AVIATION LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS

Robert M. Jarvis Professor of Law Nova Southeastern University

James T. Crouse Senior Lecturing Fellow Duke University

James R. Fox Professor of Law Pennsylvania State University

Gregory S. Walden Adjunct Professor of Law George Mason University To Walter E. Rutherford, Esq., who gave me my first job in the aviation industry --R.M.J.

To Edna, with all my love --J.T.C.

To my son, Henry Maxwell Fox --J.R.F.

To my wife Glenda, for her love, patience, and understanding --G.S.W.

Contents

Table of Cases

Preface

Acknowledgments

About the Authors

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

- A. Overview
- B. The Challenge of Flight

Federal Aviation Administration, Pilot's Handbook of Aeronautical Knowledge

Wikipedia, Aviation History

Martin Fackler & Don Phillips, Japan Has Designs on a New Concorde

House Resolution 500

Notes

Problem 1

- C. Sources of Aviation Law
 - 1. Legislation
 - E. Rebecca Kreis, A Comparative Analysis the Aviation Network Within the European Community and the Ad-Hoc Network Between the United States and Central America

Richard H. Jack, *Ultralight Aircraft: A Need for Better Regulation Than* 14 C.F.R. § 103

Paul Stephen Dempsey, Transportation: A Legal History

Notes

Problem 2

2. Case Law

Guille v. Swan

Crosby v. Cox Aircraft Company of Washington

Virgilio ex rel. Virgilio v. City of New York

Notes

Problem 3

3. Statecraft

Carl Wilkinson, What Happened Next?

Alejandre v. Republic of Cuba

Solicitation, Offer and Award

Blocking Property of Certain Persons and Prohibiting the Export of Certain Goods to Syria

Leslie Miller, Civilian-Jet Antimissle System Starts to Take Shape

Craig Whitlock, Europeans Probe Secret CIA Flights

Notes

Problem 4

D. Professional Responsibility

Wendell K. Smith, The General Aviation Case

Matter of Anis

Dempsey v. Associated Aviation Underwriters

Krieger v. Adler, Kaplan & Begy

In the Matter of Eddleman

Notes

Problem 5

CHAPTER 2. AIRCRAFT

A. Overview

B. Documentation

Jeffrey S. Wieand, Jet Way: How to Buy and Keep That Corporate Plane

Ickes v. Federal Aviation Administration

Air One Helicopters, Inc. v. Federal Aviation Administration

Lewistown Propane Company v. Ford

Creston Aviation, Inc. v. Textron Financial Corporation

Koppie v. United States

Notes

Problem 6

C. Taxes

Wardair Canada, Inc. v. Florida Department of Revenue

Citgo Petroleum Corporation v. United States

American Airlines, Inc. v. Johnson

Executive Aircraft Consulting, Inc. v. City of Newton

Notes

Problem 7

D. Liability

Alaskan Oil, Inc. v. Central Flying Service, Inc.

Turbines, Inc. v. Dardis

Prompt Air, Inc. v. Firewall Forward, Inc.

Notes

Problem 8

E. Defenses

Cleveland v. Piper Aircraft Corporation

Godwin Aircraft, Inc. v. Houston

Burroughs v. Precision Airmotive Corp.

Gray v. Lockheed Aeronautical Systems Company

Bahsoon v. Pezetel, Ltd.

Notes

Problem 9

F. Venue and Choice of Law

Lacey v. Cessna Aircraft Company

In re Air Crash Disaster at Sioux City, Iowa, on July 19, 1989

Notes

Problem 10

CHAPTER 3. AIRMEN

A. Overview

B. Pilots

Abdullah v. American Airlines, Inc.

Lindsay v. National Transportation Safety Board

Del Balzo v. Collier

United States Aviation Underwriters, Inc. v. National Insurance Underwriters

Jetcraft Corporation v. FlightSafety International, Inc.

Coleman v. Windham Aviation Inc.

Goodlett v. Kalishek

Notes

Problem 11

C. Mechanics

Borregard v. National Transportation Safety Board

Fant v. Champion Aviation, Inc.

Haimberg v. R & M Aviation, Inc.

Lock v. Packard Flying Service, Inc.

Jarmuth v. Aldridge

Notes

Problem 12

D. Flight Attendants

Frank v. United Airlines. Inc.

Gordon v. United Airlines, Inc.

Rose v. Midwest Express Airlines, Inc.

Ferris v. Delta Air Lines, Inc.

