

Applied Critical Thinking & Legal Analysis

*Performance Optimization for Law
Students and Professionals*

Applied Critical Thinking & Legal Analysis

*Performance Optimization for Law
Students and Professionals*

Brett A. Brosseit
Elizabeth M. Mortenson
Sarah D. Murphy



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2017

Brett Brosseit, Elizabeth Mortenson, and Sarah Murphy
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Brosseit, Brett, author. | Mortenson, Elizabeth, author. | Murphy, Sarah, (Law teacher) author.

Title: Applied critical thinking and legal analysis / Brett Brosseit, Elizabeth Mortenson, and Sarah Murphy.

Description: Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, [2017] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016058571 | ISBN 9781531002558 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Law students--United States--Handbooks, manuals, etc. | Law--United States--Methodology. | Legal research--United States | Critical thinking--Study and teaching.

Classification: LCC KF283 .B76 2017 | DDC 340.072/73--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016058571>

e-ISBN 978-1-53100-256-5

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS, LLC

700 Kent Street

Durham, North Carolina 27701

Telephone (919) 489-7486

Fax (919) 493-5668

www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Dedications

*To my father, Stuart Brosseit, who dedicated his career to helping others
achieve their potential. And to Emily and Lila.*

Brett A. Brosseit

To my parents. And for those who pursue excellence.

Elizabeth M. Mortenson

To my family. To my students.

Sarah D. Murphy

Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction to ACTLA	3
The Importance of Critical Thinking, Metacognition, Self-Assessment, and Self-Regulation	4
The Courage to Succeed	12
All Thinking Is Not Created Equal	13
How Can ACTLA Help Me Become a More Powerful Thinker?	15
Learning in the ACTLA Environment	16
The Learning Skills Pyramid: An Effective Framework for Legal Learning and Problem-Solving	17
Practice and Transference Are Vital!	21
Introductory Tools and Strategies	21
Introductory Exercises	22
LEVEL I: ACHIEVE CLARITY	25
Chapter 1 · Level I, Step 1	27
Level I, Step 1 Introduction	28
About ACTLA Readings	29
Active Reading: An Essential Legal Skill	29
Active Reading in a Legal Context	32
Reading for Deep Conceptual Understanding	36
Developing and Utilizing a Reading Framework	37
Identifying the Broad and Narrow Issues in Legal Cases	39
Utilizing Effective Reading Frameworks for Non-Case Based Material	45
Level I, Step 1 Tools and Strategies	48
Level I, Step 1 Learning Exercises	48

Chapter 2 · Level I, Step 2	59
Level I, Step 2 Introduction	60
Assimilating and Conceptualizing: An Inductive Approach	60
Developing and Testing Rule Statements	61
General and Interpretive/Definitional Rules	61
The ABCs of Rule Making	63
Identifying Key Concepts in Rule Statements	67
Framing Legal Doctrine	69
Level I, Step 2 Tools and Strategies	76
Level I, Step 2 Learning Exercises	77
Chapter 3 · Level I, Step 3	79
Level I, Step 3 Introduction	80
Conducting Legal Analysis: The Power of the Learning Skills Pyramid	81
The Foundation of Legal Analysis	85
The Importance of Careful Explanation	87
Systematically Analyzing Key Concepts in Rule Statements	92
The Types of Legal Analysis Tests	94
IRAC: An Effective Organizational Structure for Legal Analysis	96
Mini-IRAC: An Effective Organizational Structure for Analyzing Element-Based Rules	101
To Argue or Not to Argue, That Is the Question	104
The Principle of Thirds	113
Expert Reading Strategy for Law School Exams	114
Pulling Back the Curtain: How Law School Exams Are Scored	116
How to Prepare for Law School Exams	117
Practice Makes Progress	121
Level I, Step 3 Tools and Strategies	122
Level I, Step 3 Learning Exercises	123
LEVEL II: SHARPEN JUDGMENT	125
Chapter 4 · Level II, Step 1	127
Level II, Step 1 Introduction	128
How Attorneys Formulate and Use Implied Rules	130
The Legal Learning and Problem-Solving Process	132
Inductive Reasoning	133
Analogical Reasoning	135

Deductive Reasoning	139
Inferences	141
Evaluation	145
Interpretation	147
Level II, Step 1 Tools and Strategies	150
Level II, Step 1 Learning Exercises	152
Chapter 5 · Level II, Step 2	157
Level II, Step 2 Introduction	158
Strategies for Implied Rulemaking	158
Testing Implied Rules	161
Level II, Step 2 Tools and Strategies	165
Level II, Step 2 Learning Exercises	166
Chapter 6 · Level II, Step 3	169
Level II, Step 3 Introduction	170
Challenging and Defending Implied Rules	171
Structuring Analysis of Factor Based Rules	172
Level II, Step 3 Tools and Strategies	173
Level II, Step 3 Learning Exercises	175
LEVEL III: EXERCISE CREATIVITY	177
Chapter 7 · Level III, Step 1	179
Level III, Step 1 Introduction	180
Concurring Arguments: I Agree, But for Different Reasons	181
Dissenting Arguments: I Disagree, But for Good Reasons	184
Public Policy: Arguing for a Purpose	187
Level III, Step 1 Tools and Strategies	188
Level III, Step 1 Learning Exercises	190
Chapter 8 · Level III, Step 2	193
Level III, Step 2 Introduction	194
Synthesized Rules: Out of Many Come One	194
Crafting Synthesized Rules	200
Level III, Step 2 Tools and Strategies	209
Level III, Step 2 Learning Exercises	211

Chapter 9 · Level III, Step 3	213
Level III, Step 3 Introduction	214
You Know the Drill!	214
Lifelong Learning: Your Ultimate Goal	218
You Don't Need Me Anymore	219
Level III, Step 3 Tools and Strategies	220
Level III, Step 3 Learning Exercises	222
Appendix A · The Legal Learning and Problem-Solving Process	223
Appendix B · The Learning Skills Pyramid	225
Appendix C · Applied Critical Thinking and Legal Analysis	
Personal Action Plan	227
Index	231

Acknowledgments

First and foremost, we are grateful to our prior, current, and future students for their courage, humility, and dedication to excellence. The path to strong critical thinking is not for the faint of heart, and we applaud all who embrace the challenge. We owe a debt of gratitude to Ted Afield for his support in the creation of *Applied Critical Thinking and Legal Analysis*, and for his thoughtful input and guidance along the way. We thank Claire O’Keefe for her contributions while serving as Professor of Advanced Critical Thinking. We also thank Professor Jamie Sammon for lending her exceptional skill and talent to *ACTLA*. We are indebted to Carol McGeehan and Carolina Academic Press for their expertise, support, and vision. We would also like to thank our teachers, colleagues, and friends who have encouraged and supported us in our research, innovation, and commitment to the advancement of learning and opportunity for all.

