Regarding Application of Spielberg/Olin	642
	Standards Memorandum OM 10-13(CH)	643 644
Section 2	SUCCESSORSHIP	645
Section 2	Problem #2: Apples and Oranges	
	Keith N. Hylton & Maria O'Brien Hylton, Rent Appropriation and the	043
	Labor Law Doctrine of Successorship	646
	Post Problem Discussion	651
Section 3	MID-TERM BARGAINING AND CONTRACT EXPIRATION	652
	Problem #3: Fighting Against Extra Pay	652

TABLE OF CONTENTS	
Milwaukee Spring Division (Milwaukee Spring II)	653
Post Problem Discussion	656
Section 4 ANTITRUST	658
Problem #4: Kickball Lockout	658
Brown v. Pro Football, Inc	659
Post Problem Discussion	666
Appendix	669
Table of Cases	ГС-1
Index	I-1