Straka v. Francis

Duncan v. Northwest Airlines, Inc.

Notes

Problem 13

E. Collective Bargaining

Thomas E. Reinert, Jr., Airline Labor Disruptions: Is the RLA Still Adequate?

Kaufman v. Allied Pilots Association

Hawaiian Airlines, Inc. v. Norris

Airline Pilots Association, International, AFL-CIO v. TACA International Airlines, S.A.

Ramey v. District 141, International Association of Machinists and Aerospace Workers

Notes

Problem 14

CHAPTER 4. PASSENGERS

- A. Overview
- B. Domestic Travel

Spirit Airlines, Inc. v. Northwest Airlines, Inc.

In re Northwest Airlines Corp. Antitrust Litigation

In re American Airlines, Inc. Privacy Litigation

Stone v. Continental Airlines

Rubin v. United Air Lines, Inc.

Stagl v. Delta Air Lines, Inc.

Deterra v. America West Airlines, Inc.

J.C. Penney Life Insurance Company v. Pilosi

Notes

Problem 15

C. International Travel

Robertson v. American Airlines, Inc.

Schopenhauer v. Compagnie Nationale Air France

Paradis v. Ghana Airways Limited

Olympic Airways v. Husain

Ehrlich v. American Airlines. Inc.

In re Air Crash Disaster Near Peggy's Cove, Nova Scotia on September 2, 1998

In re Air Crash at Taipei, Taiwan, on October 31, 2000

Stethem v. Islamic Republic of Iran

Notes

Problem 16

CHAPTER 5. CARGO

- A. Overview
- B. Suits Against Carriers
 - 1. Fair Opportunity

Welliver v. Federal Express

Dover Farms, Inc. v. American Air Lines, Inc.

Kesel v. United Parcel Service, Inc.

Notes

Problem 17

2. Notice

Dalton v. Delta Airlines, Inc.

Stud v. Trans International Airlines

G. D. Searle & Co. v. Federal Express Corporation

Notes

Problem 18

3. Damages

Sotheby's v. Federal Express Corporation

Caporicci Footwear, Ltd. v. Federal Express Corporation

Hampton v. Federal Express Corporation

Notes

Problem 19

C. Suits Against Third Parties

Federal Express Corporation v. United States Postal Service

Royal Insurance v. Amerford Air Cargo

HIH Marine Insurance Services, Inc. v. Gateway Freight Services

Continental Time Corp. v. Merchants Bank of New York

John and Jane Roes, 1-100 v. FHP, Inc.

Notes

Problem 20

CHAPTER 6. AIRPORTS

A. Overview

B. Construction

Griggs v. County of Allegheny

Northwest Airlines, Inc. v. Federal Aviation Administration

Citizens Against Burlington, Inc. v. Busey

Pinczkowski v. Milwaukee County

Notes

Problem 21

C. Use

City of Burbank v. Lockheed Air Terminal Inc.

City of Naples Airport Authority v. Federal Aviation Administration

Western Air Lines, Inc. v. Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

City of Los Angeles v. United States Department of Transportation

Park Shuttle N Fly, Inc. v. Norfolk Airport Authority

Notes

Problem 22

D. Security

International Society for Krishna Consciousness, Inc. v. Lee

United States v. Marquez

People v. Barron

Notes

Problem 23

E. Air Traffic Control

Yap v. Slater

Abrisch v. United States

Lakomy v. United States

Notes

Problem 24

F. Concessionaires

Jerrico, Inc. v. Jerry's, Inc.

Haskins v. Trans World Airlines, Inc.

Metropolitan Dade County v. CBM Industries of Minnesota, Inc.

Notes

Problem 25

APPENDICES

- 1. 1919 Paris Convention (International Air Carriage Rules)
- 2. 1929 Warsaw Convention (Replacing 1919 Paris Convention)
- 3. 1944 Chicago Convention (ICAO Constitution)
- 4. 1944 Air Services Transit Agreement (Two Air Freedoms)
- 5. 1944 International Air Transport Agreement (Five Air Freedoms)

