The Gene and the Genie
Carolina Academic Press
Medical Anthropology Series

Pamela J. Stewart and Andrew Strathern
Series Editors

Curing and Healing
Medical Anthropology in Global Perspective
Andrew Strathern and Pamela Stewart

Physicians at Work, Patients in Pain, 2nd Edition
Biomedical Practice and Patient Response in Mexico
Kaja Finkler

Healing the Modern in a Central Javanese City
Steve Ferzacca

Elusive Fragments
Making Power, Propriety and Health in Samoa
Douglass D. Drozdow-St. Christian

Endangered Species
Health, Illness, and Death Among Madagascar’s People of the Forest
Janice Harper

The Practice of Concern
Ritual, Well-Being, and Aging in Rural Japan
John W. Traphagan

The Gene and the Genie
Tradition, Medicalization and Genetic Counseling in a Bedouin Community in Israel
Aviad E. Raz

Social Discord and Bodily Disorders
Healing Among the Yupno of Papua New Guinea
Verena Keck

❦
The Gene and the Genie

Tradition, Medicalization and Genetic Counseling in a Bedouin Community in Israel

Aviad E. Raz
Ben-Gurion University of the Negev

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina
## Contents

List of Tables and Figures ix
Medical Anthropology Series Editors’ Preface xi
Acknowledgments xiii
Introduction xv
  The Book’s Composition xx

### Chapter 1  The Rationale, Role and Dilemmas of Genetic Counseling 3
- Perspectives on Nondirectiveness versus Eugenics 4
- Genetic Counseling and Medicalization 7
- Geneticization and Public Policy 8
- Genetic Counseling in the Community 10
  - Models of Community-Based Programs for Genetic Counseling 10
  - Genetic Counseling for Inherited Hearing Loss and Thalassemia: Two Concepts of “Genetic Community” 12
  - Consanguinity and Genetic Counseling 14

### Chapter 2  The Setting 27
- The Bedouin As a Target Community for Genetic Counseling 28
- The Background of the Genetics Program 31
- The Social Construction of Congenital Hearing Loss among the Bedouin 34
The Design of the Program for Carrier Matching  37
Methodological Considerations  38
Researching and Intervening: Ethnographic Reflection  42

Chapter 3   Biomedical Culture and Ethical Dilemmas:
The Professionals’ Point-of-View  51
The Dilemma of Disclosure  51
The Dilemma of Nondirectiveness and Autonomy  53
The Dilemma of the Disease’s Mildness  55
Bioethical Criteria for Genetic Screening  59
The Point-of-View of Bedouin Health Professionals  62

Chapter 4   Utilization and Attitudes: The Bedouin Point-of-View  75
Basic Information Regarding Consanguinity Levels, Education, Religiosity and Prevalence of Genetic Testing  76
The Instruction Session  79
The Counseling Session  86
The Bedouin Agenda  88
Attitudes of Bedouin Women  91
  Etiology and Heredity  92
  Carrier Matching  94
  Abortion  96

Chapter 5   Cross-Cultural Genetics Education:
Between Acculturation and Ambivalence  99
Knowledge of Basic Genetic Information  100
Attitudes towards Genetic Counseling  101
Correlation between Knowledge and Attitudes  103
Susceptibility, Knowledge and Attitudes  103

Chapter 6   Questions of Reception  107
“Áysha”: Staging the Drama of Carrier Matching  107
The Script and Its Versions  109
Audience Reception  114
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teachers’ and Pupils’ Views on the Authenticity and Efficiency of the Film</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of Consanguinity</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genetic Tests</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abortion</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Match or Not To Match?</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nondirectiveness and Its Lay Interpretations</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire Development</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Use of Optimistic vs. Pessimistic Questionnaire Versions</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Recruitment and Questionnaire Administration</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Bedouin As an Interpretive Community</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion: Beyond a Western Bioethics?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Future of Community Genetics</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cousin Marriage and Carrier Matching</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Jewish-Bedouin Situation</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking of Agendas</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communitarian and Liberal Perspectives on Community Genetics</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix: Questionnaire Assessing the Interpretation of Counseling</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glossary</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References Cited</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables and Figures

Tables

Table 1. Educational Levels in the Targeted Population 77
Table 2. Prevalence and Degree of Consanguinity in the Study Group 78
Table 3. Distribution of Age in Tested Individuals 78
Table 4. Frequency of Correct Results for Teachers and Pupils 101
Table 5. Hypothetical Decisions of Teachers and Schoolchildren about Personal Use of Premarital Genetic Testing 102
Table 6. General Attitudes towards Genetic Testing 102
Table 7. Socio-Demographic Characteristics of the Study Sample 124
Table 8. Selections of Jewish and Bedouin Students in the “Pessimistic” Version 127
Table 9. Selections of Jewish and Bedouin Students in the “Optimistic” Version 129
Table 10. Selections of Jewish and Bedouin Students Regarding the Goal of Counseling 130

Figures

Figure 1. Diagram of Mendelian Heredity of Recessive Traits 81
Figure 2. Diagram of a “Typical Bedouin Pedigree,” Illustrating the Linkage between Consanguinity and Recessive Diseases 82
Figure 3. Diagram of First-Cousin Consanguinity with an Affected Child 83
Figure 4. Depiction of Mutation in Flip-Chart for Instruction 84
Figure 5. Interpretation of Nondirectiveness Measured by Percent of Selections in Each Group, Version 1 (“Pessimistic”) 125
Figure 6. Interpretation of Nondirectiveness Measured by Percent of Selections in Each Group, Version 2 (“Optimistic”) 125
In Aviad Raz’s book we see an issue of global concern, i.e., genetic counseling, being analyzed in relation to religion, ethics, morality, and medical practice. The practices of genetic counseling, in terms of biomedicine, are themselves continuously changing as new developments in human genetics (e.g., new technologies and further research in mapping the human genome) occur. Numbers of different genetic screening tests are available to patients, including prenatal tests that screen for disorders in the fetus, carrier testing to check for the possibility of an individual carrying a particular genetic marker, and susceptibility tests to determine if a person is at higher risk of developing a particular disease. The philosophy of genetic counseling is impacted by a myriad of complex ethical, social, legal, religious, and educational issues. The specific location of the project presented in this book is a Bedouin Community in Israel but the implications and considerations are ones that apply to many other areas, e.g., the USA, Canada, Europe, the Pacific, etc.