- 6. 1948 Geneva Convention (Recognition of Rights in Aircraft)
- 7. 1952 Rome Convention
 (Damage to Third Parties on the Ground)
- 8. 1955 Hague Protocol (Amending 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 9. 1961 Guadalajara Convention
 (Amending 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 10. 1963 Tokyo Convention (Offenses While Onboard Aircraft)
- 11. 1966 Montreal Intercarrier Agreement (Supplementing 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 12. 1970 Hague Convention (Unlawful Seizure of Aircraft)
- 13. 1971 Guatemala City Protocol (Amending 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 14. 1971 Montreal Convention
 (Unlawful Acts Against Civil Aviation Safety)
- 15. 1975 Montreal Protocol No. 4 (Amending 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 16. 1977 U.S.-U.K. Air Services Agreement ("Bermuda II")
- 17. 1978 Montreal Protocol (Amending 1952 Rome Convention)
- 18. 1980 Multimodal Convention (Combined Transportation)
- 19. 1984 Montreal Protocol (Amending 1944 Chicago Convention)
- 1988 Montreal Protocol (Amending 1971 Montreal Convention)

- 21. 1991 Montreal Convention (Marking of Plastic Explosives)
- 1994 Chicago Agreement
 (Banning Smoking on International Flights)
- 23. 1995 IATA Intercarrier Agreement ("IIA") (Supplementing 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 24. 1996 IATA Agreement on Implementing IIA ("MIA") (Supplementing 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 25. 1996 ATA Provisions on Implementing IIA ("IPA") (Supplementing 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 26. 1999 Montreal Convention
 (Replacing 1929 Warsaw Convention)
- 27. 2001 MALIAT Agreement (Multilateral Air Transport Agreement)
- 28. 2001 Cape Town Convention
 (International Interests in Mobile Equipment)
- 29. 2001 Cape Town Aircraft Equipment Protocol (Supplementing 2001 Cape Town Convention)
- 30. 2004 United States Model Open Skies Agreement

INDEX

Table of Cases

[To be added later]

Preface

Because of its perceived specialized nature and a lack of demand from both sides of the lectern, aviation law has tended to rank low in the curriculum priorities of most law schools. The absence of a suitable casebook--indeed, of any casebook until just recently--has only added to the challenges faced by those who have sought to take or teach the course. Accordingly, it is our hope that this text--which examines contemporary issues through recent cases, detailed notes, challenging problems, and frequent references to popular culture--will spur more professors and students to embrace the subject.

In addition to wanting a fun, interesting, and up-to-date book, we had a second goal in mind when we undertook this project. Unlike other casebook authors, who have approached the subject as both esoteric and self-contained, we see aviation law as a microcosm of the law school experience, touching as it does on (among others) administrative law, antitrust, bankruptcy, conflicts, constitutional law, contracts, environmental law, international law, labor law, local government law, professional responsibility, property, sales, taxation, and torts. Accordingly, we have eschewed the narrow and the technical and instead focused on broad themes and questions. In this way, we hope to make clear just how much everyday life is touched by aviation and dispel the myth that an aviation law course is useful only for those few students who either hold a pilot's license or already have decided to enter the field upon graduation.

Several procedural matters should be noted. First, the research for this book closed in October 2005 (although a few last-minute additions did find their way into the text). Second, we have been liberal in our editing and normally have not indicated where language has been deleted, repositioned, or, in the event of errors in the original, corrected. Third, the principal air law treaties referred to in the readings can be found in the book's appendices. Lastly, for those who want to become better acquainted with the industry, Chapter 1 contains numerous suggestions for doing so.

In closing, we hope you will enjoy using this book as much as we have enjoyed writing it, and to that end we invite your comments and suggestions for future editions. All such thoughts should be sent to Professor Robert M. Jarvis, Nova Southeastern University Law Center, 3305 College Avenue, Fort Lauderdale, FL 33314-7721, telephone (954) 262-6172, telefax (954) 262-3835, e-mail jarvisb@nsu.law.nova.edu.

Acknowledgments

In preparing this work, we have received help from countless individuals and institutions as well as from the Publisher's staff. We are particularly grateful, however, to Linda Heller, Zane J. Kelleher, and Michael E. Meyer.

We also wish to express our appreciation to the following authors and their publishers for permission to reprint their works:

Paul Stephen Dempsey, *Transportation: A Legal History*, 30 Transportation Law Journal 235 (2003)

Martin Fackler & Don Phillips, *Japan Has Designs on a New Concorde*, N.Y. Times, Oct. 11, 2005, at C1

Federal Aviation Administration, *Pilot's Handbook of Aeronautical Knowledge* (2003)

Richard H. Jack, *Ultralight Aircraft: A Need for Better Regulation Than 14 C.F.R. § 103*, 51 Journal of Air Law and Commerce 415 (1986)

E. Rebecca Kreis, A Comparative Analysis the Aviation Network Within the European Community and the Ad-Hoc Network Between the United States and Central America, 24 Transportation Law Journal 303 (1997)

Leslie Miller, *Civilian-Jet Antimissle System Starts to Take Shape, Firms Say*, Phil. Inquirer, Nov. 11, 2005, at A12 (from the Associated Press wire service)

Thomas E. Reinert, Jr., Airline Labor Disruptions: Is the RLA Still Adequate?, 15 Air & Space Lawyer 4 (Winter 2001)

Wendell K. Smith, *The General Aviation Case*, 12 Utah Bar Journal 17 (Feb. 1999)

Jim Toomey, Sherman's Lagoon (2005) (distributed by King Features Syndicate)

Matthew L. Wald, *Safety Board Blames Pilot Error in Crash of Kennedy Plane*, N.Y. Times, July 7, 2000, at B5

Craig Whitlock, Europeans Probe Secret CIA Flights, Wash. Post, Nov. 17, 2005, at A22

Jeffrey S. Wieand, *Jet Way: How to Buy and Keep That Corporate Plane*, 6 Business Law Today 58 (Mar./Apr. 1997)

Wikipedia, Aviation History (2005)

Carl Wilkinson, What Happened Next?, London Observer, Oct. 27, 2002, at 102

About the Authors

Robert M. Jarvis is a professor of law at the Shepard Broad Law Center of Nova Southeastern University (www.nsulaw.nova.edu) in Fort Lauderdale, Florida. Prior to joining NSU, he practiced international transportation law with the New York City law firms of Haight, Gardner, Poor & Havens (now Holland & Knight LLP) and Baker & McKenzie LLP, where he represented Compañía Dominicana de Aviación, the national airline of the Dominican Republic. A past transportation editor of *Preview of United States Supreme Court Cases*, his interest in aviation comes from his father, one of the first American executives of El Al Israel Airlines.

James T. Crouse is a senior lecturing fellow at the Duke University School of Law in Durham, North Carolina, and the founder of Crouse Law Offices (www.crouselaw.com) in Raleigh, North Carolina. A four-time presenter at the Southern Methodist University Air Law Symposium, he has participated in numerous aviation crash cases, including Atlantic Southeast Airways Flight 7527, Comair Flight 3272, and USAir Flight 427. He also was lead liability counsel in the world's largest civilian helicopter disaster. A retired lieutenant colonel and army aviator, he has served as a maintenance, medical evacuation, and research and development test pilot.

James R. Fox is a professor of law and the past director of the law library at the Dickinson School of Law of The Pennsylvania State University (www.dsl.psu.edu) in Carlisle, Pennsylvania. In addition to co-authoring the multi-volume encyclopedia *The Regulation of International Commercial Aviation: The International Regulatory Structure*, contributing to the leading treatise *Aviation Accident Law*, and having his work published in the *Annals of Air and Space Law*, he has served as a visiting fellow at the Institute of Air and Space Law at McGill University and taught European Aviation Law at the University of Vienna.

Gregory S. Walden is an adjunct professor of law at the George Mason University School of Law in Arlington, Virginia, and of counsel to the Washington, D.C. law firm of Patton Boggs LLP (www.pattonboggs.com), where he represents air carriers, airports, and fixed-base operators. Prior to entering private practice, he served as Chief Counsel to the Federal Aviation Administration, Associate White House Counsel for President George H.W. Bush, and transition ethics counsel for President-Elect George W. Bush. Earlier in his career, he clerked for Judge Robert H. Bork of the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia.

To invent an airplane is nothing. To build one is something. But to fly is everything.

> --Otto Lilienthal (1848-1896), German aviation pioneer

[As] the patent in suit is a valid one, the patentees may fairly be considered pioneers in the practical art of flying with heavier-than-air machines.

> --Wright Co. v. Herring-Curtiss Co., 211 F. 654, 655 (2d Cir. 1914) (upholding the Wright Brothers' patent)

Come fly with me! Let's fly, let's fly away!

--Frank Sinatra (1957)

Gimme a ticket for an aeroplane, Ain't got time to take a fast train.

-- Joe Cocker (1970)

Let's roll!

--Final words of Todd Beamer before he and the other passengers on United Airlines Flight 93 stormed the cockpit on 9/11

It is a new world for this industry.

--Jane F. Garvey, FAA Administrator, in a speech to the National Press Club shortly after 9/11