Genetic counseling is a growing field in which health care professionals, working in conjunction with a team of health care workers, offer information and provide support to families who have members with birth defects or genetic disorders, or to individuals who are affected with a genetic condition, or to families in high risk categories for genetically transmitted health conditions. The type of advice offered to patients varies but may include: ways to comprehend medical diagnosis; information on the mechanisms by which heredity contributes to a disorder and the risk of a recurrence in particular relatives; explanations of alternatives available to patients for dealing with risk of recurrence; suggestions of particular courses of action which take into consideration the moral and religious feelings of the patients and their family; and means by which the affected person(s) can make life adjustments to the disorder or the possible risk of recurrence of a disorder.
One of the dilemmas involved in genetic testing and counseling is the question of how genetic information alters an individual’s sense of “self” in terms of their relationship to others and their religious beliefs about wellness and morality. Other concerns are how genetic information may be used to a patient’s disadvantage through genetic discrimination in regard to health insurance or employment, eligibility to marry and procreate, or loss of medical history privacy in general.

Aviad Raz’s ethnographic explorations of the considerations and concerns over genetic testing and counseling in his research community are deftly presented. This work will be of interest to the general reader, those interested in health care practices, and also as a text to supplement courses on bioethics, applied medical anthropology, critical medical anthropology, and genetic ethics.

Of particular interest in this study is Raz’s discussion of the role played by Bedouin marriage practices, specifically the norm of patrilateral cousin marriage, along with a religiously based ban on abortion. He portrays the processes whereby both counselors and marriage partners negotiate and exercise agency over their problems in relation to these roles. Similar problems are faced by parents in places such as Saudi Arabia where spinal muscular atrophy can result from consanguineous marriage patterns. “Consanguinity” in Raz’s usage, usually refers to these patterns.

We are very pleased to include Aviad Raz’s book in the Ethnographic Studies in Medical Anthropology Series. The other titles in this Series include:

“Curing and Healing: Medical Anthropology in Global Perspective”, 1999 (by Andrew Strathern and Pamela J. Stewart).
“Healing the Modern in a Central Javanese City”, 2001 (by Steve Ferzacca)

May 2003
Department of Anthropology
University of Pittsburgh
Pittsburgh, PA 15260
USA
Acknowledgments

The two worlds studied in this book comprise people whose help and cooperation have kept this research going. I am grateful to the many members of the Bedouin community studied here, who devoted precious time to my inquiries and were kind enough to let me into their homes and their lives. This study would not have been possible without their help and hospitality. I am particularly grateful to 'Abd al-Muaati al-Sâyyed and Dina Shahâda, whose contribution as community-outreach assistants was invaluable. I am equally indebted to the health professionals who introduced me to the genetics project and shared their thoughts and quandaries with me. I am indebted to Ha'lil al-Ba'dûr, Â'mâl abu-Sâ'ad, Hana Beit-Or, and all the genetic counselors at the Genetics Institute. I would like to acknowledge the cooperation of Rivka Carmi and Ilana Shoham-Vardi, who initiated and oversaw the project described here and who were responsible for the tremendous genetic and epidemiological work that preceded this project. This study could not have taken place without their collaboration, and it benefited from their wisdom and experience. Thanks to Joel Zlotogora for explaining his approach to community genetics and the uses of the “Family Tree” software program in data analysis.

I am grateful to Marcela Aţar, Maya Rodnâi, and Muhammad al-Dâda, my graduate students at the Dept. of Behavioral Sciences, Ben-Gurion University, for their help in data collection and analysis. Special thanks go to Marcela, whose research skills and insights helped to shape the ideas and analyses that appear here. This research contains data collected by Marcela as part of her PhD study, a study she is presently pursuing in order to further explore the issue of genetic counseling to the Bedouin.

Among my academic colleagues, I am particularly indebted to Gideon Kressel, who saw the potential in this study and sharpened my perception of the culture of cousin marriage. The International Workshop on Health and Illness in Middle-East Societies, organized in April–May 2002 by Âref Abu-Rabi’a in the Dept. of Middle-East Studies at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, provided a well-appreciated opportunity for sharing my ideas. I am also grateful to Ruth Chadwick for her useful comments on earlier versions.
My bioethical sensibilities were shaped in discussions held at the Advanced European Bioethics Course “Ethics and Genetics,” November 2000, at the University of Nijmegen, The Netherlands. I am particularly grateful, in this context, to Roberto Del’Orro, Nora Groce and Eric Juengst, who strengthened my conviction that bioethics should be studied in the community. Thanks are due, as always, to Norman Denzin for planting the seed of symbolic interactionism in me and for cultivating it through his continuing support. I am indebted to Pamela Stewart and Andrew Strathern, co-editors of this Medical Anthropology Series, for their close reading of the manuscript and incisive comments. This study was funded by grants from the Israel Foundation Trustees (project PS14/3) and the Israel Science Foundation (grant # 769/00-2) for which, needless to say, I am very grateful.

As always, I am deeply grateful to my wife, Ayala, for her continuing support, and to my sons, Orr, Yoav and Hillel, for the strength and happiness they give me.


A.E.R